Southwest Academy of Management 2022 Board

President          Ethan P. Waples, University of Houston-Downtown
President-Elect    Vacant
Program Chair      Carlos Baldo, Colorado Mesa University
Program Chair-Elect Kenneth M. Sweet, Texas A&M University-San Antonio
Secretary          Nancy Kucinski, Hardin-Simmons University
Treasurer          Robert H. Epstein, University of Central Oklahoma
Representatives-At-Large
Stephanie Black, Texas A&M University-San Antonio
Justin Wareham, Oklahoma City University
Student Representatives
Dan Chen (Ph.D. Student), University of Texas at Arlington
Kristen Faile (Ph.D. Student), University of Texas at San Antonio
Electronic Media Director
Lee Tyner, University of Central Oklahoma
Historian / Archivist Vacant
Immediate Past President
Veena Prabhu, California State University, Los Angeles

The 2022 SWAM Conference
Platinum Sponsor is

University of Houston-Downtown
Marilyn Davies College of Business

https://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/journal/omj
Recipient of the Outstanding Educator Award - SWAM
Dan Mertens, Jacksonville State University, Jacksonville, Alabama

Recipient of the Distinguished Paper Award - FBD
The hazards of unethical work experiences: The serial impact of moral injury on work-related stress, trauma-induced ill-being, and moral post-traumatic stress disorder
Robert Giacalone, John Carroll University
Sean Valentine, University of North Dakota

Recipient of the 2022 Best Reviewer Award - SWAM
Julie Seidel, Colorado Mesa University

2022 SWAM Track Chairs

HR / Careers / Diversity
Robert Lloyd, Fort Hays State University
Sal Villegas, Northern State University

Organizational Behavior / Leadership
Jestine Philip, University of New Haven

Organizational Theory / Strategic Management / International Management
Gustavo Barboza, Loyola University New Orleans

Entrepreneurship / Small Business / Family Business
Vallari Chandna, University of Wisconsin-Green Bay

Professional Development
Kenneth Sweet, Texas A&M University-San Antonio

Pedagogical Innovations / Pedagogical Research / Professional Development
Vance Lewis, University of Central Arkansas

Hospitality Management
Shiang-Lih Chen McCain, Colorado Mesa University

All full-paper submissions that were accepted and presented during the conference were invited to submit a six-page abridged version for publication in these proceedings. Some authors chose to forego submission to the proceedings, but are included in the program as their work was accepted and presented at the conference. SWAM compiles and publishes the work contained herein, but individual authors are responsible for the ethical conduct of research, for the content of their papers, for the claims made within each article, and for permission to reuse or reprint any copyrighted materials.
CONTENTS

A TWO-STAGE MODEL OF CEO HUBRIS AND ITS ORGANIZATIONAL CONSEQUENCES ...............................................................05

GENDER AND WORKPLACE EQUITY: PERCEPTIONS OF TREATMENT, FAIRNESS, AND JUSTICE ........................................................11

EVALUATING ANTECEDENTS TO WORK-LIFE BALANCE AND CREATIVE PROCESS ENGAGEMENT .....................................................17

SUCCESSFULLY MENTORING DAUGHTERS IN FAMILY FIRMS ..........................................................21

INTERPLAY OF KNOWLEDGE MANAGEMENT, OPERATIONAL AND DYNAMIC CAPABILITIES IN PROJECT PHASES ....................................27

DO LEADERS PLAY FAVORITES?: EVALUATING PERSONALITY SIMILARITIES, LMX, AND JOB PERFORMANCE ................................................31

AN INTEGRATIVE CONCEPTUALIZATION OF EMBODIED LEADERSHIP IN ORGANIZATIONS ...............................................................37

A STUDY ON THE INFLUENCE OF MANAGERS TRUST TO EMPLOYEE ALTRUISM’S IMPACT ON CSR PARTICIPATION AND OCBS .......................................................43

THE ROLE OF POSITIONAL AUTHORITY AND INFLUENCE IN SERVANT LEADERSHIP .................................................................49

THE HAZARDS OF UNETHICAL EXPERIENCES: THE SERIAL IMPACT OF MORAL INJURY ON WORK-RELATED STRESS, TRAUMA-INDUCED ILL-BEING, AND MORAL POST-TRAUMATIC STRESS DISORDER ...............................................53

BIG. BUT NOT EASY - DECISION-MAKING UNDER UNCERTAINTY: THE UNRECOGNIZED ROLE OF SOCIAL MOOD ..................................................57

POLITICAL IDEOLOGY EFFECT ON CORPORATE POLITICAL ACTIVITY .........................61

PERMISSION TO WORK: CASE OF ARAB WOMEN ........................................................................67

LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT IN THE AGE OF INFORMATION OVERLOAD .......................72

A SOCIAL MEDIA ENGAGEMENT FRAMEWORK FOR APPLICANT ATTRACTION TO ORGANIZATIONS ...........................................................................78

RATIONALIZING CORPORATE SOCALLY RESPONSIBLE BEHAVIOR: AN EMPIRICAL STUDY .................................................................84

RETHINKING HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT EDUCATION: THE PROMISE OF SOCIAL PSYCHOLOGY IN A POST-PANDEMIC WORLD ........85
EXAMINING EDUCATIONAL DELIVERY MODES, POLITICAL FACTORS, AND COVID-19 CASES ACROSS US PUBLIC EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS ............... 89

BLOCKCHAIN SOLUTIONS FOR SMALL BUSINESSES ................................................................. 94

THE U.S. MILITARY AND ORGANIZATION DEVELOPMENT: A STRATEGIC PERSPECTIVE .......................................................................................................................... 100

COLLABORATING FOR ORGANIZATIONAL INNOVATION: NETWORKING ACROSS THE CITY ................................................................................................................................. 106

THE GLASS CEILING: ALIVE AND THRIVING IN BUSINESS TODAY ....................................... 112

FORMANCE WORK PRACTICES, PERCEIVED ORGANIZATIONAL SUPPORT AND COMMITMENT: DOES GENERATION MATTER? ................................................................. 116

CHARISMATIC LEADERSHIP AND OCB AMONG DIFFERENT TYPES OF FOLLOWERSHIP STYLES ......................................................................................................................... 122

A TRANSACTION COST ECONOMIC FRAMEWORK FOR DEVELOPING THE ADOPTION CRITERIA OF OPEN-SOURCE SOFTWARE IN ORGANIZATIONS ............... 125

THE MEDIA CHOICE FOR ORGANIZATIONAL MEMORY IN DISPERSED ORGANIZATIONAL ARRANGEMENTS ......................................................................................... 128

EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING IS THE NEXT BIG THING IN MANAGEMENT EDUCATION ................................................................................................................................. 134

ETHICAL DECISION MAKING: A CULTURE INFLUENCED VIRTUE SPECIFIC MODEL FOR MULTINATIONAL CORPORATIONS ................................................................. 137

SMALL BUSINESS SURVIVAL IN A VUCA ENVIRONMENT ..................................................... 143
A TWO-STAGE MODEL OF CEO HUBRIS AND ITS ORGANIZATIONAL CONSEQUENCES

SPENCER J. FRASEUR
Sjf7889@mavs.uta.edu
University of Texas at Arlington

Abstract: We argue that in the initial hubris phase, hubristic CEOs receive considerable positive media attention and external recognition that enable the CEO to attain “celebrity” status. During this phase, the celebrity status of the CEO not only leads to higher stock prices but also to even higher levels of CEO hubris. In the subsequent nemesis phase, the CEO’s hubris leads to overconfidence, a belief in his infallibility, and riskier strategies such as M&As with higher premiums, entry into riskier markets, and excessive investments in new product developments of dubious value. These high-risk behaviors, in turn, lead to more oversight by the board of directors, reduced CEO discretion, and lower stock prices. Finally, this results in either CEO exit or a decline in CEO hubris.

INTRODUCTION

Although many studies have been conducted to show the nature of CEO hubris and how it plays an important role in various aspects of managing a firm, relatively few studies have shown the effects that CEO hubris indirectly has on organizational performance. While there are a multitude of ways to recognize or measure organizational performance, this article focuses on stock prices as the performance indicator of choice for its ability to assess future economic flows and provide a more fluid measure of a firm’s performance. For the sake of clarity in the remainder of this article, the term organizational performance is used synonymous with the stock performance of a firm.

The purpose of this study is to use current hubris literature in finance, economics, and management to systematically develop a two-stage model. In the first stage, CEO hubris increases because of the attention generated by their bold actions and favorable media coverage which in turn results in higher stock prices. We propose that the utilization of celebrity status generated by the media can positively affect stock prices irrespective of the financial performance of the firm. This happens because constant positive coverage by the press enhances the visibility of the firm, bestows it with legitimacy, and enhances investor expectations about higher levels of future firm performance. However, we show that this virtuous cycle does endure forever. In the second stage, overconfidence generated by overinflated hubris leads to risky decisions, poor financial outcomes, reduced managerial discretion and potentially reduced hubris or executive exit. Although prior research has attempted to frame a CEO’s tenure at a firm into distinct seasons characterized by different behaviors, we propose that for hubristic CEOs, there are clearly two stages, one of initial hubris followed by a period of nemesis. We identify these two stages and describe the dynamics of each stage and the process of transition from one stage to the next.

HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT

Stage 1: Hubris Phase
The Role of the Media in Creating CEO Celebrity

Journalists pursue CEOs because they realize the value in creating new celebrities and personalities. CEOs represent a prime opportunity for the creation of celebrity because of their identity attachment and similarities to other celebrities. They possess a great deal of power and wealth and are attached to a large and publicly well-known firm. CEOs that display idiosyncratic
personal behaviors, or are outspoken (Hayward et al., 2004), live an extraordinary lifestyle, or have an active social media presence make especially easy targets for journalists. Given the immense pressures placed on journalists to consistently provide engaging content during 24-hour news cycles and the desire to create celebrities to satiate our celebrity-obsessed culture, it is understandable that journalists have turned toward the powerful yet often anonymous CEOs of America’s largest firms in their quest to create celebrity (Porac et al., 2008).

The relationship between the media and CEOs is not only for the media’s benefit. CEOs and the media have a symbiotic relationship with each other, both benefitting from the exchange. CEOs often pursue features or write ups about themselves because of their high levels of hubris and desire to project their knowledge and power externally so that others will see. Hayward and Hambrick (1997) showed that a source of CEO hubris was the presence of recent media praise. Therefore, we propose that:

**Proposition 1a**: Innate or increased levels of hubris in CEOs will lead to increased media coverage.

**Proposition 1b**: Increased media and press publications will lead to increased levels of CEO hubris.

The creation of CEO celebrity leads many stakeholders who gather information on firms and investments based on knowledge generated from the media, to believe that the CEO has more power or influence over firm performance than they might actually have. Research has also shown that, “...the greater a CEO’s celebrity, the more likely a firm’s stakeholders are to (a) make similar attributions regarding the CEOs responsibility for past performance, and (b) positively evaluate in response to CEO actions” (Hayward et al., 2004; 645). Although there is a limited pool of research upon which to draw from regarding media and its effects on stock price, we propose in our second hypothesis:

**Proposition 2**: Media recognition and praise of a firm and its CEO will lead to increased stock price.

The Role of Awards on Hubris and CEO Stock Price

Along with media attention, awards and other acts of public recognition may also have a positive impact on CEO hubris. CEOs might seek out awards as external validation for their own personal achievement (personal awards), industry recognition for the firm that point to their ability to increase firm performance (industry awards), or prestigious honors for the company in recognition of achievements among all companies (company awards). This leads us to our next hypotheses involving CEO hubris.

**Proposition 3a**: Higher levels of CEO hubris will lead to increased seeking out of awards and other forms of public recognition.

**Proposition 3b**: Increased amounts of awards will lead to increased levels of CEO hubris.

The importance that awards of any capacity have on the stock price of a firm has yet to be fully explored in the literature. There are limited results for the effect of personal awards as printed in a publication, but no such studies on the effects of industry or company awards and their ability to move stock prices in the short or long term. In research conducted by Porac et al. (2008), a competition held by the publication Financial World Magazine called the CEO of the
year contest, was used to determine if public opinion on celebrity CEOs could sway stock prices. Financial World Magazine rated every CEO using a star-based system. Gold, silver, and bronze stars were awarded to CEOs based on surveys sent out to 1,000 CEOs and a large number of stock analysts (Porac et al., 2008). The results showed that CEOs who obtained medals and recognition in the publication saw their firm receive a stock price increase in the three days that followed the magazine’s release (Porac et al., 2008). While there is a general dearth of studies on the topic, we believe that the effect of media coverage and awards are similar in nature. Although more research is needed to understand the short- and long-term effects that different types of awards have on the stock price of a firm, it seems reasonable to hypothesize that:

**Proposition 4.** Industry, Company, and personal awards will lead to increased stock prices.

The Link Between Stock Price and CEO Hubris

There is a direct link between managerial hubris and firm success which can be discerned as stock price. Mahajan (1992) found that the main source of CEO hubris was a firm’s recent success. When stock prices rise for a firm, it signals to the CEO that their managerial methods have made a significant impact. CEOs who possess a high amount of hubris might believe that recent firm success was directly or indirectly caused by their managerial methods. Similar to how journalists often engage in attribution theory to distill organizational success into that of a single actor (the CEO)(Jones & Davis, 1965), CEO hubris distorts a manager’s perception of their firm’s success and creates a viewpoint that they are the single actor responsible. An increase in stock price can lead to an increase in hubris and substantial increases in pay. This leads to successful CEOs receiving between 30 and 50 percent greater compensation than other executives (Hayward & Hambrick, 1997). Therefore, increases in a firm’s stock price has a positive relationship to the increase of managerial hubris.

**Proposition 5.** Firm performance in the form of increased stock prices will lead to an increase in CEO hubris.

**Stage 2: The Nemesis Phase**

In this second stage of our two-stage dynamic model we explore what we describe as the nemesis phase aptly titled after the Greek goddess. Similarly, to how nemesis punishes those who exhibit overconfidence and high levels of hubris by striking them down, CEOs face punishment in a similar vein. Some circumstances of overconfidence lead to serious
consequences such as loss of CEO discretion or removal from position. This model (Figure 2) displays the negative effects and outcomes generated by an overflow of hubris leading to overconfidence, corporate risk taking, a decrease in stock price, hubris, and potential loss of discretion.

CEO Hubris, Overconfidence, and Corporate Risk Taking

When CEO hubris reaches high enough levels, overconfidence and subsequent risk taking are bound to occur. When CEOs begin to “believe their own press” they might think that they are unfailing and decide to extend the firm’s reach beyond its current strengths by pursuing risky initiatives that have a greater ability to harm the firm (Porac et al., 2008). This happens when CEOs use their discretion to create negative outcomes for the firm through corporate risk taking.

Corporate risk taking is defined as, “the analysis in selection of projects that have varying uncertainties associated with their expected outcomes” (Wright, Ferris, Sarin, & Awasthi, 1996: 442). Although risk taking behavior might have potential upsides for shareholders (large gains often require large risks), its rather extreme nature creates a culture of “big wins” and “big losses” which might have a detrimental effect on the CEO’s tenure and the firm’s performance in the long term (Sanders & Hambrick, 2007). Risk taking behavior can be unpacked into three distinct elements: The size of the bet involved in the risk, the variation of outcome options, and the chances or probability of extreme loss (Sanders & Hambrick, 2007). With this definition of risk taking and these elements in mind, CEO hubris leading to overconfidence and risky decisions can carry a variety of forms. We hypothesize that:

Proposition 7. Excessive risk taking by CEOs will have a negative effect on stock prices.

Corporate Risk Taking: Higher Premiums on Mergers & Acquisitions

CEOs whose hubris has risen to create overconfidence might overspend on entry into new markets (Camere & Lovallo, 1999). This risk-taking behavior can have a negative impact on firm performance and subsequent stock price.

CEO overconfidence may also lead to the development of riskier products (Simon & Houghton, 2003) which are different from the firm’s other product offerings, require greater amounts of research and development (and capital), create operational costs or inefficiencies, and attempt to break into a market dominated by another firm. Excessive amounts of hubris causing over confidence can distort the CEOs perception of the magnitude of potential gains (Picone et al., 2014) from a risky decision such as the development of riskier products. Development of riskier products could lead to an innovation breakthrough but could also cause a decrease in firm performance and possible termination of the CEO. The media plays a large role in the perpetual increase of CEO hubris leading to overconfidence and corporate risk taking such as the development of riskier products.

Corporate Risk Taking: Overestimation of the Likelihood of Venture Success

As a result of overconfidence, CEOs may be less likely to abandon a failing business venture or they may overestimate the likelihood of a ventures’ success. CEOs with a high level of hubris might be inclined to escalate the firm’s commitments to a course of action (Hayward & Rindova, 2004) or venture as it is experiencing a decrease in performance. Hubristic CEOs also have a tendency to, “Adopt a defensive posture in the face of critical feedback” (Picone et al., 2014: 456). This inability to abandon a failing venture most likely is attributable to a CEOs inflated views and inherent belief in their abilities, due to the media’s praise of their leadership or a persistent personality trait of self-importance (Hayward & Hambrick, 1997). Overestimation of firm success could also be attributed to organizational “simplicity,” an issue that occurs
among celebrity CEOs in which they rely heavily on a simplistic pre-packaged formula for success and managing that they have grown to adopt either as a bastardized version of original ideologies or in overgeneralizing previous positive outcomes (Miller, 1993). These CEOs, once they become famous in the media, believe that they possess a high degree of efficacy in leadership, which leads to CEOs becoming brands or, “caricatures of their former selves” (Miller & Chen, 1994; Hayward & Hambrick, 1997; 107). We then hypothesize that:

**Proposition 8.** High levels of CEO hubris will eventually cause overconfident CEOs to engage in excessively risky action.

**CEO Discretion**

One of the central constructs of our negative model of CEO hubris (Figure 2) is the impact that corporate risk taking and decreased stock price can have on CEO discretion. The concept of managerial discretion was first developed by Hambrick and Finkelstein (1987) and defined as, “…the latitude of action available to top executives.” Simply put, when discretion is high, CEOs have more freedom to make managerial decisions and take risks. This allows CEOs to, “…significantly shape the organization, and managerial characteristics will be reflected in organizational outcomes (Hambrick & Finkelstein, 1990). The opposite is true when managerial discretion is low. When CEO discretion is low, they are limited and restricted in their ability to manage the firm. While every firm is different in the level of discretion they allow their CEOs, corporate risk taking and decreases in stock price might cause a board of directors to shift from allowing high discretion to placing limitations on the discretion of a CEO. Therefore, we hypothesize that:

**Proposition 9.** A decrease in the stock price of a firm will decrease CEO discretion.

Excessive risk taking and negative stock prices will cause the board to place constraints on the CEO in terms of his or her discretionary power, which will have a negative impact on their influence. This decrease in stock price caused by corporate risk taking leading to a decrease in CEO discretion will also negatively impact their hubris. This is because a CEO who faces more restrictions on his or her discretion indicates a lack of trust between the board of directors and the CEO. We hypothesize that:

**Proposition 10.** A decrease in CEO discretion will cause a decrease in CEO hubris.

**Falling Stock Price and CEO Hubris**

Earlier we hypothesized that firm performance in the form of increased stock prices will lead to an increase in CEO hubris, but it is important to note that hypothesis 5 also works in the inverse. In a situation where firm performance is down and subsequently, stock prices are falling, there is a decrease in CEO hubris. This is due to the fact that the CEO’s confidence has fallen because of a decrease in firm performance and they are less certain about their managerial methods. Without describing environmental or economic factors that could attribute to the stock market’s increase or decrease, the fame brought about by the media and subsequent managerial overconfidence can cause the CEO to engage in corporate risk-taking causing stock prices to decrease due to poor firm performance. In some cases, CEOs that become celebrities in the media are more heavily scrutinized over the long term if shareholders do not continue to see the same level of innovation or growth that led to celebrity CEO status (Porac et al., 2008). In this scenario, it is not necessarily a decrease in firm performance that leads to scrutiny and potential decreases in stock price, but firm stagnation immediately following a period of high growth attributed to the CEO by the media and shareholders. We hypothesize that:
Proposition 11. A decrease in firm performance in the form of stock prices will lead to a decrease in CEO hubris.
GENDER AND WORKPLACE EQUITY: PERCEPTIONS OF TREATMENT, FAIRNESS, AND JUSTICE

PEGGY DUFOUR
George B. Delaplaine Jr. School of Business
Hood College
Frederick, MD 21701
pad9@hood.edu

ANITA JOSE, Ph.D.
George B. Delaplaine Jr. School of Business
Hood College

Abstract: Gender-based differences in workplace experiences have been an important management topic for decades, with social media and the #MeToo movement adding recent emphasis. As part of a larger study on business ethics, we surveyed professionals in the proposal development industry, a novel research area, to determine workplace experiences of this unstudied population. In 1,254 responses from 40 countries, women reported experiencing significantly more workplace penalties than men: greater distributive justice inequity, fewer promotions, and more hostile/toxic work environments with negative health effects. These results underscore the importance of management ethics and actions in ensuring workplace equity.

INTRODUCTION

Over the past 60 years, studies increasingly have entered the literature and popular media citing various analyses of differences between men and women in the workplace: how they perceive, prepare for, and select their work roles; are hired, perform, and are rewarded with pay and promotions; how they experience fairness or the lack of it in the workplace; and how they respond when work environments are unfair. Almost without exception, these studies have shown workplace treatment, compensation, and opportunity outcomes less favorable to women.

To examine the perceptions of professional men and women on gender-related workplace disparities, we surveyed an international professional organization with 7,351 members in 40 countries. This study was the first of its kind in an industry whose workforce supports global contract procurements valued at an estimated $1.4 trillion annually. Issues of gender disparity were of interest to the organization because two-thirds of its members are female, and because perceptions of inequity of pay or opportunity and differences in workplace treatment may affect the gendering of work roles, limit opportunities for promotion, and influence job satisfaction.

LITERATURE

Foundational theory on equity, fairness, and distributive justice was developed by Homans (1961) and Adams (1963, 1965), followed by procedural justice (Leventhal, 1976; Lind & Tyler, 1988; Thibaut & Walker, 1975), and interactional justice (Bies & Moag, 1986; Greenberg, 1990, 1993). These seminal works in organizational justice represent a larger body of research that seeks to understand human fairness and explain why men and women have different workplace experiences and outcomes. Study conclusions highlight the need for managers to recognize the human and economic impact of gender-based inequities, including financial hardship, workplace anger, and turnover, and take constructive action to remedy and prevent these negative outcomes.
Gender Pay Inequity

In the United States, the unadjusted figure representing what a woman earns for every dollar a man earns is estimated to be 78.6 cents (Chamberlain et al. 2019). Extensive academic and government research shows smaller, but statistically significant, explained and unexplained gender differences in compensation persisting over decades (Blau & Kahn, 2017; Fortin et al., 2017; Goldin, 1984, 1990, 2006; Harris, 2017; Kessler-Harris, 2001; Olivetti & Petrongolo, 2016; U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2021). Studies of cohorts of equally prepared men and women graduates with advanced degrees who enter the workforce in comparable positions show rapid differentiation, with women falling behind in the first year and remaining behind by an average $10,000 in the first decade (Corbett & Hill, 2012). A 2008 Catalyst survey revealed that starting salaries for new MBAs in the United States were $4,600 lower for women and that despite more mentoring (83% vs. 76% for men), high-potential women received fewer promotions (65% vs. 72% for men) (Ibarra et al., 2010). Similarly, Blau and DeVaro (2007) found that promotion rates were 39% higher for men. Another large meta-analytic study found that as careers progressed, the gender gap in rewards, including salaries, bonuses, and promotions, was 14 times larger than the gap in performance (Joshi et al., 2015).

Competitiveness and Ability to Negotiate

Logic tells us that if we are more open to accepting risks and challenges, we may have more opportunities that lead to greater rewards. Literature on risk behaviors is rich in studies delineating differences in risk preferences, competitiveness, and outcomes between males and females (Charness & Gneezy, 2012; Croson & Gneezy, 2009; Datta Gupta et al., 2006, 2013; Gneezy et al., 2003; Hanek et al., 2016). Such variances could help explain differences between men and women in career choice and resultant lifetime earnings.

Gender differences in competition find a nexus with compensation at the point where we negotiate a starting salary, raise, or bonus. Babcock and Laschever (2003) found that women request the rewards they earn much less frequently than men and negotiate less aggressively, supported by Bowles and Flynn (2010), who demonstrated that men persist longer in negotiating than women. Women are more likely to anticipate a negative response from a man than from a woman (Rudman, 1998), which may make them less likely to negotiate a starting salary successfully, less likely to initiate negotiations for a raise or bonus, and more willing to accept an early low offer. Bowles & Flynn (2010) also found that women who had more negotiating experience persisted longer and settled higher, indicating that training could have a mitigating effect.

The long-term consequences of adjusting negotiation acceptance points downwards may be disproportionately severe for women. In settings where there is little information on the limits surrounding the negotiation (“high structural ambiguity”), female MBA graduates accepted salary offers 5% lower than those accepted by males (Bowles et al., 2005). After applying controls, “there still remained a $10,000 gender gap in MBA salaries in industries with high structural ambiguity” (Bowles et al., 2005, p. 956). Projecting the impact of this difference across an entire career, Bowles et al. (2005) calculate a gender earnings gap of more than $600,000 and, by applying interest on earnings, estimate a total wealth gap of $1.5 million at age 65. The prevalence of gender-based wage gaps compounded by differences in risk preferences and negotiation outcomes leads to the following hypothesis for this study’s profession:

H1: Perceptions of distributive justice inequity will be higher among women than men.

Gender Workplace Penalties

Wage gaps are not the only workplace penalty experienced by women; two other large areas of impact include the “motherhood penalty” producing both wage and career progression
differentials, and disparities in workplace physical and emotional treatment. One of the most definitive studies on the impact on women’s wages from taking time away to raise children found an “approximately 7% per child penalty among young American women” (Budig & England, 2001, p. 204). In their three-decade retrospective study of the U.S. female workforce, Jee et al. (2019) determined that conditions had changed only slightly between 1986 and 2014, had actually worsened slightly for women with one child despite human capital investments, and were felt more strongly by Black and Latina women and by women having a second or third child. Further, England et al. (2016) and Fortin et al., (2017) found a disproportionally high impact at the opposite end of the pay spectrum, with higher paid, specially skilled women, like those in our sample, significantly more disadvantaged financially by motherhood. More recently, Ishizuka (2021) demonstrated that workforce discrimination against mothers occurs at the point of entry: Among 2,210 job applications, those with motherhood-signaling terms such as “PTA member” were excluded more often from the interview pool ($p < .05$).

Age compounds the lifetime earnings decrement, as seen by the wage disparity in the cohort of 55- to 64-year-olds. A Glassdoor gender pay gap report stated that “in the U.S., workers aged 18 to 24 years face a small, adjusted gender pay gap of 1.4 percent. By contrast, older workers aged 55 to 64 years face a gender pay gap of 12.3 percent, over twice the national average” (Chamberlain et al., 2019, p. 5). Based on these studies, we hypothesize:

**H2: More women than men will perceive gender-related workplace penalties.**

**Toxic Work Environments**

Workplace toxicity can include a range of dominance behaviors including incivility, ostracism, bullying, verbal and physical abuse, and sexual harassment, causing physical and psychological harm and leading to lower productivity and higher employee turnover (Anjum et al., 2018; Dube et al., 2019; Wang et al., 2021). Employees may feel trapped in these environments, limiting lifelong professional and economic growth. Recently, increased focus has been placed on toxicity related to verbal and sexual abuse against women, but toxicity can apply to men, as well. A study using National Health Interview Survey data provided by 17,524 working adults showed a 7.8% prevalence for toxic work environments, but also noted that the male-dominated security industry was most severely impacted (Alterman et al., 2013). Given the results of these studies, we hypothesize:

**H3: More women than men will report having experienced toxic work environments.**

**METHODOLOGY**

This study is quantitative by design and included qualitative analysis of 332 narrative responses. Data were collected through a 100-item online survey distributed to all 7,351 members of an international professional association. There were 1,254 responses, a 17.1% response rate, producing 1,113 valid cases. Data were not normally distributed; however, given the large sample size, this was not deemed to limit the use of the independent samples $t$ test. For greater confidence, the non-parametric Mann Whitney $U$ Tests were also performed.

The characteristics of study participants are nearly identical to those reported in the association’s 2020 demographics survey of its members. Most respondents live in the United States (65.4%), are female (65.5%), have bachelor’s degrees or higher (79.8%), are White (79.2), and are employed full-time with a single employer (84%) in middle management (44.9%). Respondent age cohorts included 27.4% Millennials (1980–1994), 41.1% Generation X (1965–1979) and 29.4% Baby Boomers (1945–1964). Respondents averaged 12.9 years of professional experience ($Med. = 11.0$), with 8.7 years in their current role ($Med. = 7.0$).
H1: Distributive Justice Equity  
To test H1, we constructed a seven-item distributive justice (DJ) scale based in part on questions in the SHRM job satisfaction survey (SHRM, 2017), with a high score indicating a positive view of distributive justice equity. Scale statistics: $\alpha = .783$, $M = 3.35$, Med. = 3.43, SD = .78, and mean interitem correlation = .342. Using an independent samples $t$ test, we found a significant difference between DJ scores of men ($M = 24.492$, SD = 5.25) and women ($M = 22.918$, SD = 5.50; $t (1111) = 4.590$, $p < .001$, one-tailed). The magnitude of the differences in the means (mean difference $= 1.57$, 95% CI: .901 to 2.25) was small ($\text{eta}^2 = .019$), indicating 1.9% of the variance in DJ scores is explained by gender (Cohen, 1988; Pallant, 2016). 
Because our sample included 65% women, we also conducted a nonparametric Mann-Whitney U test. Median DJ scores were statistically significantly different between male (Med. = 25) and female (Med. = 23) respondents ($U = 117,502$, $z = -4.223$, $p < .001$, calculated using asymptotic, one-tailed testing). Effect size ($r = -4.223/33.36 = -0.127$) was small (Cohen, 1988), with 12.7% of the difference in DJ median scores attributable to gender. Therefore, the hypothesis (H1) that women will perceive higher levels of distributive justice inequity than men is supported by both $t$ test ($p < .001$) and Mann-Whitney U test ($p < .001$).

H2: Gender-Related Workplace Penalties  
Expanding on the perceptions of compensation fairness tested in H1, H2 states that female proposal development professionals are more likely than their male counterparts to experience workplace penalties related to gender. To test this hypothesis, we developed a six-item Gender-Related Workplace Penalties (GWP) scale based on questions from the Global Ethics Survey (ECI, 2018) and a SHRM job satisfaction survey (SHRM, 2017). Scale statistics: $\alpha = .773$, $M = 2.43$, Med. = 2.33, SD = .86, and mean inter-item correlation = .370.

We conducted an independent samples $t$ test to compare male ($n = 378$) and female ($n = 735$) scores on the GWP scale. The assumption of homogeneity of variances was not met, as assessed by Levene’s test for equality of variances ($F = 18.749$, $p < .001$). GWP scores for each level of gender were not normally distributed (males = .958, $p < .001$; females = .985, $p < .001$). There was a significant difference between GWP scores of men ($M = 11.87$, SD = 4.21) and women ($M = 15.96$, SD = 5.09; $t (897.56) = -14.239$, $p < .001$, one-tailed). The magnitude of the differences in the means (mean difference $= -4.08$, 95% CI: -4.65 to -3.52) was small ($\text{eta}^2 = -0.154$), indicating 15.4% of the variance in GWP scores is explained by gender (Cohen, 1988; Pallant, 2016). Thus, the hypothesis that women will perceive higher levels of gender workplace penalties than men is supported.

Because of non-normal distribution, a nonparametric Mann-Whitney U test was also conducted. Distribution curves for GWP scores of male and female respondents were dissimilar, indicating that a comparison of mean ranks should be used. GWP scores were statistically significantly different between males (mean rank = 388.51) and females (mean rank = 643.65) ($U = 202,603$, $z = 12.562$, $p < .001$), calculated using asymptotic, one-tailed testing. Effect size ($r = 12.562/33.36 = 0.376$) was small (Cohen, 1988), indicating that 37.6% of the difference in GWP scores was attributable to gender. Therefore, H2 is supported by Mann-Whitney and $t$ tests, with women perceiving statistically significantly higher perceived occurrences of gender-related workplace penalties than men ($p < .001$).

H3: Toxic Work Environment  
To address H3, the survey asked, “Have you ever felt trapped in a toxic or hostile work environment?” Surprisingly, more than half of those responding (590, 53.7%) answered “Yes” to this question, including 428 women (72.5% of “Yes” responses). This percentage exceeds the
7.8% workplace prevalence reported by Alterman et al. (2013) using 2010 data and may be influenced by the heightened focus on workplace sexual predation (Kessler, 2020).

An independent-samples $t$ test was run to determine if there were differences between the 734 women and 365 responding to this question. Scores were normally distributed, as assessed by Shapiro-Wilk’s test ($p < .001$), and there was homogeneity of variances, as assessed by Levene’s test for equality of variances ($p = .115$). A lower score indicated higher occurrences of workplace toxicity. Female experience scores ($M = 1.42, SD = 0.49$) were lower than male scores ($M = 1.56, SD = 0.49$), a statistically significant difference, $M = 0.14, 95\% CI [-0.20, -0.08], t(1097) = -4.395, p < .001$, thereby supporting H3.

**Effect of Experiencing Unfair Workplace Treatment**

All 1,113 respondents answered this question, entering a total of 4,506 responses. Of significance to corporate managers and HRM professionals is the impact of unfair treatment on job satisfaction: 656 respondents (58.9%) said that such treatment lowered their job satisfaction or respect for their companies—the highest response item in this question—followed closely by “Made me unhappy and disappointed” (644, 57.9%), and “Made me want to quit” (590, 53%). Also noteworthy was the number of respondents (530, 47.6%) who said that as a result of unfair treatment, they had experienced negative health consequences, raising questions of lost productivity, workforce turnover, organizational ethics, and corporate reputation.

Two results are of particular note—the prevalence of negative experience in the workplace overall (73.9% experienced) and its disparity based on gender: 82% of women reported experiencing unfair treatment while 57.7% of men reported this experience. In addition, among 822 respondents in the unfair treatment group, 604 (73.5%) were women, while only 218 (26.5%) were men, despite the fact that the study sample was 66% female and 34% male, respectively. Therefore, while both sexes were overrepresented in the unfair treatment group, women were more strongly overrepresented.

The 92 narrative responses illustrated the consequences: “my nightmare job,” being “pressed to do things that were unethical,” “I have seen male managers take advantage of female subordinates sexually,” “My bonus was cut 90%,” and “My job and company culture were toxic.” Negative health outcomes included depression requiring hospitalization, “PTSD,” and long-term disability, leading to lawsuits and financial settlements.

**LIMITATIONS**

This study is limited by the use of a survey to measure perceptions, which can be imprecise due to social desirability bias, and, because it is limited to a single industry group, it is limited in its generalizability. Common method variance bias is a limitation. Also, our treatment of Likert scale data as interval rather than ordinal data, while common in social sciences, is a limitation. Finally, as a small part of a larger study on business ethics, the results presented here do not reflect all workplace perceptions of the sample. However, we do not feel that these limitations jeopardize the overall contributions of the study.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Gender remains a significant differentiator in the workplace. The men and women in our sample experience work and rewards differently, face different equity environments, and many still live with different workplace treatment including inequity in pay, promotion, and leadership opportunity, greater negative health consequences, differences in perceptions of fairness, and greater exposure to inappropriate sexual behavior. In common, however, both men and women in our sample experienced higher than anticipated perceptions of workplace toxicity. Gender played
a statistically significant role in determining perceptions of distributive justice inequity (H1),
gender-related workplace penalties (H2), and the experience of workplace toxicity (H3), with
women registering higher scores than men on both $t$ tests and Mann-Whitney $U$ tests ($p < .001$).
When the health consequences of this disparity were examined, women registered higher rates of
negative emotional and physical health outcomes than men.

**Implications for Managers**

Disparities exist at every point in the workforce chain controlled by management. Hiring
managers can ensure that mothers are not screened out of the interview pool. Compensation
managers can ensure that workplace competitiveness is fair and ethical and that negotiating
environments and career paths do not exploit women, who less frequently ask for the rewards
they earn and accept lower offers. Training should ensure that all managers recognize the
compound impact that a single unfair salary negotiation can have on the lifetime economic well-
being of an employee and her family. And HRM professionals can ensure that workplace roles do
not become gendered over time.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
EVALUATING ANTECEDENTS TO WORK-LIFE BALANCE AND CREATIVE PROCESS ENGAGEMENT

E. FREDRICK RICE
College of Business
University of Texas at Arlington
Arlington TX 76019

Abstract: Research examining the areas of work-life balance and workplace creativity have been heavily studied in the organizational behavior literature. However, the two have rarely been integrated. The current analysis attempts to address this by testing a conceptual model which merges these unique concepts into a unified nomological network. Two hundred eighty part-time and full-time employees were surveyed to understand the effects of family supportive supervisor behaviors (FSSB), non-work/work enrichment, creative self-efficacy and job engagement on creative process engagement and work-life balance.

INTRODUCTION

When managers engage in Family supportive supervisor behaviors (FSSB), they help promote wellness within their organizations by encouraging work-life balance (Kossek, Valcour, & Lirio, 2014). Such behaviors, which include being exemplars of proper prioritization and making it easy for subordinates to communicate about family issues, can also benefit organizational productivity. This is because when employees are provided the space to adequately attend to personal matters, they feel better and are better able to devote the appropriate amounts of time and energy to job-related tasks while at work (Frone, Yardley, & Markel, 1997). The family-friendly environment brought by FSSB contribute to greater balance and more conducive home lives for employees (Choi & Kim, 2017).

One way through which employees’ positive energy is expressed is the release of creative effort toward job-tasks (Van Dyne, Jehn, & Cummings, 2002). Researchers have made many attempts to explore the benefits of creativity in the workplace and found that the extent to which an individual is interested in creatively performing work tasks can, in part, be traced to the residual positivity of their home life (Aleksić, Mihelić, Černe, & Škerlavaj, 2017). Thus, energy that is devoted to seeking personal balance does not go to waste. But how can managers assist in promoting workplace creativity? Prior research has shown that leaders’ supportive behaviors are positively correlated with employee creativity (Chen, Yien, & Huang, 2011). Thus, employees’ engagement in the creative process may be added by the affective enrichment each domain provides the other (Grzywacz & Carlson, 2007). These findings lead to the following hypotheses:

Hypothesis 1: Family supportive supervisor behaviors will be positively associated with Non-work/ work affective enrichment.

Hypothesis 2: Family supportive supervisor behaviors will be positively associated with Work-Life Balance.

Hypothesis 3: Non-work/ work affective enrichment will be positively associated with Work-Life Balance.

Hypothesis 4: Family supportive supervisor behaviors will be positively associated with Creative process engagement.
When an employee has an intrinsic interest in creativity, he/she invests energy into the employer through involvement in creative problem identification, information searching and idea generation (Amabile, 1983; Reiter-Palmon & Lilies, 2004). Intrinsic motivation for creativity is considered to be a well-established predictor of creativity because of its influence on various elements and antecedents of the creative process (Amabile, 1996; Shalley, Zhou, & Oldman, 2004). In a study of 402 science majors, intrinsic motivation was found to indirectly affect student imagination through self-efficacy (Liang & Chang, 2014). Additionally, Intrinsic motivation for creativity is positively related to creative process engagement (Zhang & Bartol, 2010). Intrinsic motivation has also been linked to cognitive engagement in the workplace (Walker, Greene, & Mansell, 2006). The following hypotheses are based on these findings:

Hypothesis 5: Intrinsic motivation for creativity will be positively associated with Creative process engagement.

Hypothesis 6: Intrinsic motivation for creativity will be positively associated with Creative self-efficacy.

Hypothesis 7: Intrinsic motivation for creativity will be positively associated with Cognitive job engagement.

Activities such as problem solving, information searching and idea generation make up the creative process and play a major contributing role to creative performance (Zhang and Bartol, 2010). Employees’ capacity to engage in this process is largely dependent upon self-confidence in their creative abilities and family–work resource spillover (Tang, Huang & Wang, 2017; Van Dyne et al., 2002). Additionally, this process requires mental work associated with unique patterns of brain activity (Heilman, 2005). These findings inform the following hypotheses:

Hypothesis 8: Creative self-efficacy will be positively associated with Creative process engagement.

Hypothesis 9: Non-work/ work affective enrichment will be positively associated with Creative process engagement.

Hypothesis 10: Cognitive job engagement will be positively associated with Creative process engagement.

METHODS

Procedure and Analysis

Two hundred eighty participants provided complete data for three waves of an online survey with two-week lags. One hundred eighty-two participants were undergraduate students at one of two large universities in the southern United States working more than 30 hours/week. Ninety-eight participants were non-student full-time employees. Respondents included non-managerial hourly workers, professional-level employees, and C-suite executives. The data were analyzed using structural equation modeling in R 3.4.1 with the lavaan package (Rosseel, 2012).

Measures
FSSB were measured with the Emotional Support subscale of the Family Supportive Supervisor Behaviors Scale (Hammer, Kossek, Yragui, Bodner, & Hanson, 2009). The subscale consists of 3 items ($\alpha = .93$). The items were administered during the first wave of data collection. Intrinsic motivation for creativity at work was assessed using the 5-item scale ($\alpha = .90$) from Tierney, Farmer, and Graen (1999). The items were administered during the first wave of data collection. For Non-work/ work affective enrichment, participants were administered the 3-item subscale from the Work–Family Enrichment Scale from Carlson, Kaemar, Wayne, & Grzywacz (2006). The items were administered during the second wave of data collection and the alpha coefficient was satisfactory ($\alpha = .95$). Cognitive job engagement was assessed with the subscale derived from Rich, Lepine, and Crawford (2010). The 6 items tap into employees’ mental energy dedicated to work role performances. Cronbach’s alpha was .94. This information was obtained during the second wave of data collection. Creative self-efficacy was measured with 3 items ($\alpha = .91$) developed by Tierney & Farmer (2002). The measure was administered during the second wave of data collection. Creative process engagement was measured by an 11-item scale (Zhang & Bartol, 2010) which encompasses three dimensions: problem identification (3 items; $\alpha = .84$), information searching (3 items; $\alpha = .86$), and idea generation (5 items; $\alpha = .92$). The measure was administered during the third wave of data collection. Work-life balance was measured with 5 items taken from Greenhaus, Ziegert, & Allen (2012). Good reliability was demonstrated ($\alpha = .95$). The measure was administered during the third wave of data collection. Age, gender, and job tenure were controlled in the analysis.

RESULTS

The measurement model results indicated a good fit to the data ($\chi^2 [356] = 658.77$, $p < .001$; CFI = .96, TLI = .95, SRMR = .06, RMSEA = .04). Structural modeling results suggested that the hypothesized model fit the data well ($\chi^2 [446] = 811.49$, $p < .001$; CFI = .94, TLI = .94, SRMR = .06, RMSEA = .08). Table 1 summarizes all the model fit indices.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 1 Summary of Model Fit Indices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Measurement Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Hypothesized Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Alternative model Enrichment to Cog Engagement ($\beta = -.001$, $p = .99$)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chi squared values for the measurement and structural models are significant at $p < .001$.

Hypothesis 1 stated that FSSB would be positively associated with non-work/ work affective enrichment. This was not supported by the results of the analysis [$\beta = .108$, $p = .10$]. Hypothesis 2 asserted that FSSB would be positively related to Work-life balance. The results supported this prediction [$\beta = .206$, $p < .01$]. The non-significant relationship between Non-work/ work affective enrichment and Work-life balance contradicted the prediction set out by Hypothesis 3 [$\beta = .109$, $p = .08$]. Hypothesis 4, which stated that FSSB would be positively related to Creative process engagement, was not supported by the results [$\beta = -.05$, $p > .40$]. In support of Hypothesis 5, Intrinsic motivation for creativity was found to be positively related to Creative process engagement [$\beta = .192$, $p < .05$]. Results from the analysis supported the assertion from Hypothesis 6, that Intrinsic motivation for creativity would be positively associated with Creative self-efficacy [$\beta = .41$, $p < .001$]. Hypothesis 7 predicted that Intrinsic
motivation for creativity would be positively associated with Cognitive job engagement. The significant relationship supported the hypothesis $[\beta = .322, p < .001]$. Hypothesis 8 anticipated that Creative self-efficacy would be positively associated with Creative process engagement. The results of the hypothesis failed to support this prediction $[\beta = -.02, p < .70]$. Hypothesis 9 stated that Non-work/ work affective enrichment would be positively associated with Creative process engagement. This prediction was not supported by the results $[\beta = .104, p = .09]$. In line with Hypothesis 10, the results demonstrated that Cognitive job engagement is positively related to Creative process engagement $[\beta = .344, p < .001]$. An alternative model tested a direct effect of work-family enrichment on work engagement by adding a direct path from non-work/ work affective enrichment to Cognitive job engagement. Figure 1 presents the overall structural model with path coefficients.

**Figure 1. Structural Model.**

![Structural Model Diagram](image)

Standardized coefficients displayed.
Solid paths significant at $p < .05$.

**DISCUSSION**

A main contribution of the paper applies to scholarship on work-life balance. By finding a positive relationship between FSSB and Work-life balance, the results add to the research demonstrating that the family-friendly actions of managers come full circle. Indeed, energy that is expended in supporting the home lives of employees is not wasted. Though not supported with robust empirical evidence, the paper introduces a logical justification for the interplay of FSSB and enrichment with Creative self-efficacy and Creative process engagement.

**REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR**
Abstract: Drawing on insights from leader-member exchange theory (LMX), gender theory, and the family business literature, we examined the mentoring process for daughters as successors in family firms. Using a qualitative case study approach, we interviewed 18 daughters and their parent mentors (nine mothers and nine fathers). We suggest that differences exist between mothers and fathers as mentors regarding understanding the daughters' position in the firm and communication. Significant elements in the mentoring process included the following: increased exchange engagement, positive childhood experiences, progression through higher education, the daughter's autonomous decision to enter the family firm, business training, and counsel and advice to overcome the crucial issues of male gender bias and the burden of childcare responsibility.

INTRODUCTION

Daughters are progressively taking crucial roles in the leadership of family firms worldwide. As the baby boomer generation retires, mostly male founders and leaders are increasingly choosing daughters to lead the next generation in their family businesses (Farrell, 2019). Although the professional qualifications of daughters have been overlooked or even ignored in the past, family firm leaders are now considering them as possible family firm leaders (Faraudello & Songini, 2018). Nevertheless, the family business literature reports conflicting accounts concerning daughters with little consensus on their status in the family firm. Additionally, researchers have examined the problems daughters face in family firms. For example, studies have noted that daughters may have difficulties succeeding their mothers (Vera & Dean, 2005). Amid all the conflicting studies, there is a significant gap in the literature because very few empirical studies have examined how daughters rise to become family business leaders and parents' role as mentors in the process. Therefore, we studied both fathers and mothers as mentors to their daughters in family.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In the next section, we examine the literature relating to daughters as successors in family firms. We begin with gender theory as a theoretical starting point, highlighting distinctions between women and men in family firms. Then, we employ LMX theory insights to understand better the parental mentorship of their children in family firms. Finally, we highlight the literature concerning women, daughters, and succession in family firms.

Leader-Member Exchange (LMX)

Built on social exchange theory, LMX focuses on exchanges between individuals based on expected reciprocity and the obligation to reciprocate (Cropanzano & Mitchell, 2005). In
LMX, the leader influences the follower above and beyond the confines of the employment contract (Memili et al., 2014). LMX describes leadership as a dyadic relationship and posits that leaders do not treat followers the same way, but those relationships vary in levels of quality (Graen & Uhl-Bien, 1995). Because leaders possess a limited amount of time and energy, they must choose how to direct their attention among subordinates according to LMX theory (Edleston & Kidwell, 2012).

**Women, Daughters, and Succession in Family Firms**

The family business literature has recounted many difficulties for women in general and daughters in particular within the firm. For example, early studies depicted women as invisible in the family firm (Dumas, 1989). Invisibility occurred because of two factors: 1) Societal pressures perpetuated stereotyping and discrimination against women, which is reflected in the family business. 2) Women placed limitations on themselves because of cultural pressure. (Gillis-Donovan & Moynihan-Brandt, 1990; Hollander & Bukowitz, 1990).

Further, researchers reported that male gender bias might negatively impact the succession process by discouraging women from entering the family business. Then, once women joined the family firm, they were sometimes relegated to an emotional leadership role and were referred to as "chief emotional officers" (Salganicoff, 1990). Later, Dumas (1992) described daughters as under-utilized resources within the family firm. Moreover, in a study in Brazil, Curimbaba (2002) found that for women, emergencies and filling a specific need of the business were the most accessible routes of access to the family firm and that women often served as a last resort in succession. In a U.S. study, daughters encountered problems of rivalry with employees, experienced work-life balance issues, did not believe that they would take over the business as successors, and encountered issues succeeding their mothers (Vera & Dean, 2007).

**METHODS OF RESEARCH**

We examined the mentoring process for daughters as successors in family firms using a qualitative case study approach. Data from a series of in-depth, semi-structured interviews were analyzed using grounded theory methodology (Strauss & Corbin, 1998; Corbin & Strauss, 2008).

**The Case Study Approach**

Our investigation required a flexible research program. The case study approach is appropriate for studies involving 'how' and 'why' questions (Eisenhardt, 1989). A case study is "an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context" (Yin, 2009: 2). The case study researcher may purposively choose cases that are likely to replicate or extend the theory (Eisenhardt, 1989). The researcher may also select cases that illustrate applicable concepts (Patton & Applebaum, 2003). Therefore, qualitative samples may have the objective of developing a theory rather than testing it (Eisenhardt & Graebner, 2007). Increasing the number of cases involved in a study adds confidence to findings until the responses become repetitive. Yin (2009) compared the addition of cases to the addition of experiments, looking for replication. Eisenhardt (1989) proposed that researchers continue adding cases iteratively until minimal incremental improvement is evidenced.

**Grounded Theory**

We followed Strauss (1987) and Suddaby (2006) as we performed our study with a working knowledge of the family business literature concerning women and succession. As we gathered data, transcribed the interviews, and thought about the subject, we began to formulate our theory through an iterative process working back and forth with the data. Following the
above guidelines, we conducted this study with a working knowledge of the family business literature. We formed and reformed our theory throughout the research process - from performing interviews to transcribing the recorded interviews to storing the documents in ATLAS.ti. Although the ATLAS.ti computer software assisted in storing and retrieving documents, we, as researchers, made the coding and interpretative decisions (Patton, 2002).

Study Participants
We interviewed the daughters and their mentors in each family firm. Thus, we triangulated the data with multiple respondent perspectives within each company to better understand the roles of the daughters as successors. To understand each family business and then the daughters in that family business, we asked questions in the following categories: personal, company, family business, and daughters in a family business.

Firms from different industries participated in the study, including seven service companies, five retail businesses, five restaurant operations, two wholesale firms, and two building contractors. The number of employees within the respondent firms varied from 6 to 430, averaging 70. The ages of the businesses ranged from 15 to 99 years, and family generations varied from two to four. The firms were located in four U.S. states.

The respondents consisted of a daughter and a parent mentor at each family firm. The mentors were all family members, including nine mothers and nine fathers. Among the 36 respondents were 20 family-member owner/managers, 11 family-member managers, and five former owners. In grouping the 36 family member respondents, 12 were first-generation family members, 17 were in the second, six were in the third, and one was in the fourth generation. In addition, there were 27 women and nine men respondents for a total of 36, which exceeds the number (30 respondents) suggested by Reay (2014). Among the 27 women family member respondents, five were in the first generation, 16 were in the second, five were in the third, and one was in the fourth.

Data Collection and Analysis
We began with an exploratory interview of a senior family firm manager to obtain consent for participation in the study and determine the appropriateness of the firm. Next, we interviewed daughters and their mentors in the organization. The interviews were semi-structured and involved open-ended questions concerning the daughters' roles in the firm's leadership. The authors conducted the tape-recorded interviews individually with respondents at each family firm, totaling 36 participants. We transcribed about 27 hours of interviews, varying from 30 minutes to one hour, averaging 45 minutes each. The transcribed interviews totaled 292 pages, for an average of 8.1 pages per respondent.

We followed the procedures outlined by Strauss and Corbin (1998) as grounded theory analysis. First, in a time-consuming step, we analyzed each case separately and summarized the case histories of each company. The replies of each respondent to the elicitation questions provided the information to construct a brief history of each family business. Next, we performed content analysis of the data looking for insights and patterns across the cases (cross-case analysis). Finally, we based the findings and propositions of the study on multiple instances for each significant point.

The transcribed interviews supplied the basis for our study as we coded and analyzed the data using the ATLAS.ti qualitative software program. In terms of ATLAS.ti, we collected significant phrases into codes and identified each code by the respondents. During the analysis, we developed an initial model to organize our thoughts in the project. As we progressed through the coding steps, we refined and expanded our exploratory model, "A Model of the Mentoring Process of Daughters in Family Firms," through several iterations until we arrived at our final model in Figure 1.
Figure 1: A Model of the Mentoring Process for Daughters as Successors in Family Firms

PROPOSITIONS

Based on our findings, we offer the following 11 propositions regarding the mentoring process for daughters in family firms.

Proposition 1: Mother mentors will better understand their daughters' positions in family firms compared to father mentors.

Proposition 2: Mother mentors will communicate more effectively with their daughters in family firms than father mentors.

Proposition 3: Increased physical, emotional, and spiritual family mentor exchange will positively influence the mentoring process for daughters as successors in family firms.

Proposition 4: Increased physical, emotional, and spiritual daughter exchange engagement will positively influence the mentoring process for daughters as successors in family firms.

Proposition 5: Positive childhood experiences connected to the business will contribute to the mentoring process for daughters in family firms.

Proposition 6: Progression through higher education will contribute to the mentoring process for daughters in family firms.

Proposition 7: The daughter's autonomous decision to enter the business will contribute to the mentoring process for daughters in family firms.
Proposition 8: Business training, guided by parent mentors, will contribute to the mentoring process for daughters in family firms.

Proposition 9: Parent mentors will provide counsel and advice to counter the negative impact of male gender bias.

Proposition 10: Parent mentors will reduce the childcare burden on their daughters by directly assisting with childcare.

Proposition 11: Parent mentors will reduce the childcare burden on their daughters by creating a flexible work schedule to aid their daughters in childcare.

DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS FOR THEORY

This study has important theoretical implications in two areas: (1) gender or feminist theory in family firms and (2) LMX theory and mentorship in family firms.

Implications for Gender - Feminist Theory in Family Firms

Not surprisingly, we found evidence that male gender bias continues to operate in family firms. However, according to the respondents in this study, this gender bias presented itself in somewhat more subtle ways. Following social role theory (Eagly & Wood, 2016), we found a consistent pattern of the separation of duties and job assignments by gender. We noted cases where daughters worked inside the office while sons worked outside in more prestigious field positions. The second issue presented by gender theory is the unequal distribution of power between women and men in our culture and society (Ely & Padavic, 2007). This study focused on daughters who were on the rise to leadership positions in family firms, which may have influenced the findings of this study in favor of a more equitable distribution of rewards by gender. While there were issues with job assignments as listed above, the respondent family firm leaders did attempt to allocate salaries equally by gender when both daughters and sons were involved in the leadership of the family firm.

Implications for LMX Theory and Mentorship in Family Firms

The findings of this study agree with the literature regarding strong parent-child relationships and the development of high-quality LMX exchanges (Eddleston & Kidwell, 2012; Memili et al., 2014). Additionally, we specified that greater LMX exchanges include physical, emotional, and spiritual elements provided by both mentors and daughters in family firms. We interpreted greater exchange efforts as going beyond what is expected or required and giving extra effort. Such actions may take the form of providing physical assets for the betterment of the daughters and family business, supporting difficult decisions made by daughters emotionally, or promoting love and affection in a spiritual dimension. Moreover, respondent parent mentors aided their daughters' performance in the family firm by directly caring for their children and creating flexible work schedules. While Overbeke et al. (2015) found that a shared vision between daughters and fathers was crucial for succession, we found that agreement on basic management issues was equally significant. Specifically, managing and overcoming male gender bias was an important issue.

Implications for Practice

If successful succession is the goal, practitioners should encourage their daughters and sons to enter the family firm. Family firm leaders should ensure that their children are positively
exposed to the family firm from the very beginning of their childhood. Family firm leaders should convey their sense of pride and fulfillment in the family business and avoid assigning meaningless part-time work to their children. Because the business world is growing increasingly complex, practitioners should emphasize completing business-related college degrees for daughters and sons. Family firm leaders should serve as mentors themselves for their children if possible. Because family firm leaders know their daughters and sons better than outsiders, they are uniquely positioned to develop their talents and abilities.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM THE FIRST AUTHOR
INTERPLAY OF KNOWLEDGE MANAGEMENT, OPERATIONAL AND DYNAMIC CAPABILITIES IN PROJECT PHASES

Atul Arvind Patankar  
Jamnalal Bajaj Institute of Management Studies  
Mumbai, India  
atulpatankar@jbims.edu

Prashant Salwan  
Indian Institute of Management  
Indore, India

Abstract: The project delivery organizations (PDO) have to develop competitive advantage against new entrants. The advantage depends on knowledge configuration i.e. the coverage of different domains (breadth) and detailed understanding of those (depth) of knowledge configuration. These configurations are maintained by assimilating experiences into routines and the routines into operational capabilities. They need dynamic capabilities to update client processes and devise new solutions This article presents an interplay between operational and dynamic capabilities in projects wherein, the operational capabilities are required more during the initiation phase and dynamic capabilities in later stages.

WHAT DO THE EXISTING RESEARCH PAPERS SAY ABOUT DYNAMIC CAPABILITIES IN PROJECTS?

As per the in-depth literature review focusing on knowledge management initiatives and projects in an organization -Table 1 the projects go through different phases, beginning with project initiation wherein, emphasis is on operational capabilities for initial setup, documentation rigor, resource mobilization etc. According to Zollo and Winter (2002) and Winter (2003) the operational capabilities relate to the line activities and general working of a firm. Hence the routine activities such as project initiation, setup and resource mobilization can be ascribed to operational capabilities. Zahra S, Sapienza HJ and Davidson P (2006) state that dynamic capabilities refer to reconfiguration of operational routines by the decision makers of a company. As the projects progress into development stage, dynamic capabilities are needed to facilitate decisions on tradeoffs, customization of solution etc. The implementation phase needs dynamic capabilities the most as it involves changing the client business processes. The ability of PDOs to rigorously follow the routines and simultaneously be flexible towards the change helps the incumbents to build onto their rich knowledge base and create sustainable entry barriers.

To achieve this objective, the firms have to carefully identify the knowledge they want to capture, convert it into explicit forms, attach metadata tags for easy and appropriate discovery and facilitate sharing (Andrew D, 2016).

HOW DOES THE PROPOSED APPROACH DIFFER?

In the era of digital transformation, the managers look for ways to assimilate internal and external knowledge and disseminate consistent information through various channels. The enterprise systems such as ERP, CRM, HRMS, Finance and Accounts Systems, Supply Chain Management Systems etc. provide operational details whereas official communication channels like emails, LinkedIn, company website, blogs etc. can provide sentiment analysis, trending and behavioral inputs. The knowledge management process thus supports the operational capabilities to maintain the routine activities of knowledge capture, management and sharing. It is an
essential contributor for dynamic capabilities for research, innovation and implementation of changes in client business processes.

Hence this article focuses on application of the constructs like dynamic capabilities, operational capabilities, knowledge configuration and knowledge management processes to project life cycle.

It is proposed that during the initial phases of the project, the operational capabilities are required to support the routine activities like project setup, resource allocation, tendering, material supply. During this phase, the dynamic capabilities which help to change the existing routines may not be required to a great extent. As the project progresses, the balance shifts to dynamic capabilities. The implementation phase is marked by critical activities like erection, testing and commissioning. The client organization undergoes a transformation due to change in their workflows, transaction processes and maintenance of routines. The dynamic capabilities which help to implement such changes, are prominently required to support these activities.

The existing literature relates to the capabilities and routines within an organization. The research papers relate to project management of internal initiatives. This article describes how a PDO responds to the requirements of client organization by managing the interplay between the operational and dynamic capabilities. It lists the critical factors which act as enablers of knowledge management. Acknowledging the need to monitor return from knowledge initiatives, it provides a framework of indicators applicable in major phases of project viz. requirement analysis, development and implementation.

**A MODEL FOR PDOS**

Knowledge exploitation refers to the deployment of the existing knowledge on markets, products and abilities (Levinthal & March, 1993). The projects delivered by PDOS in the past are a major source for the project teams to gain knowledge while preparing for the upcoming ones. The extent of overlap between the new and the legacy projects decides the level of abstraction while collating the knowledge already available. The teams develop better understanding if the past projects relate with the current to a larger extent. The legacy projects may seem to be irrelevant due to technological obsolescence and rapidly changing market dynamics. However, the basic processes such as setup, resource mobilization, requirement analysis could still be learnt from the past experiences. Similarly, the organizations should cultivate the practice of recording project decisions with reasons and also the outcomes. This helps the project teams to understand the effects of changes, implemented in the past and the reasons behind operational routines.

The internal data is often contained in silos within the proprietary architecture of enterprise systems and packages procured from vendors. Tshidi Mohapeloa (2017) notes that silos restrict free flow of knowledge within the organization and affect service delivery, customer satisfaction and organizational performance.

Collating the knowledge gathered from these structured sources with unstructured external sources may prove somewhat difficult as it needs matching of keywords, terms and database fields. A well-defined metadata tagging practice can help to reduce the confusion and achieve extraction of precise information without distorting the facts. Apostolou C. (2009) highlighted the importance of metadata tags in every phase of knowledge management process – retrieve, reuse and share. The knowledge thus processed is sought by many users. The front office needs it to check for any early signals about the threats to their targets, the production department to plan for inventory to cater to upcoming demand surge etc.
Zia, S & Shafiq, Muhammad (2017) mention that knowledge management enhances creative abilities and facilitates innovation in organization to cater to changing customer needs, rapidly evolving technology landscape and intense market dynamics. The research and development team uses the collated information to see if their initiatives could reach state of the art stage from cutting edge level.

The operational capabilities cover all these activities and especially those during the project initiation and development phases. Usually, the emphasis during the initial phase of setting up and requirement analysis would be on understanding the existing client business processes, comparing those with industry practices, finding the gaps and checking about any issues reported by the client business users. The development phase would be dedicated to creation of the solution as per the requirements noted during the first phase. The requirement for operational capabilities would reduce over development phase and would be the least during the implementation phase save for the installation, configuration, testing, corrections and handover activities.

The dynamic capabilities would be required somewhat less during the requirement analysis phase and gradually increase till implementation phase. The trend depended on the type of technology adopted by the client. For those in the cutting edge or state of the art stages, the dynamic capabilities would be required right from requirement analysis phase. For other technologies which were in advanced or matured stages, the routines had stabilized over multiple projects already executed and would have largely become operational capabilities by then. The dynamic capabilities were required for technology trade-offs and decisions during the development phase. The implementation phase would require a major change in client business processes due to the new solution, finding workable alternatives in certain cases and customization for adapting the solution. Hence the demand for dynamic capabilities was the most during this phase.

The effectiveness of knowledge configuration, operational and dynamic capabilities can be measured by analyzing the Critical Success Factors (CSFs) and related Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). These should be defined well in advance right at the time of project initiation phase. A framework of CSFs and KPIs needs to be developed for regular monitoring and feedback to various levels within the organization. The section IV elaborates the way a PDO in
the field of heavy engineering projects (hereafter referred to as ‘the company’ in this article) used the CSFs and KPIs

THE ENABLERS OF KNOWLEDGE MANAGEMENT

An engineering project company decided to monitor the knowledge management activities and both operational – dynamic capabilities throughout the project life cycle. The enablers for knowledge management (Ajmal, M 2010) were identified as –

- Technology (knowledge management process, accessibility and usability)
- Culture (knowledge sharing implements and remedies)
- Knowledge content (management of knowledge resources)
- Stakeholder commitment (knowledge initiatives and mandatory activities)

IDENTIFICATION OF MONITORING INDICATORS

The company executives wanted the knowledge management process to be monitored in terms of its effective contribution towards achieving the project objectives. They identified the parameters for monitoring effectiveness of knowledge management process, initiatives and activities as below:

- Initiation phase (ideation and requirement analysis) – More of operational capabilities and less of dynamic capabilities
- Development phase (both operational and dynamic capabilities)
- Implementation phase (more of dynamic capabilities and less of operational capabilities)

CONCLUSION

This article relates to applicability of constructs like operational and dynamic capabilities and knowledge configuration to projects delivered by a PDOs. It proposes a model for application of the constructs to each of the phases of a project. It then illustrates the knowledge value chain in a PDO in the field of engineering projects with detailed insights into the steps of sense, seize and share across the project life cycle. Further, the article details the knowledge enablers identified by the PDO as technology, culture, content and commitment

The knowledge management KPIs adopted by the PDO show that the routines during the project initiation phase require more of operational capabilities. As the project progresses into the development phase, the need for dynamic capabilities starts increasing. It reaches the peak during the implementation phase where operational capabilities play a comparatively smaller role. This study can help to better understand planning for capabilities in different project phases, use of exploratory and exploitative methods for getting requisite knowledge and maintenance of knowledge configurations

Though the article is based on a case study of a PDO in engineering industry, further research may find the model equally applicable in other industries such as IT

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
DO LEADERS PLAY FAVORITES?: EVALUATING PERSONALITY SIMILARITIES, LMX, AND JOB PERFORMANCE

CHERIE HOHERTZ AND J. LEE WHITTINGTON
University of Dallas
chohertz@udallas.edu

INTRODUCTION

Relationships between leaders and followers can have wide-reaching effects on organizations. These dyadic relationships can impact team performance, morale, and organizational culture. A recent qualitative study (Joseph, 2016) interviewed leaders and followers about their lived experiences, specifically looking at how this relationship affected their work outcomes. The study found that these relationships affected all areas of their work – performance, engagement, satisfaction, and commitment. With this information, it is imperative that organizations do everything possible to develop and support these relationships.

Leader-Member Exchange (LMX) is the theory that “the quality of the relationship that develops between a leader and a follower is predictive of outcomes at the individual, group, and organizational levels of analysis” (Gerstner & Day, 1997). As leaders there will always be stronger connections with certain employees – those employees who are high performers, regularly exhibit extra-role performance, and show high levels of trust, organizational loyalty, and are “team players.” With these employees, the quality of the LMX dyadic relationship is higher. Research has shown that this is a cyclic process; employees who report relationships high in LMX quality are more likely to work harder to preserve those relationships, which in turn improves the quality of the LMX relationship. In short, these high-quality relationships make leaders play favorites.

What are the antecedents to these higher quality LMX relationships? Why is it that leaders are drawn to certain employees? Does higher quality LMX relationships affect positive organizational outcomes? Multiple studies have examined the characteristics and attitudes of both the leader and follower on LMX quality. Findings of these studies have been similar; personality traits such as extraversion and agreeableness in both the leader and follower can positively affect the relationship. Yet very little research has been done to investigate whether similarities in extraversion and agreeableness between the leader and follower will enhance the LMX relationship.

This study will investigate how personality similarities between the leader and follower impact the quality of the LMX relationship and whether LMX quality mediates the relationship between these personality similarities and positive organizational outcomes, specifically looking at in-role and extra-role job performance and counterproductive work behaviors of the follower. This paper will review relevant literature, discuss propositions, present a research model that could be used to investigate these correlations, and discuss implications for practice.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Personality Similarities

One of the biggest studies on the concept of personality traits was conducted by Goldberg (1990). Goldberg’s research identified more than 1,700 terms grouped into 10 different clusters. Nearly 200 participants rated themselves on each of these terms. From the results, 5 specific factors became evident from the analysis – extraversion, agreeableness, conscientiousness, emotional stability, and intellect (or openness) (Goldberg, 1990). This five-factor model, as it became known, is measured by a 44-item scale that measures each of the five-factors; the factors
are then broken down into more specific traits. Judge, Heller, and Mount (2002), examined how the five-factor model related to job performance and job satisfaction. They found that extraversion, conscientiousness, and emotional stability were correlated with positive organizational outcomes.

Ashton and Lee (2007) proposed a sixth factor after extensive research on the five-factor model. The HEXACO model proposed the honest-humility factor of personality. While some of the HEXACO factors closely align with that of the five-factor model, others are only tangentially related. The HEXACO factors include honesty-humility, emotionality, extraversion, agreeableness, conscientiousness, and openness to experience; extraversion, conscientiousness, and openness to experiences closely align to the same three factors in the big five, while emotionality, agreeableness, and honesty-humility differ significantly (Ashton & Lee, 2007).

The six factors that make up the HEXACO model are constructs in and of themselves. Honesty-humility can be measured by sincerity, fairness, greed-avoidance, and modesty. The construct of emotionality is measured by fearfulness, anxiety, dependence, and sentimentality. Extraversion is measured by expressiveness, social boldness, sociability, and liveliness. Forgiveness, gentleness, flexibility, and patience are measured for the agreeableness factor. Conscientiousness is determined by measuring organization, diligence, perfectionism, and prudence. Finally, openness to experience is measured by aesthetic appreciation, inquisitiveness, creativity, and unconventionality (Ashton & Lee, 2007).

Personality traits that form the HEXACO model have been linked to positive organizational outcomes. Lee et al. (2008) found that the honesty-humility trait could be used to predict both employee deviant behavior and employee integrity. Similarly, research found that differences in the honesty-humility trait accounted for a significant variance in goal achievement. Other HEXACO traits have been correlated with work outcomes; conscientiousness was found to predict employee engagement (Young et al., 2018), extraversion had a positive correlation with both employee engagement and performance and a negative correlation with counterproductive work behaviors (Wilmot et al., 2019), and both conscientiousness and agreeableness have been linked with higher performance, especially when employees score high on both traits (Witt et al., 2002). As demonstrated, personality traits can affect all aspects of an employee’s job satisfaction, engagement, and performance.

Personality similarity and its effect on work relationships was first studied by Donn Byrne. Byrne’s theory, the similarity-attraction paradigm, suggests that “similarity between individuals with regard to personal attributes or other characteristics is linearly related to interpersonality attraction” (Byrne et al., 1971; Oren et al., 2012). Similarly, Bauer and Green (1996) found that personality similarities (measured by positive affectivity) were closely related to the strength of the dyadic relationship. In these studies, personality similarities were measured by comparing individual scores to personality assessments.

**Leader-Member Exchange Theory**

Leader-Member Exchange (LMX) theory is based on the Vertical Linkage Dyad (VDL) developed by Dansereau, Cashman, and Graen (1973). Later termed LMX, the theory “maintains that leaders develop different types of exchange relationships with their followers, and the quality of these relationships affects important member attitudes and behaviors” (Gerstner & Day, 1997). The measure of LMX is on a scale from high-quality to low-quality relationships; high quality relationships are characterized by “mutual trust, loyalty, respect, and obligation” while low quality relationships are marked by “lack of trust, lack of respect, and distance between the leader-follower” (Waismel-Manor et al., 2010). Sin, Nahrgang, and Morgeson outline three phases of the LMX relationship – role taking, role making, and role routinization (Graen & Scandura, 1987; Sin et al., 2009). In the role taking phase, the leader communicates the requirements of the follower; during role making, the LMX relationship is
formed; role routinization occurs when the relationship develops a “pattern of normative behaviors” (Sin et al., 2009).

There are many factors that can affect the quality of the LMX relationship. A large-scale meta-analysis by Dulebohn et al. (2012) found a number of factors that can act as antecedents to LMX relationships. (See Figure 1) These include leader and follower competence, personality, fit between leader/follower, similar positive affectivity, and follower self-identity, and importantly, perceived similarity (Goodwin et al., 2009; Jackson & Johnson, 2012; Tremblay et al., 2017). This relationship quality can have implications for leaders, followers, teams, and organizations. LMX relationships can act as an antecedent to positive organizational outcomes like job satisfaction (Flickinger et al., 2016), organizational citizenship behavior (Waismel-Manor et al., 2010), and employee engagement (Burch & Guarana, 2014; Matta et al., 2015).

**Figure 1: Antecedents and consequences of the LMX relationship (Dulebohn et al., 2012)**

![Diagram showing antecedents and consequences of LMX relationship]

**Job Performance**

Motowidlo and Kell (2012) defined job performance as “the total expected value to the organization of the discrete behavioral episodes that an individual carries out over a standard period of time.” This definition was developed by researching performance concepts including Campbell’s multifactor model (Campbell, 1990), organizational citizenship behavior, counterproductive behavior, and general performance factor. One of the most widely accepted models is Rotundo and Sackett’s three-component model of job performance.

The three-component model of job performance, developed by Rotundo and Sackett, theorizes that there are three elements to performance – task, citizenship, and counterproductive performance (Rotundo & Sackett, 2002). Task performance is defined as “the quantity and quality of work output” (Martin et al., 2016). Task performance behaviors include components of the job that are regular and routine with outcomes and deliverables that can be measured. Citizenship performance (also called organizational citizenship behavior and extra-role performance) are “a group of activities that are not necessarily task-related but that contribute to
the organization in a positive way” (Rotundo & Sackett, 2002). Examples of citizenship behaviors include altruism, mentoring, and other activities that support the organizational goals and/or mission. Finally, counterproductive behaviors are “a group of behaviors that detract from the goals of the organization” (Gruys & Sackett, 2003). Counterproductive behaviors include deviance, theft, and non-compliance with organizational rules and norms.

Propositions

There have been numerous studies that have found proof of the interconnectedness of the concepts discussed above.

The concept of positive affectivity has been linked to a number of personality traits, including emotionality (Watson, David et al., 1988), agreeableness, and conscientiousness (Watson, David, 2002). Watson and Clark’s structural model of positive affectivity measures three constructs: Joviality (a construct measuring cheerfulness, happiness, enthusiasm, etc.), Self-Assurance (confidence, strength, daringness), and Attentiveness (concentration, determination, alertness) (Watson, D. & Clark, 1994). These three constructs have been linked to correlating HEXACO traits, joviality correlating with agreeableness, attentiveness correlating with conscientiousness, and a lower, but still significant, correlation between self-assurance and extraversion (Anglim et al., 2020).

Bauer and Green (1996) was one of the first studies to investigate personality similarities and the relationship on the quality of the LMX relationship. Their research found that there was a significant correlation ($\alpha = 0.40$) between leader and follower similarities in positive affectivity and the LMX relationship. Because of the correlation between positive affectivity (proven to encompass a number of the HEXACO traits) and LMX, this research confirms a link between personality similarities and the leader / follower relationship.

Proposition 1: The quality of the LMX relationship will be higher in leader / follower relationships where the leader and follower share similar personality traits.

There have also been linkages found between the quality of the LMX relationship and job performance of followers. Gerstner and Day (1997) studied the correlations between LMX and a number of other constructs, including performance ratings (both leader and follower ratings), objective performance, satisfaction, affective organizational commitment, member competence, and turnover. The results showed the strongest correlations between LMX and member performance ratings ($\alpha = 0.89$) and leader performance ratings ($\alpha = 0.83$); these results demonstrate that "the inclusion of interpersonal factors (such as LMX) can increase the variance explained by ability, job knowledge, and technical factors alone" (p. 834). Other studies have found positive correlations between LMX and in-role performance (Mumtaz & Rowley, 2020), organizational citizenship behaviors (extra-role performance) (Waismel-Manor et al., 2010), and a negative correlation between LMX quality and counterproductive work behaviors (Martin et al., 2016). This research leads to the following proposition:

Proposition 2: Followers that report high quality LMX relationships will score higher on leader ratings of performance than those who report low quality LMX relationships.

There has been far less research on the link between personality similarities in the leader / follower relationship and job performance. In one of the few studies that link these two constructs, Pelt et al. (2017) investigate whether the general factor of personality (GFP) has an effect on job performance (measured by overall job performance, objective performance, supervisor rate performance, team performance, and training performance); the general factor of personality is a combined score of the Big Five personality traits, as well as approximately 20
other traits that make up personality. This meta-analysis found that there were correlations with the GFP and several of the measurements of job performance, most highly correlated with supervisor-rated performance, telling us that high scores on the GFP are directly related to high performance. In another study, the authors explored whether a leader’s personality traits influence follower’s perception of the LMX relationship and how that perception impacted followers’ in-role and extra-role performance (Kahya & Şahin, 2018). Using the Big Five personality traits, significant correlations were found between leader extraversion and agreeableness and member reports of the LMX quality; results also indicated that LMX quality partially mediated the relationship between extraversion and performance. To date, no research has included the sixth HEXACO trait of honesty-humility in a similar model. Expanding on Kahya and Sahin’s research, this study proposes:

**Proposition 3:** Personality similarities between the leader and follower will positively affect the follower’s in-role and extra-role performance and negatively affect the follower’s counterproductive work behavior.

Finally, it is expected that the quality of the LMX relationship will mediate the correlation between personality similarities and work performance. While links between personality similarities (especially the traits of extraversion and agreeableness) and performance have been found, investigated LMX as a mediator of this correlation will provide an opportunity to explain how these similarities affect the three components of job performance. Therefore:

**Proposition 4:** The quality of the LMX relationship will partially mediate the relationship between personality similarities and job performance.

**DISCUSSION**

**Practical Implications**

It is the goal of every organization to have employees who are high performers; a high performing team can affect competitive advantage and organizational outcomes. This research has two major implications for practice that could improve organizational outcomes, most especially in-role and extra-role performance.

Organizations can evaluate personality similarities between the leader and potential follower. Administering personality tests such as the HEXACO personality inventory soon after hire would give insight into the prospective quality of the LMX relationship. Especially on the personality traits of extraversion, agreeableness, and conscientiousness, these similarities between leader and follower can lead to better team dynamics and higher in-role and extra-role performance. Care should be taken, however, to prevent homogenous teams. Entire teams made up of similar personalities can lead to stagnation, groupthink, and a lack of innovation.

This research underscores the need for leaders to understand that the quality of the relationship with followers can impact both task performance and organizational citizenship behaviors. Training leaders on how to cultivate these relationships, regardless of personality similarity, as well as how to maintain and improve these relationships, is paramount to successful teams. Organizations should develop resources for leaders and followers to improve communication skills, conflict resolution, and interpersonal skills, giving them the tools necessary to sustain and enhance the quality of the LMX relationship, thus likely improving individual and team performance.

**Implications for Future Research**
This research proposes to investigate how personality similarities affect LMX quality and job performance. The Dulebohn et al. (2012) framework offers a wide variety of further research that could be investigated in relation to personality similarities. For example, Kacmar (2009) studied whether perceived similarities or actual similarities had a greater effect on the quality of the LMX relationship. Further research could investigate whether the perceived personality similarities outlined in this study are better predictors of the quality of the LMX relationship, and therefore, better predictors of in-role and extra-role performance. Additionally, future research may focus on the effect of personality similarities on other organizational outcomes. Research has shown that personality traits can have significant impacts on job satisfaction (Cleare, 2013), but no relationship was found between personality traits and affective commitment (Inanc, 2018). Further research is warranted to solidify the understanding of what factors lead to higher quality LMX relationships, and how those relationships affect positive organizational outcomes.

Conclusion

The quality of the leader-follower dyadic relationship could prove to greatly impact positive organizational outcomes, specifically in-role and extra-role performance and counter-productive work behaviors. The results of this study would add to that research by proving the correlation between personality similarities and the quality of that relationship. By finding ways to link similar leaders and followers, organizations can expect better leader-follower relationships, resulting in higher overall performance.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
In the post-industrial era, managers have faced ever-increasing complexity, dynamism, and uncertainty in internal and external organizational environments (Kira & van Eijnatten, 2010). One unsurprising result is the erosion of relevance for top-down influence models of leadership crafted and validated through the study of mid-twentieth century bureaucracies (Collinson, 2018). The twenty-first century has seen an explosion of emergent leadership theories and promising conceptualizations (Gardner et al., 2010). Many of which have found their way into practice before the concepts are well-understood or adequately researched. One such construct is embodied leadership (EL).

Empirical research on EL is nearly nonexistent, theorizing is disjointed, and the concept remains undefined in the literature. However, the practice of EL has been promoted in practitioner-oriented journals focused on training (Briers, 2015), human resource development (Brendel & Bennett, 2016), organizational development (Kenward, 2018), and occupations (e.g., nursing, Koya et al., 2017). The purpose of this article is to provide leadership scholars with an integrative definition and exploratory conceptual model of EL, which is necessary to advance scholarly study within this promising area.

EMBODIMENT IN THE LEADERSHIP LITERATURE

Noting a disentanglement of the cognitive, emotional, and bodily experience of leadership in organizations, scholars have introduced the EL concept to more accurately reflect holistic leadership in practice and challenge extant disembodied conceptualizations (Hamill, 2013; Ladkin, 2008). Various scholarly camps have approached this endeavor using different leadership lenses, reflecting the fragmentation of the broader leadership literature (Avery, 2011). Theorists have examined organizational leadership across wide-ranging, though often overlapping, paradigms (Avery, 2011). Examination of these paradigms reveals three generalized lenses: leader-centric, interactionalist, and organic. Likewise, three lines of description have emerged regarding EL, though they overlap significantly and borrow from each other conceptually.

Leader-centric Lens

The leader-centric approach has explored the characteristics, attributes, and behaviors of effective leaders. Examples of well-researched characteristics include charisma (Conger & Kanungo, 1998) and intelligence (Judge et al., 2004), attributes include skills and competencies (Boyatzis, 1982), and behaviors include influence tactics (Lee et al., 2017) and transformational leadership (Bass, 1985). In this paradigm, the goal is to uncover the secret sauce for identifying
or developing effective leaders. Scholars have described the leader-centric literature as overly reliant on cognition and rationality and sought to address this gap by describing how leaders experience, make sense of, and influence situations through the body. In this view, EL is positioned as an alternative to disembodied views of leadership.

The leader-centric view of EL draws on somatics and mindfulness research to promote development of leader skills in self-awareness, external awareness, self-reflection, and self-regulation. Leader-centric EL approaches have emphasized the value of embodied knowledge as a tool to improve leader self-awareness and internal alignment through heightened sensory awareness and regulation of physiological cues (Briers, 2015; Hamill, 2011; Szelwach, 2020). In doing so, scholars propose that leadership is practiced as a more embodied and open way of being that enables a leader to produce successful results (Karssiens et al., 2014). Scholarly and practice work in this area is focused primarily in the areas of coaching (Blake, 2009; Hamill, 2013), organization development (Kenward, 2018; Szelwach, 2020), and human resource development (Briers, 2015). Scholars of management education have also called for a shift from purely cognitive learning approaches to more bodily-focused learning (Rigg, 2018; Schuyler, 2010). Through EL practices, it is proposed that leaders can connect more readily with bodily wisdom to lead and influence others more intentionally for positive change.

Interactionist Lens

The interactionist approach has examined the relationship between leaders and followers. For example, organizational research on social exchange (Graen et al., 1982), power (Pfeffer, 1981), and trust (Burke et al., 2007) investigates the formation, maintenance, and outcomes of effective and ineffective leader-follower relationships. In this paradigm, the goal is to understand how leaders and followers interact within situations (e.g., context and culture) to achieve positive outcomes. This lens has challenged leader-centric views of one-way downward influence processes by proposing that leader and follower actions and reactions mutually influence each other (Griffin et al., 1987). Leaders and followers engage in patterns of behavior (e.g., dialogue, symbols, and gesture) which form their relational co-existence (Cunliffe & Eriksen, 2011; Bathurst & Cain, 2013). Environmental cues, along with the normative expectations of each party, influence the perception of behaviors and responses to create shared experiences and meaning. The role expectations of leader and follower are not fixed, but mutually agreed to, based on the development of shared meaning (Ladkin, 2013).

Research on leadership aesthetics describes embodiment as the visceral display inherent in leadership acts (Ladkin, 2008). Of central importance to interactionist views is the space between leaders and followers, where interactional variables such as trust, power, and control manifest and are perceived by both parties (Ladkin, 2008). Recognizing a scholarly gap in the embodied enactment of leadership behaviors and its effect on the space between leaders and followers, Ladkin (2006, 2008, 2013) explored how perception of the physical display of leadership leads to the felt experiences of followers (Ladkin, 2013). Commonly researched leader attributes, such as charisma or authenticity, are thought to exist not within the leader, but in the perception of others based on the congruence of leader behavior with organizational and societal norms (Ladkin, 2006, 2008).

The physical enactment of leader-like displays (i.e., mastery and purpose) align the leader and the led within the context of a situation (Ladkin, 2006). The bodily experience of a leadership performance is central to and inseparable from how the leader and followers collectively experience cognitive and emotional elements of a leadership situation. To be effective, embodied leaders must be aware of their authentic self and the situation, and then engage in an intentional display of behaviors which meet situational leadership expectations (Ladkin & Taylor, 2010a). The body serves as a mechanism through which leaders align their authentic self with the situation in an intentional display of leadership to others.
Organic Lens

The third paradigm considers leadership an organic phenomenon, whereby leadership emerges from social groups through collective identification and mutually agreed upon contextual sense-making (Avery, 2011). Examples include distributive leadership (Spillane et al., 2001), shared leadership (Pearce & Sims, 2000), and leadership-as-practice (Raelin, 2003). The goal is to understand the mechanisms and social processes through which leadership emerges to align and direct the efforts of a social unit. The organic lens challenges views of leadership as residing within individuals or roles by proposing that leadership is a dynamic role-making process whereby collective agreement and sensemaking allow groups to align efforts to achieve goals (Collinson, 2018; Lord & Shondrick, 2011; Raelin, 2020). While the interactionist lens posits role-making processes, the leader and follower are fixed positions within the relationship. The organic view differs by suggesting any member of the group may assume a situationally bound leadership role based on the demands of the leadership situation. Scholars have discussed the relationship between embodied practices, embodied leadership, and embodied leaderful practices (Raelin, 2020; Fisher & Robbins, 2015).

Embodiment, as viewed through an organic lens, is the sensory awareness of a leadership situation, which both creates the need for leadership and sets boundary conditions on leaderful behavior (Fisher & Robbins, 2015). Leadership emerges within a specific social setting in response to a particular set of environmental demands to enable collective change and ongoing goal accomplishment (Raelin, 2020). Embodied leaderful practices shift thinking from hierarchy, organizational entities, and designations as leader or follower to shared frameworks of direction, alignment, cooperation, and adaption within which individuals work together to co-evolve their collective future (Day & Drath, 2012). There is no fixed prototype for leader or follower, and group members move dynamically between roles based on shifting contextual demands (Day & Drath, 2012). The body, therefore, serves as sensor and symbol for understanding and responding to the demands of the environment and the interactions between self, others, and the environment (Fisher & Robbins, 2015).

To summarize, scholars have integrated embodiment into the leadership literature, without explicitly defining it, to address critical gaps in at least three established leadership paradigms. The leader-centric approach has introduced somatics as a mechanism for increasing leader self-awareness, self-regulation, and internal alignment. The interactionist approach has explored the aesthetics of embodied leader behavior to explain the interactive space between leaders and followers. The organic approach has examined the body as sensor and symbol which enables collective leadership through dynamic sensemaking processes in complex social interactions. The next section provides a definition of EL to integrate the three diverse views.

FUTURE DIRECTIONS: AN EXPLORATORY MODEL OF EL

To advance the study of EL, proposed relationships are discussed at a conceptual level and supportive examples of well-established construct relationships are given to support the generalized propositions implicit in the model. Four characteristics should be considered when judging the novelty, value, and pragmatism of this exploratory model. First, the model is dynamic and iterates at multiple points. Leadership is not a linear process and extant models of leadership generally fail to capture the dynamism of leadership in real-world situations. Second, the model begins with an environmental cue. Leadership is not an omnipresent phenomenon, but rather a response to environmental demands; leaders are not always leading. In practice, many contemporary models of leadership likely do more harm than good due to an overemphasis of leadership in the performance of organizational roles and resultant change for the sake of change. Third, leadership is not a singular process. A group might be undergoing several leadership situations at a single point in time, or no leadership situations during more stable times. This
means multiple group members may be assuming a variety of leadership roles at one time in response to different demands the group is facing and shared agreement about who is leading each. Below, the exploratory conceptual model of EL is divided into three sections describing the leadership situation, leadership enactment, and leadership outcomes.

**The Leadership Situation**

The leadership situation includes contextual inputs which interact to manifest in the individual sensory awareness and cognitive perception of an environmental change requiring group response. Groups exist as both static structures and adaptive systems, which change and are changed by their dynamic internal and external environments (McGrath et al., 2000). Changes to the internal environment, such as adding a new member, create varying levels of risk and uncertainty for the group by threatening established internal alignment in norms, value, and shared meaning (Schaubroeck et al., 2013). Similarly, groups face innumerable changes of varying magnitude in the external environment. Each of these changes represents some degree of uncertainty and risk, as the creation of potential for misalignment between the group and its relevant stakeholders (Sweet, 2020). The dynamic nature of contemporary organizations and increasing reliance on groups as the predominant work structure has led to increased need for leadership of and within groups to meet the challenges of contemporary work environments (Sundstrom et al., 2000).

Deep-structured characteristics, such as values, personality, or socio-emotional intelligence leadership, likely influence which environmental cues an individual senses and perceives. The environmental change creates the potential for leadership but is not independently adequate to enable a leadership situation. The environmental cue must be sensed (i.e., bodily) and then perceived (i.e., cognitively) before leadership can be enacted. A large body of literature has examined the role deep-structured characteristics, such as general mental ability, emotional intelligence, and personality, play in leadership effectiveness (e.g., Bono & Judge, 2004; Judge et al., 2004; Miao et al., 2018; Mills, 2009). An individual’s ability to sense and perceive environmental cues creates and restricts their available range of actions as a leader. The role of environmental cues in the leadership situation presented here is consistent with the interactionist view of leadership as momentary (Ladkin, 2010) and the organic view of leadership as emerging from within the group based on the need (Raelin, 2016).

**Leadership Enactment**

Leadership enactment begins when an individual senses and perceives an opportunity and assumes a leadership role within their group in response to an environmental cue. Through self-reflection, the individual assesses whether they possess the expertise, power, authority, and other characteristics needed to lead the group. An individual, regardless of formal position or title, must have the situationally bound ability, motivation, and opportunity to lead or they will not perceive themselves as capable of taking on a leadership role for the group. Individual leadership role expectations are affected by situtated individual characteristics, which vary based on the leadership situation and predict leader emergence (Ensari et al., 2011). Examples of situated characteristics include situation specific knowledge and skills, as well as stress, anxiety, arousal, and exhaustion. A group member is likely to take on the leadership role based on the congruence of their perception of the leadership needs of the group and their situated characteristics relative to those needs (Raelin, 2016).

The relationship between sensing and perceiving a leadership situation and assuming a leadership role is also affected by the leadership role expectations of the group. Groups share mutually understood referents which enable the establishment of shared values, beliefs, and behavioral norms (Fine & Hallett, 2014). Members are more likely to be given leadership roles when they match group prototypes and embody key aspects of group identity (Van Knippenberg,
For example, groups embedded in bureaucracies may recognize outsized power, authority, and responsibility in an assigned leader, rendering the emergence of organic leadership from other more capable members unlikely (Collinson, 2018). Therefore, a group member who has sensed and perceived an environmental cue requiring a group response is likely to assume a leadership role if they view themselves as possessing the requisite situated characteristics and if they are able to meet group leadership role expectations.

Recognition of internal cognitive and affective states, as captured in the practices of somatics and mindfulness, enables effective regulation so that displayed leader behaviors can match leadership role expectations. Assuming a leadership role arouses wide-ranging cognitive, affective, and bodily stimuli that can overwhelm an individual with excitement, anticipation, anxiety, stress, and other responses which can enable or derail leaderful behavior (Hamill, 2013). Engaging in leaderful behavior requires maintaining internal alignment through active recognition of thoughts and feelings and regulation of bodily responses, as required, to display situationally appropriate leadership.

Leaderful behavior is intentionally and authentically displayed action directed at achieving positive change to maintain or regain group alignment in response to an environmental cue. Leaderful behavior is not one-way downward influence, but rather a dynamic interaction. Leaders and followers interact through their bodily presence and movement through situations, such that their identities are interwoven, and one cannot exist without the other (Ladkin, 2010). An example of leaderful behavior is sensemaking. As stated earlier, leadership situations create uncertainty for groups. In response to uncertainty, leaders engage in sensemaking to reduce fear and anxiety and enable decision making processes by clarifying the situation for followers (Ancona, 2012; Springborg, 2010). Sensemaking may occur through bodily sensations and emotions (Springborg, 2010) to reduce group paralysis from fear in an uncertain environment. Leaderful behavior might include responding to followers’ sensemaking needs to manage tensions between old and new to facilitate navigation through group change (Sparr, 2018). Embodied leadership, therefore, requires recognition and regulation of cognitive, affective, and bodily responses that may derail display of leaderful behavior that is consistent with the leadership role expectations of the individual assuming the leadership role.

Leadership Outcomes

As noted earlier, leaderful behavior is interactive, and each behavior has the potential to influence the situated characteristics of the leader as well as role expectations of followers through the felt experience of leadership. The enactment of leadership is embodied as a social process of mutual influence between leaders and followers such that it engenders a felt, visceral response from those engaged with it (Ladkin, 2013). Leaders monitor their own and others’ bodily responses to intentionally and authently display leaderful behaviors which are then felt internally by the leader and by those who interact within the leadership situation (Karssiens et al., 2014; Szelwach, 2020). Positive felt leadership experiences likely have positive effects on situated leadership characteristics such as motivation to lead (Chan & Drasgow, 2001) and perceived leadership competence (Hamill, 2013). Similarly, group leadership role expectations are likely changed by positive felt experiences, which may modify collective implicit views of the leader prototype (Chan & Drasgow, 2001) and increase trust in shared leadership practices (Drescher et al., 2014).

Through the felt leadership experience, leaderful behavior increases feelings of trust between the leader and the group, which aligns and engages others in meaningful efforts to meet group needs (Ladkin 2013; Raelin, 2011). The group and the leader perceive leaderful behavior as authentic, appropriate, and/or effective, or as inconsistent with their own leadership expectations (Ladkin and Taylor, 2010a). The actions of the leader are aimed at maintaining or regaining alignment to meet the demands of an environmental cue. EL enables group motivation
towards meaningful change by engendering shared meaning, trust, and commitment to changing the group or its environment in a way that leads to continued alignment with critical stakeholders and processes to ensure the group’s ongoing survival, performance, and effectiveness. As noted above, groups affect and are affected by their environments. EL is a response to an environmental cue that presents a group with a threat or opportunity, i.e., a requirement to change to maintain alignment with its environment. The generalized outcome of EL, therefore, is an effective change which results in group (re)alignment. Therefore, the last iterative element of the model is a change to the leadership situation, such that the group and the environment are altered.

CONCLUSION

The ambitious goal of this paper is to integrate three conceptualizations of EL in the current literature, define the concept of EL, and provide an exploratory conceptual model to inspire stimulate future research in the area. This paper is not intended to develop an EL construct or to provide specific testable hypotheses. Indeed, many of the proposed relationships are well-established in the literature and dozens of constructs with broad, established literatures support the model as presented. Instead, the provided model is offered as a tool for integrating existing theorizing, which exists primarily at a conceptual level. Future researchers should advance the ideas presented in this paper by dissecting subsections of the generalized propositions to review and integrate construct-level hypotheses which can empirically validate or disprove the model as provided.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
A STUDY ON THE INFLUENCE OF MANAGERS TRUST TO EMPLOYEE ALTRUISM'S IMPACT ON CSR PARTICIPATION AND OCBS

JEFF BARLAND
University of Dallas
jbarland@udallas.edu

INTRODUCTION

Employee productivity, talent recruitment and retention are important management-related issues that organizations contend with every day. CSR programs are partially intended to improve productivity, support talent recruitment and retention through better supporting employee desires to volunteer, connect with their peers, and their communities. Employee altruism is an important element to consider when evaluating an organizations CSR program as people that are not predisposed to participant in CSR can impact the expected benefits. Employees must also be aware that the CSR programs exist for them to decide whether they are interested in participating. Employee trust in the manager in the organization can impact the success of these CSR efforts and can diminish the firm’s efforts to better connect and identify with employees. Since employees have more direct interaction with their direct managers, I will consider how different levels of Employee Trust in their Managers influence OCB and employee participation associated with the organizations CSR efforts as my topic for the research question in this paper.

RESEARCH QUESTION & HYPOTHESIS

How does employee trust in their managers influence employee participation in CSR programs and their OCB?

H1: Lower levels of Employee Trust in Managers negatively influences the relationship between Employee Altruism and OCB intention

H2: Lower levels of Employee Trust in Managers negatively affects the relationship between Employee Altruism and Employee Participation in CSR Programs

H3: Higher levels of Employee Altruism positively correlates with OCB Intention

H4: Higher levels of Employee Altruism positively correlates with Employee Participation in CSR Programs

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

Leadership Theory

The leadership theory integrated into the research is Servant Leadership Theory. Ethical Leadership is also found in the literature and further informs employee trust in their managers. Servant leadership supports a manager’s ability to foster employee trust in a dyadic relationship in the workplace. I have hypothesized that this employee trust in their managers works as a moderator between the relationships between employee altruism and organizational citizenship behaviors intention.

Employee Altruism (IV)

The main point of this article is to introduce sensemaking into the portfolio of research conducted on CSR to better understand how employee altruism and sensemaking/meaningfulness influences employee behaviors towards CSR efforts. The research considers how employees look for meaning in their work and how that connects to their behaviors towards organizational CSR efforts which can help bring employees closer to their organizations resulting in positive employee behaviors like OCB. The study contributes to the understanding of individual level CSR behaviors by introducing a new conceptual framework connecting employee level CSR interests with their attempts to pursue meaningfulness. This study is relevant to my research question as it is focused on Employee Altruism, micro-CSR and offers a compelling framework to consider in evaluating employee behaviors associated with CSR perception.


The purpose of this research is to consolidate and analyze micro level CSR study findings to better understand how and why employee’s altruism is related to organizational CSR efforts. This study synthesizes and consolidates past fragmented research on individual level CSR behaviors to further understanding of the foundational theories and help support future research consolidation. The research supports past micro level CSR research through theory and method consolidation and focuses on the two dominant theories, Social Identity Theory and Social Exchange Theory, to help target future researchers. This study is relevant to my research question as it is focused on Employee Altruism, micro-CSR, compiles many recent studies for review, and considers Social Exchange Theory which aligns with my CSR theory interests.

Employee Trust in Managers (MV)


The central theme of this study is to evaluate the role of servant leadership on dyadic trust relationships within the organization. This empirical study uses a survey approach to gather data from two financial groups to analyze how ethical leadership affects manager trust in the workplace and organizational performance. This study is important as it effectively links servant leadership and its influence on interpersonal trust in the workplace on performance. This article is relevant to my research question as it considers the dyadic trust relationship between employees and their managers (Employee Trust in Managers) while also considering servant leaderships influence as well.


The central point of the study is that ethical leadership influences employee’s perception to the organizations CSR programs and their trust in the company resulting in OCBs while unethical leadership has the opposite effect. The research used a multi-level empirical approach using data from supervisors and employees in China and found that there is a strong positive influence on OCBs correlated to ethical leadership behaviors. Although substantial research has been conducted on CSR and the resulting impact on employees’ behaviors relative to resulting OCB, this study contributes the inclusion of trust as a mediator at the employee level, which is a
contribution to the overall knowledge on CSR impacts to employees. This article is relevant to my research question as it links several of my variables (CSR, Employee Trust in Managers & OCB) while also utilizing trust as a mediating variable as well as evaluating the data at the employee level and using Ethical Leadership Theory.

**Employee Participation in CSR (DV)**


The main point of the study is that CSR efforts have a strong positive effect on the organizations perceived reputation among consumers. The research uses Expectation Confirmation Theory to evaluate CSR communication impact to corporate reputation using CSR Participation, Trust in CSR Commitment and Engagement as mediating variables to better understand how CSR communication affects the company’s reputation. This study fills a gap in research by empirically analyzing CSR communication and its impact on organizational reputation using existing instruments as well as political approaches, which is an interesting avenue to explore. Although this study takes an external look at CSR impact, it is relevant still to my research question as it links several of my variables (CSR Participation and Org Trust) while also utilizing trust as a mediating variable as well while utilizing a different theory, Expectation Confirmation Theory, as a framework.


The main point of this study is to compile previous research and conduct meta-analysis to determine how employee participation in CSR impacts their behaviors and considers what variables work best as mediators and moderators. The authors use Social Exchange Theory and 86 studies at the micro-CSR level to analysis and evaluate what constructs are most frequently used: organizational justice, organizational trust, and organizational identification. Previous research focuses mainly on organizational level outcomes of CSR and categorizes CSR into several categories, including internal and external focuses, the authors of this study fill a gap in research by focusing on micro level CSR and evaluating employee perception of CSR efforts. This study is relevant to my research question as it is focused on micro-CSR and compiles many recent studies links several of my variables (CSR Participation, Org Trust, and OCB), while considering Social Exchange Theory as a framework like I am.

**Organizational Citizenship Behaviors (DV)**


The main purpose of the research was to examine the impact of CSR perceptions on employee OCB in the tourism industry in Turkey. The purpose of the study was to better understand the linkage between CSR perception and OCB using job satisfaction as a mediator, which was not supported in their findings. This study builds on the strong research already conducted evaluating CSR perception to OCB using Social Identity Theory and adds the consideration of Job Satisfaction as a potential mediating influence. This article is relevant to my research question as it links several of my variables (CSR & OCB) while also utilizing Social Identity Theory as a framework, which is also considered in my research, as well as factoring in (ruling out) job satisfaction as a potential mediating variable.

The main purpose of this research is to further develop existing research on employee attitudes and behaviors on organizational CSR programs (environmental, social & sustainable). The authors use Social Identity Theory as a framework (Fairly common for CSR research) and conducted an empirical study using 250 employees from several German companies. The study builds on existing research by continuing to leverage Social Identity Theory as a framework to explore employee perceptions of CSR in organizations and considers Organizational Identification as a mediator to better understand the importance employees place on the CSR programs to determine participation. This article is relevant to my research question as it links several of my variables (CSR & OCB) while also utilizing Social Identity Theory as a framework, which is also considered in my research, as well as considers the additional variable of Organizational Identification to evaluate value to employees.

**METHODOLODY**

This study will use a quantitative study design utilizing empirical data that will be acquired using surveys so that I can operationalize the findings. It will utilize statistical measures in SPSS and AMOS to analyze and test all the hypotheses. Using a quantitative design method will help us understand whether the hypotheses are supported, as well as the overall strength of the correlation in the analysis. This study design will allow us to evaluate with a statistically high degree of certainly how the variables relate to each other. I also recognize that a limitation is that I will not be able to apply inductive reasoning and develop richer analysis as I could if I took a more qualitative approach.

This study will be seeking to better understand how manager or supervisor trust moderates the relationship between employee altruism with their participation in CSR and their intention to conduct OCB. It will also evaluate how employee altruism affects employee participation in CSR mediates as well as OCB intention in the model. Employee trust in their managers as a moderator of employee altruism differentiates this analysis from prior research and focusing on a quantitative approach, and I also expect that utilizing existing instruments help protects against validity weaknesses. Another important step in the process is the random sampling that I will employ. This research will also further develop social exchange theory which considers that each person enters a situation expecting a fair and reasonable exchange. In the hypotheses I expect that employees will exchange intention to conduct OCBs and participate in CSR programs in exchange for the organization providing a safe, trusting environment for them to work in.

**Procedure**

This study will utilize an online survey process to gather data from employees in US grocery companies that conduct CSR efforts. MTurk is an effective tool for gathering participants to surveys quickly and effectively. All surveys will have full disclosure as to the purpose of the study and how the responses will be kept confidential for all participants. The survey will use several existing instruments to gather data on all the model constructs to assess and determine if the hypotheses are supported. Once the data is captured and cleaned, I will utilize SPSS and AMOS to conduct the CFA, correlation analysis, and Structured Equation Modeling to assess model fit as well as to perform data quality checks.

**Sampling**
I will send out the survey developed from previous instruments measuring all the variables, a cover letter containing the purpose stating how the responses will be used, and a statement guaranteeing confidentiality of participants along with what steps will be taken to ensure any personal information is protected. The survey will be sent to a list of employees at several of the largest US grocery retailers that currently conduct CSR programs (Walmart, Kroger, HEB, and Publix).

The total number of surveys that will be sent out is 1,000 to ensure I collect enough responses to be statistically relevant and generalizable. The total list of employees will consider age, gender, and tenure to ensure that all facets of these groups are effectively represented, and no group is marginalized in the results. I will also ensure that all areas of the organization are represented included in the surveys and that no specific level or tier of the organization is over or underrepresented. Tenure is another factor that will be captured and considered for analysis in the model.

**Instruments**

*Independent Variable: Employee Altruism*

Understanding how predisposed employees are to supporting CSR efforts is important to the study. I expect that employees that are uninterested in charitable efforts will be unlikely to participate in an organizations CSR effort and will not show significant changes in OCB. Employee altruism will be measured using an existing instrument that contains 5 questions and uses a Likerd scale (7 points: 1 = “strongly disagree” to 7 = “Strongly agree”) developed by Podsakoff et al. (1990). The authors of this scale found TLI = .94, which is good for the 5-factor model. See Table 3.

*Moderating Variable: Employee Trust of Managers*

In my hypothesis (H1) “Lower levels of Employee Trust in Managers negatively influences the relationship between Employee Altruism and OCB intention” I consider the importance of trust in the employee/manager relationship between their altruism and OCB intention. I propose to measure this dynamic using a model in SPSS and leveraging a previously developed scale. Employee trust in their managers will be measured using an existing instrument that contains 3 questions and uses a Likerd scale (7 points: 1 = “totally disagree” to 7 = “totally agree”) developed by Giessner, S.R. and Knippenberg, D. (2008). See Table 2.

*Dependent Variables: Employee Participation in CSR Programs*

For organizations to see a beneficial internal impact related to CSR programs, their employees need to actively participate in the CSR programs. I hypothesize that employees’ participation in CSR efforts will be the result of Employee Altruism and be moderated by their trust in their managers. Employee participation in CSR will be measured using an existing instrument that contains 5 questions and uses a Likerd scale (9 points: 1 = “strongly disagree” to 7 = “strongly agree”) developed by Menon, S. and Kahn, B.E. (2003). The scale had a strong Cronbach Apha: (.77 - .83) showing it to be a viable scale for the use. See Table 4.

*Dependent Variables: Organizational Citizenship Behaviors*

Organizational Citizenship Behavior will be measured using a preexisting 5 question Likerd scale (6 points: 1 = “not correct” to 6 = “totally correct”) developed by van Dick, R. et al (2008). This survey has been cited by other studies and contains useful questions like “I help colleagues with heavy workloads”. The authors found that this scale showed good reliability (Cronbach Alpha = .76) and discriminant validity. See Table 1.

**FINDINGS**
Some of the limitations of my study will be that since it was not conducted over several time periods I do not know if the results would change over time. I also will not conduct an experiment so I cannot determine if a remedy would potentially impact the results. Qualitative feedback will not be included in or data collection, so it is not possible to determine “why” respondents responded in the way that they did. Including open ended questions in future research can help researchers better understand why and how respondents feel the way that they do and could provide for a richer analysis.

The results will address a gap in literature by analyzing the influence of employee trust in their managers on CSR participation at the employee level of organizations as well as their intention to perform OCBs. Organizations invest considerable funds towards their CSR programs and lack of participation or OCBs impacts their internal return on their investment. Managers with direct reports should consider if they are cultivating a strong trusting environment at work and the negative implications if they fail to do so. Further research is encouraged so that managers and organizations can make necessary changes in training that will help drive employee participation in CSR programs and their intention to provide OCB’s.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
THE ROLE OF POSITIONAL AUTHORITY AND INFLUENCE IN SERVANT LEADERSHIP

Elliott Long
Aflac Incorporated

Kevin J. Hurt
Columbus State University

INTRODUCTION

A large portion of servant leadership literature is dedicated to understanding specific characteristics that embody and demonstrate the true essence of servant leadership and objectively measuring these characteristics via models (Van Dierendonck, 2011; Laub, 1999; Page & Wong, 2000; Russell & Stone, 2002; Patterson, 2003; Barbuto & Wheeler, 2006; Wong & Davey, 2007; Beck, 2014). While each model is valuable, none account for a highly-impactful contextual factor that can influence servant leadership’s positive effect on organizational performance: the positional authority held by the servant leader. Servant leaders may find this gap in the literature rather surprising considering the importance of context for leadership. Indeed, certain personal characteristics can contribute to leadership success, but it is often the application of those characteristics within a specific context that define great success (Mayo, 2013).

There is a need to understand the contextual factors that influence the success of a servant leader. We contend that positional authority is one such important contextual variable that moderates the servant leadership-organizational performance relationship. We also acknowledge that positional authority is not something all leaders possess, which suggests that there is a need to understand how servant leaders can implement servant leadership principles in the absence of said positional authority. This led to the creation of the two research questions guiding this conceptual paper. First, how does positional authority moderate the servant leadership-organizational performance relationship? Second, how can practitioners implement servant leadership in the absence of positional authority?

Figure 1. Influence of positional authority and influence on the servant leadership – organizational performance relationship

1 Disclaimer: The views expressed in this presentation are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views or opinions of Aflac Incorporated, its affiliates or subsidiaries.
This manuscript analyzes implications from upper echelon theory as well as research on the performance of organizations whose executive team practices servant leadership to answer the first research question. To answer the second research question, the servant leadership of Jesus Christ is examined and four principles are mined which can then be applied by present-day servant leaders when positional authority is lacking. The conceptual model guiding this manuscript is depicted in Figure 1.

THEORY AND DEVELOPMENT OF PROPOSITIONS

Foundations of Servant Leadership

Servant leadership may be defined as “an understanding and practice of leadership that places the good of those led over the self-interest of the leader” (Laub, 1999; Laub, 2004). A term officially coined by Robert Greenleaf (1970), servant leadership entails deliberate decisions to serve others, putting followers’ needs, interests, and aspirations above one’s own. The self-concept construct under servant leadership is to view one’s role as a leader akin to servant or steward as opposed to leader or owner (Sendjaya & Sarros, 2002).

Servant Leadership and Organizational Performance

Servant leadership and organizational performance are not mutually exclusive. Rather, a focus on organizational performance is a prerequisite for servant leadership, as vision, direction, and goals are much needed context for servant leadership implementation (Blanchard, 1998). Servant leadership enables better organizational performance through its attention given to the vision, direction, and goals of the organization (Blanchard, 1998) as well as the through the trust that is built among followers when practicing servant leadership (Greenleaf, 1970; Yang, Liu, & Gu, 2017). As such, the following proposition is put forth:

Proposition 1: Servant leadership is positively associated with increased organizational performance.

The Impact of Positional Authority on the Servant Leadership-Organizational Performance Relationship

The impact of positional authority on the servant leadership-organizational performance relationship can be better understood by analyzing upper echelon theory (Hambrick & Mason, 1984) as well as research on the performance of organizations whose executive team practices servant leadership, both of which focus on individuals who possess the highest degree of positional authority. By putting subordinates first and empowering them to grow and succeed as persons – which Greenleaf (1970) describes as the ultimate measure of servant leadership – executives practicing servant leadership can trigger a healthy reciprocal exchange whereby the lower-ranking team members mimic the focus on others people’s needs that is modeled by the executives. Similarly, the emphasis on personal integrity and honesty is typically well received by subordinates and thus, reciprocated (Peterson, 2012). Additionally, the natural emphasis of clarity with regards to the organization’s goals, strategic direction, and potential threats to success that ensues when servant leadership is practiced can help drive this increase in organizational performance. With these conditions in place, employees at varying levels collaborate with one another and build a stronger commitment to organizational success (Liden, 2008; Peterson 2012). As such, the following proposition is put forth:

Proposition 2: Positional authority positively moderates the relationship between servant leadership and organizational performance.
Cultivating and Leveraging Influence in the Absence of Positional Authority

Lack of positional authority, whether it stems from company policy, a lack of understanding of servant leadership, or organizational culture, constitutes an autonomy gap that is a stern barrier to effective leadership (Adamowski, Therriault, & Cavanna, 2007; Savage-Austin & Honeycutt, 2011). One solution that current or aspiring servant leaders who lack positional authority can use to account for this lack of authority is to cultivate influence before positional authority is attained, recognizing that influence is the currency of all forms of leadership. Once influence is cultivated, servant leadership practitioners can then leverage that influence (Scroggins, 2017).

To move from theory to pragmatism, consider the example of Jesus Christ, who had no positional authority as part of a literal incorporated entity; yet became the cornerstone of the (worldwide) Christian faith (Ephesians 2:20; Luke 20:17) and was effective in improving the performance of his followers (Manz, 2011; Whittington, Pitts, Kageler, & Goodwin, 2005). A carpenter by profession (Mark 6:3), Jesus Christ led a multi-faceted revolution for the ages – the impacts of which are still being felt in business, government, and faith circles across the world 2,000 years later – despite having no positional authority over those he led. He was not on the executive staff of a literal organization or entity, nor did he hold a position of authority in government. Instead, Jesus Christ “offered a leadership model devoid of positional authority, prestige, and ambition” (Wilson, 2011, p.93). Where he lacked in positional authority, Jesus more than accounted for in the influence he cultivated and leveraged through four key steps. The first step – clean the mirror image – refers to mastering the art of leading oneself first in order to lay the foundation for leading others. The second step – lead others with compassion – refers to treating other people with the utmost respect and empathy. The third step – lead others to be their best selves – refers to a commitment to unleash the untapped potential in others so that they increase their performance. Finally, the fourth step – plant golden mustard seeds – refers to understanding the power of small “seeds” (e.g., habits, deeds, etc.) because those small seeds can lead to great and powerful results over time (Manz, 2011). The same four steps Jesus took in his leadership journey can be implemented by present-day servant leaders who lack positional authority yet desire to positively impact the performance of their organization or less-formalized team. Therefore, the following proposition is put forth:

**Proposition 3:** Cultivating and leveraging influence in the absence of positional authority positively moderates the relationship between servant leadership and organizational performance.

**Future Research**

The current manuscript suggests the relationship between servant leadership and organizational performance is positively moderated by positional authority. In order to validate the claims made in this manuscript, empirical studies are required in order to close the gap between theory and practice. While research exists as it pertains to upper echelon theory and the performance of organizations whose executive team practices servant leadership, no specific studies have been performed specifically targeted towards the gap addressed in this manuscript. Therefore, a longitudinal study comparing servant leaders with positional authority and without positional authority across comparable organizations or team settings would be extremely valuable to the field of servant leadership. Further, studies directed at objectively measuring the success and identifying best practices with regards to the four steps referenced above that Jesus Christ implemented in order to leverage and cultivate influence in the absence of positional authority would help to further legitimize the third proposition in this manuscript.

**CONCLUSION**
Individuals with a high degree of positional authority have a disproportionate impact on organizational performance (Hambrick, 1994). Similarly, when executives implement servant leadership, organizational performance is positively impacted (Peterson, 2012). Pragmatically speaking, these individuals have extremely high levels of authority to implement their own ideas, do not face as many internal obstacles from executing on their ideas, and lower-ranked individuals often mimic their behavior (Yukl, 2010; Yaffe & Kark, 2011). As such, positional authority can positively moderate the relationship between servant leadership and organizational performance, and thus is an important consideration when evaluating this relationship. Servant leaders add value to organizations and less-formalized teams by helping increase organizational performance (Blanchard, 1998). While positional authority can help servant leaders it should not be considered a necessity (Scroggins, 2017). Using the example of Jesus Christ, influence can be cultivated and leveraged in the absence of positional authority to demonstrate servant leadership and, in doing so, help increase organizational performance.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
THE HAZARDS OF UNETHICAL EXPERIENCES: THE SERIAL IMPACT OF MORAL INJURY ON WORK-RELATED STRESS, TRAUMA-INDUCED ILL-BEING, AND MORAL POST-TRAUMATIC STRESS DISORDER

ROBERT A. GIACALONE
Boler College of Business
John Carroll University
rgiacalone@jcu.edu

SEAN R. VALENTINE
University of North Dakota

Abstract: Using ethical impact theory (EIT) and data collected from business professionals, this study explored the relationships among moral injury (MI), work-related stress, trauma-induced ill-being, and moral post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). The serial mediation analysis indicated that MI was positively related to stress, and that both MI and stress were positively related to ill-being. MI, stress, and ill-being were also positively related to moral PTSD. Finally, the results indicated that MI indirectly influenced PTSD through stress and ill-being, suggesting that MI progressively affects multiple adverse work experiences.

INTRODUCTION

Research has shown that there is the potential for unethical experiences to harm the employees’ psychological, emotional, and physical welfare, thus causing other ancillary challenges that managers must address (Giacalone & Promislo, 2012). Based on a comprehensive review of interdisciplinary research (Giacalone & Promislo, 2010) across several types of unethical acts (e.g., discrimination, bullying, and injustice), EIT (Promislo et al., 2013) suggests that unethical workplace behavior can result in diminished well-being. Further, EIT proposes that unethical work behaviors of all types will result in a host of psychological, physical, and social dysfunctions (Giacalone & Promislo, 2010).

While EIT has focused on moral transgressions related to business organizations and employees, a parallel literature has developed in psychology to investigate MI. The term was first used by Shay (1994) to understand the moral challenges and suffering of war veterans subjected to a combat theater of operations and was popularized in the social sciences in a seminal review of the concept by Litz et al. (2009). MI refers to individual experiences in which a person learns about, witnesses, fails to stop, and/or perpetuates situations that significantly violate personal moral beliefs (Drescher et al., 2011; Litz et al., 2009). These ethical transgressions are framed in terms of potentially morally injurious events (PMIEs) that are traumatic and disturbing (Jinkerson & Battles, 2019).

The purpose of this study is to integrate and extend understanding of the MI concept with EIT (Promislo et al., 2013) to more clearly understand how MI may substantially diminish individual well-being in the business setting. Using a sample of business professionals, the relationships among individuals’ self-reported MI, work-related stress, negative physical symptoms/fatigue (i.e., trauma-induced ill-being), and morally-induced PTSD are assessed in a serial manner.

LITERATURE REVIEW AND HYPOTHESES

In the EIT model, stress and trauma are hypothesized to play a pivotal role in the emergence of diminished well-being; these factors also play a pivotal role in the MI literature. As
such, both the literature in MI and EIT would predict that increases in MI should be associated with increases in a host of different forms of poor well-being, which should include stress, in both its more routine (e.g., work stress) and traumatic forms, and various forms of physical symptomatology. Elevated work-related stress should also result in generalized ill-being associated with the negative symptoms and fatigue that are triggered by experienced trauma.

Hypothesis 1: Elevated moral injury is associated with increased work-related stress.

Hypothesis 2: Elevated moral injury is associated with increased trauma-induced ill-being.

Hypothesis 3: Increased work-related stress is associated with increased trauma-induced ill-being.

The EIT model sees both stress and trauma as two possible mediators of the relationship between ethical transgressions (e.g., PMIEs) and impact on well-being. EIT hypothesizes that stress plays a role as a function of several issues. Employee perceptions and appraisal of unethical behaviors determine stress and the resulting decreases in well-being (Jackson et al., 2006) rather than the actual content of unethical acts themselves. Trauma from unethical behavior is also associated with poor well-being. People traumatized are disproportionately associated with serious mental and physical effects (Gerrity et al., 2001; North et al., 2002).

Trauma, however, plays a unique role in the MI literature. A consistent finding in that literature is that self-reported exposure to PMIEs correlates with PTSD, the many comorbidities associated with PTSD (Nash, 2019; Neria & Pickover, 2019), and other negative health behaviors predicted by EIT (Frankfurt & Frazier, 2016; Killgore et al., 2008). If we are to make a theoretically meaningful association between PTSD resulting from ethical transgressions and well-being, we argue that measurement must be focused solely on PTSD specifically as a function of moral transgressions and the moral emotions they evoke. In this study, we isolate PTSD that is caused specifically by ethical transgressions.

Hypothesis 4: Elevated moral injury is associated with higher moral PTSD, either directly or indirectly through work-related stress and trauma-induced ill-being.

Hypothesis 5: Increased work-related stress is associated with higher moral PTSD.

Hypothesis 6: Increased trauma-induced ill-being is associated with higher moral PTSD.

METHOD

Data collection was done using an online panel of participants for research projects provided by Qualtrics. In this study, panelists had a clear understanding of business practices, worked full-time in an office setting, were over 18, and had at least a four-year college degree. Respondents were screened on the aforementioned criteria first (232). Individuals who did not meet the screening standard were eliminated from participation, leaving 797 survey usable invitations. Of these individuals, 240 completed the survey, leaving a 30.1% response rate.

With regard to age in years, 4% of respondents were 18 to 25, 12.1% were 26 to 35, 14.2% were 36 to 45, 25.0% were 46 to 55, and 48.3% were over 55, and 50.8% were female. A total of 55.0% indicated that they had a Bachelor’s degree, 36.3% had a Master’s degree, 3.8% had a professional degree, and 5.0% had a doctorate degree. Additionally, 4.2% reported having worked for their companies/organizations for under one year, 18.3% for 1-5 years, 20.0% for 6-10 years, 30.8% for 11-20 years, 8.8% for 21-25 years, and 17.9% for 25+ years.
MI was measured with the 9-item Moral Injury Events Scale (Nash et al., 2013) with slightly modified wording to reflect an organizational context. Items were rated on a seven-point scale (1=strongly disagree to 7=strongly agree), and scores were averaged so that higher values showed increased MI ($\alpha=.93$). Work-related stress was assessed with a seven-item scale (House & Rizzo, 1972) successfully used in past work (e.g., Promislo et al., 2012). Items were rated on a seven-point scale (1=strongly disagree to 7=strongly agree), and item scores were averaged so that higher scores indicated increased stress at work ($\alpha=.92$).

Trauma-induced ill-being was evaluated with two measures that tapped negative physical and mental conditions. An adapted form of the Physical Symptoms Inventory (PSI) (Spector & Jex 1998) was used to assess self-reported somatic symptoms comprised of experienced physical ailments (e.g., pain of a headache or stomach upset). Respondents were asked to evaluate the extent to which they experienced eighteen different symptoms over the past 30 days (1=not at all to 7=all of the time). Ratings were averaged so that higher scores indicated more frequently reported symptoms ($\alpha=.94$). Level of fatigue was also measured with five items from Fatigue Assessment Scale (Michielsen et al., 2004). Respondents evaluated each of the items in terms of how they felt over the past 30 days (1=none of the time to 6=all of the time). Ratings were averaged, with higher scores indicating greater fatigue ($\alpha=.90$). A factor analysis of the overall scores for the symptoms and fatigue measures using principal components extraction produced an initial eigenvalue of 1.46, 72.85% of explained variance, and a single-factor solution with items loadings each being .85. Consequently, the two composite scores for symptoms and fatigue measures were averaged to obtain an overall measure of trauma-induced ill-being ($\alpha=.61$). Post-traumatic stress as a result of unethical actions at work was measured with 6 items from Lang and Stein (2005) that were modified for a work context. Items were rated on a five-point scale (1=not at all to 5=extremely), and averaged scores showed increased moral PTSD ($\alpha=.96$).

**RESULTS**

The correlation analysis indicated that gender was negatively related to company/organization tenure ($r=-.12, p<.10$), MI ($r=-.15, p<.05$), and moral PTSD ($r=-.13, p<.10$). Company/organization tenure was also negatively related to work-related stress ($r=-.11, p<.10$) and trauma-induced ill-being ($r=-.17, p<.01$). MI was positively related to work-related stress ($r=.48, p<.001$), trauma-induced ill-being ($r=.39, p<.001$), and moral PTSD ($r=.61, p<.001$), work-related stress was positively related to both trauma-induced ill-being ($r=.56, p<.001$) and moral PTSD ($r=.47, p<.001$), and trauma-induced ill-being was positively related to moral PTSD ($r=.46, p<.001$).

Regarding the serial mediation analysis, the model specifying work-related stress as dependent variable had an R-square value of .25 and was significant ($F_{3,236}=26.25, p<.001$). Company/organization tenure was negatively related to work-related stress ($b=-.12, p<.05$), while MI was positively related to work-related stress ($b=.65, p<.001$). These results provided strong statistical support for Hypothesis 1. The model specifying trauma-induced ill-being as the dependent variable produced an even higher R-square value of .34 and was significant ($F_{4,235}=30.86, p<.001$). Company/organization tenure was negatively related to trauma-induced ill-being ($b=-.07, p<.05$), while MI ($b=.12, p<.001$) and work-related stress ($b=.27, p<.001$) were both positively related to trauma-induced ill-being. These results provided strong statistical support for Hypotheses 2 and 3. The model specifying moral PTSD as the dependent variable produced a high R-square of .44 and was significant ($F_{5,234}=37.09, p<.001$). MI ($b=.33, p<.001$), work-related stress ($b=.08, p<.05$), and trauma-induced ill-being ($b=.20, p<.001$) were all positively related to moral PTSD, which provided strong statistical support for Hypotheses 4, 5, and 6. While MI was directly related to moral PTSD, it was also indirectly related by functioning
through the stress/distress variables (Total effect=.11, LLCI=.05, ULCI=.17). MI indirectly related to moral PTSD by functioning independently through both work-related stress (at marginal significance, Effect=.05, LLCI=-.004, ULCI=.10) and trauma-induced ill-being (Effect=.02, LLCI=.001, ULCI=.06). MI was also indirectly related to moral PTSD by functioning through both work-related stress and trauma-induced ill-being in a serial manner (Effect=.03, LLCI=.01, ULCI=.07). These findings provided additional support for Hypothesis 4.

DISCUSSION

These results suggest that individuals working under more normal lower stakes working conditions, such as those found in typical business environments, may grapple with MI that triggers damaging well-being outcomes. Ultimately, the long-held assumption that MI is a function of higher stakes moral stressors involving serious threats (Litz & Kerig, 2019) was not supported – high stakes are not necessary to evidence impact on well-being. Equally important, our results regarding both the role of stress and trauma confirmed the EIT model.

Our study suggests that leaders must recognize that when ethical transgressions are discovered, their responsibility should be first to the humanitarian concerns that MI raises, not simply to public relations and financial concerns, and to align organizational resources to mitigate the deleterious impacts on employee well-being. Past work suggests that MI should be addressed first so that other measures may be employed to counter the adverse outcomes of such trauma (see Koenig et al., 2018). This may include providing an opportunity for employees to discuss their unethical experiences in meetings with peer groups and managers, which could function as a primary therapeutic intervention for mitigating the typical negative outcomes associated with MI (see Bryan et al., 2016). Alternatively, organizations may manage the ethical work environment in ways that prevent the types of situations that lead to MI.

While our study focused on diminished well-being, the number of other psychological well-being outcomes should be investigated, including self-actualization, personal growth, meaning in life, hope, and happiness (Giacalone et al., 2016), all of which have been the subject of other EIT studies. Clearly, future research will need to assess the extent to which different types of physical and psychological (Promislo et al., 2012), social (Keyes, 1998), and spiritual (Koenig et al., 2017) well-being are impacted specifically by organizationally-driven MI. This study also did not assess the climate or cultural impacts of organizations in predicting MI or well-being outcomes, which should be explored.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
BIG. BUT NOT EASY - DECISION-MAKING UNDER UNCERTAINTY: THE UNRECOGNIZED ROLE OF SOCIAL MOOD

LEONARD G. LOVE  
DENNIS ELAM  
Texas A&M University-San Antonio  
San Antonio, TX 78224

DOUGLAS CARTER  
St. Edwards University

Abstract: That Managerial Decision-Making as essential for organizational success is one of the most researched topics in the research literature. Key to good decision-making, however, is for those decisions to be based on an accurate assessment of the organization’s environment. Since Simon’s pioneering work, research has also established that such decision-making takes place under conditions of lesser or greater environmental uncertainty, which is both tangible (Munificence, Dynamism, and Complexity); and perceptual (State, Effect, and Response) on the part of the decision-maker). We would like to suggest that the concept of Social Mood may offer a valuable new tool in understanding the changes in the environment, driven by underlying changes in Social Mood. Instead of externally driven (exogenous) forces of change, endogenous (collectively, internally driven) mood drives changes in markets, the Arts, consumer tastes, politics, and individual perceptions. This collective Mood is unconscious, unremembered, and constantly fluctuating. We suggest, then, that this collective mood influences the perceptions of environmental uncertainty experienced by decision-makers.

“The successful businessperson is a forecaster first: purchasing, producing, marketing, pricing, and organizing all follow.” - Peter L. Bernstein

Perceived Environmental Uncertainty

One of the most long-standing and widely accepted normative prescriptions in the organizational theory and strategy literature is that top managers or senior executives of firms must continually monitor the environment to align or realign their firm with changes in that environment (Ellenkov, 1997: 337). Whether the organizations’ environment is thought of as the totality of external influences on the organization (Duncan, 1972), or simply as sources of needed resources that the organization must obtain from outside its own boundaries (Dess & Beard, 1984), it is generally accepted that the environment has an impact on the organization (Milliken, 1990). Moreover, the environment is a major influence on both organizational structure and the performance of firms (Burns & Stalker, 1961; Lawrence & Lorsch, 1967; Thompson, 1967; Miles & Snow, 1978). Furthermore, it has been empirically demonstrated (Bourgeois, 1985) that higher performing firms are generally those whose managers more accurately assess the nature of the firm’s relevant environment and act in accordance with those assessments.

This can be somewhat problematic, however, because the organization’s environment is often complex and difficult to understand. Moreover, the environment may be subject to change, and it can be challenging to predict the frequency, direction, strength and effects of those changes. These difficulties combine to create environmental uncertainty (Daft & Weick, 1984; Duncan, 1972; Milliken, 1990), and dealing with this uncertainty is considered one of the most important tasks of the firm’s top management (Thompson, 1967). Senior executives, in attempting to understand and respond to the environment, must first perceive the environment (Daft & Weick, 1984; Miles & Snow, 1978; Weick, 1979) which is done through the manager’s own perceptual lenses or filter (Barr & Huff, 1997). As a consequence, firms may not necessarily respond to an
objective environment, but rather to management’s perception of the environment, and empirical evidence shows that the more closely the perceptions of an organization’s management match the objective environment, the higher that firm’s economic performance can be expected to be relative to other firms (Bourgeois, 1985).

Social Mood (Prechter, 2003) strongly influences perceptions of the external environment. Changes in social mood, often thought to be driven by external events, may, instead be endogenous, following predictable wave patterns (Prechter, 2003, Costi, 2010). These changes in mood can influence perceptions of optimism, pessimism, economic activity, and popular culture. Accordingly, we suggest that changes in social mood may moderate the levels of PEU experienced by decision-makers.

In the sections that follow, this paper will provide a brief review the existing literature on Perceived Environmental Uncertainty (PEU) from early recognition of its importance by researchers, including PEU dimensions found in the extant literature. Next we introduce the idea of Social Mood, as proposed by Prechter (2003) and its connection to perceptions of the external environment. We then suggest that social mood is an important contributor to managerial perceptions of the organization’s environment, and therefore, an important, but unexplored contributor to managerial decision-making. Finally, this paper makes suggestions for future research and implications for managers.

While many early management theorists, such as Taylor, Fayol, and Weber tended to focus on the organization itself, often ignoring the external environment for the most part; since at least the 1950s, researchers have recognized the need to consider the external environment in organizational decision-making and management. Researchers, such as Dill (1950), March and Simon (1958), Burns and Stalker (1961), and Emery and Trist (1965) recognized both that managers must consider the external environment, and that this environment could be difficult to fully understand. Whether the organizations’ environment is thought of as the totality of external influences on the organization (Duncan, 1972), or simply as sources of needed resources that the organization must obtain from outside its own boundaries (Dess & Beard, 1984), it is generally accepted that the environment has an impact on the organization, and the firm’s management must analyze and anticipate environmental changes (Alchian, 1950; Dill, 1958; March & Simon, 1958; Milliken, 1990). Indeed, researchers such as Bourgeois (1985) and others have postulated that firm performance is to at least some degree dependent upon management’s ability to understand the environment.

Unfortunately, managers can have a great deal of difficulty in making sense of the environment. The problem is that the environment can change – sometimes slowly and sometimes quickly, sometimes in small ways, and sometimes drastically. Thus arises the problem of environmental uncertainty (Daft & Weick, 1984; Duncan, 1972; Milliken, 1990), and dealing with this uncertainty is considered one of the most important tasks of the firm’s top management (Thompson, 1967). To make sense of the environment, managers must first perceive the environment (Daft & Weick, 1984; Miles & Snow, 1978; Weick, 1979) which is done through the manager’s own perceptual lenses or filter (Barr & Huff, 1997). Consequently, firms may not necessarily respond to an objective environment, but rather to its management’s perception of the environment, and empirical evidence shows that the more closely the perceptions of an organization’s management match the objective environment, the higher that firm’s economic performance can be expected to be relative to other firms (Bourgeois, 1985).

While Perceived Environmental Uncertainty (PEU) is a widely studied phenomenon, most of this research has focused on identifying the dimensions of PEU. These include dimensions such as stability versus turbulence, munificence versus scarcity, homogeneity versus heterogeneity (diversity), and clustering versus randomness (Katz & Kahn, 1978). Other researchers have suggested that relevant dimensions for organizational focus include Political/Governmental Policies, Macroeconomic changes, Resources and Services used by the company, Product Market Demand,
the firm’s Competition, and Technology in the firm’s industry (Miller, 1992; 1993); or International Competitive Advantage, Industry Competition, Production Costs, Human Resources, Government, and Societal Change (Priem, et al’, 2002). In addition, research has shown that not only does perceived environmental uncertainty (PEU) involve each of these areas, but also that PEU itself can be dis-aggregated into sub-dimensions, such as state, effect, and response uncertainty (Milliken, 1987; 1990).

While this research has proven useful in helping understand PEU, there is still a great deal more we could learn. Particularly useful might be research into the factors contributing to the levels of uncertainty experienced by the decision-maker. Are there identifiable factors that serve to either increase or decrease the degree to which a decision feels uncertain? One important question might be whether there are any moderators of PEU? We would like to suggest that one moderator might be the prevailing social mood at the time the decision-maker analyzes the environment. If there are moderators of PEU, their presence might, in fact be one reason why it is so widely accepted that decision-makers are not always rational decision-makers. Perhaps decision-makers are behaving rationally, based on the prevailing social mood.

Social Mood

Conventional wisdom holds that the mood of the public is influenced by external or exogenous events. The predictive theory of Socionomics turns this idea on its head. Instead it is internal or endogenous mood changes that influence societal changes. This author’s experience is that examples make the case more understood than the tenets of Socionomics.

Larger than life projects begin are conceived and planned near the top of positive social mood swings. Such swings generate stock market manias, inclusionary mood causes people to buy not sell and embrace new ideas. Examples include the Empire State Building. It was planned in 1928 as the stock market made new highs. But it opened in 1931, the worst real estate market possible. A theory is only valid if it spans continents and societies. Consider the Burj Khalifa, the tallest building in the world at 2,722 feet, just over half a mile. Construction began in 2004, after the dot.com bottom in markets in October 2002. The exterior was completed in 2009 near the bottom of the sub-prime mortgage panic. It opened in 2010, as with the Empire State, in a terrible real estate market. To date it has not become profitable.

Social Mood (Casti, 2010; Noftsinger, 2005; Prechter, 1999) is the theory that collective moods are felt by members of society, although they may be unconscious of the collective mood. Moreover, these moods are endogenous, not determined by external events; and that changes in mood occur in predictable patterns. Changes in public mood precedes changes in society and the market, and the economy more broadly. The underlying argument is that bad things happen due to negative mood, not the other way around, as is commonly thought. Additionally, positive events do not cause positive mood, but rather than positive mood contributes to positive outcomes.

During periods of positive mood, such as the 1920s, 1960s, or 2010s, the most popular films tend to be adventure, heroism, and family-oriented movies; while music tends to be more upbeat. The Indiana Jones series began in 1981 with the first three films ending in 1989. During positive mood, dress becomes more colorful and less conservative. The overall mood is more optimistic, and markets (and the economy more broadly) tend to be bullish. Business (and other) scandals tend to be less scrutinized, and increased regulation or legal sanctions are less common.

The negative mood of the Depression saw the creation of darker films, such as gangster movies like Public Enemy. The modern horror films of Dracula and Frankenstein were created in this period. This mood repeat of the 1970s brought The Exorcist and the Godfather. (It is interesting to note that despite Disney’s multi-decade success, the company had only two moderately successful animated hits in the 1970s and early 1980s, in contrast to the 1960s, when the company had six of the top forty films of the decade, including several top hits of the year; or the 1990s, when Disney had eleven of the top fifteen hits of the 1990s). In these negative mood cycles,
the prevailing feeling can be described as pessimism, fear, and anger. We see bear markets, and an increase in conflict. Business (and other) scandals tend to lead to increased regulation, and legal sanctions. The tenets of social mood are expressed as follows.

- Social Mood motivates social actions
- Social mood is endogenously regulated, not exogenous forces
- Social Mood fluctuates according to the Elliott Wave Principle
- Mood is unconscious and unremembered
- Waves of mood result in the herding principle as humans interact.

The concept of social mood suggests that, instead of externally driven (exogenous) forces of change, environmental change is endogenous, and that collective, internally driven, mood drives changes in markets, the Arts, consumer tastes, politics, and individual perceptions. This collective mood is unconscious, unremembered, and constantly fluctuating. It is, however, felt by decision-makers as they analyze the environment.

Social Mood as a Moderator of Perceived Environmental Uncertainty

During periods of positive social mood, decision makers may perceive reduced levels of PEU in assessing their environment. Because of the prevailing positive mood, managers may believe that threats are less serious, or less important. Similarly, they may perceive greater likelihood of success, or a reduced risk of failure. This can help to explain why many large and/or potentially high-risk ventures – such as extremely tall skyscrapers - are launched at the end of a boom (positive mood) cycle, and just before the economy turns down. In contrast, managers may perceive higher levels of uncertainty during a period of negative social mood, even when the project might have a prospect of success. The reason why decision-makers may be inclined to follow the prevailing mood in place of more objective data was explained by John Maynard Keynes in *The General Theory* (1936:48), when he wrote that investors that refuse don’t follow the crowd are viewed as “eccentric, unconventional, and rash in the eyes of the average opinion…his success will only confirm the general belief in his rashness; and…if his decisions are unsuccessful…he will not receive much mercy. Worldly wisdom teaches that it is better for reputation to fail unconventionally than to succeed conventionally.” In other words, there is a comfort in following the prevailing views of the crowd. So, in essence, positive collective mood can give decision-makers a greater sense of certainty, or less overall PEU. By contrast, a negative social mood would tend to decrease certainty in decision-making and cause greater PEU for the decision-maker.

As the extant literature demonstrates, managerial decision-making is “big” in that it is vital to the success, indeed the survival of the organization. At the same time, it is definitely not “easy,” due to environmental volatility, and PEU. This paper contributes to the extant literature on PEU by suggesting that there might be moderators to PEU. Recognizing such moderators may help decision-makers to avoid making mistakes by over- or under-estimating the uncertainty in a decision. The primary weakness of this paper is that it is theoretical. It remains for other researchers to empirically test the ideas we propose. We suggest, however, that this paper, not only adds to the research literature on environmental uncertainty but may help to improve the ability of decision-makers to understand the environment, and therefore, to make better decisions, thereby making these big decisions, perhaps a little easier.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
Corporate political activity (CPA) is an important nonmarket strategy used by firms to influence public policy (Bonardi et al., 2005). From influencing laws limiting greenhouse gas emissions (Delmas et al., 2016) to effecting regulation on net neutrality (Leathley, 2017), CPA expenditures have been rising since 2000 (Center for Responsive Politics, 2020). The literature on CPA highlights the diverse reasons firms engage in CPA and policy outcomes achieved by firms (Hillman et al., 2004). Although, the importance of CPA effects on policy, and therefore society, are accepted in academic, policy, and business realms, there is less understanding of why firms that regularly engage in CPA vary their CPA expenditures over time. Research has expanded our understanding of CPA by determining firm level antecedents and country level institutional arrangements that increase the likelihood of a firm to engage in CPA (Choi et al., 2015; Macher & Mayo, 2015). However, there remains significant opportunity to better understand CPA. One consideration is that the aims sought by firms through CPA are a narrow slate of outcomes, yet new theory in firm political orientation suggests the aims may be highly partisan and varied along political dimensions. CPA provides a means to study the numerous strategic outcomes that may align a firm’s political bent with parallel goals of a political party, particularly if that party holds control over a unified government.

A contributing factor to this deficiency is that there is less theory to explain the CPA strategies that a firm will deploy. The inherently political nature of CPA means that a firm’s political ideology presents an important theoretical avenue for understanding CPA. Literature has considered that firms may favor a particular political ideology leading to outcomes that are politically tinged (e.g., Johnson & Roberto, 2018). Overtime, this ideology may be reinforced through selection practices and the retention of like-minded employees as advanced in the attraction-selection-attrition theories that underpin the micro-foundations of ideology advanced in this manuscript (e.g., Schneider, 1987).

Firms with strong partisan leanings may use their CPA to pursue government actions that are congruent with their partisan driven political aims. Yet, a firm’s political ideology does not operate in a vacuum separate from political developments in the policy environment. A unified government under one party may align the government’s political agenda with the firm’s political ideology. In cases of single party control of the government, the ability to advance partisan political aims is greater. This alignment presents excellent opportunities to firms to advance their political strategies through CPA.

In this study, we demonstrate how a firm’s political ideology affects its CPA strategy. By doing so we provide an important connection between organizational political ideology and nonmarket strategy (Bonardi et al., 2006; Gupta et al., 2017). This contribution shows firms are not agnostic actors, and that a firm’s political ideology affects how firms change their political and societal environments. Further, we contribute to the CPA literature (Hillman & Hitt, 1999; Oliver & Holzinger, 2008; Rudy & Johnson, 2016) by demonstrating organizational political ideology is a significant source of variance in CPA strategy. Additionally, identifying a unified
government as a CPA determinant adds to the understanding of institutional conditions that enable CPA (Choi et al., 2015; Macher & Mayo, 2015).

Specifically, this study advances and tests theory on how a firm’s political ideology alignment with a unified government leads to variance in their lobbying expenditures. We find that predominantly conservative-leaning firms seek to maintain the status quo and therefore spend less on lobbying during periods of alignment and more during periods of misalignment. Liberal-leaning firms seek to enact change and therefore spend more on lobbying during periods of alignment and less during periods of misalignment. Finally, we advance theory on institutional conditions that solicit CPA activity. This theory was tested with panel data collected from large public US firms’ lobbying expenditures from 2000-2018.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Ideology is a deeply held conviction that is central to an individual’s belief structure (Jost & Amodio, 2012). A routinely used means for interpreting political ideology is through the left-right dimension (Jost et al., 2008). Liberal ideology occupies the left side of the dimension while the right side is conservative. The degree to which an individual, geographic location (e.g., state), or organization identifies with an ideology can be easily plotted and defined (e.g., moderate conservative; strong liberal) on the dimension.

Political parties work to advance ideologies. In the US, the “opposing sides” are aligned with the two major political parties with a liberal political ideology being advanced by the Democratic Party and a conservative ideology by the Republican Party (Jost, 2006; Mason, 2015). The liberal/conservative ideology and their respective parties are often used as synonymous terms. The US has long been dominated by these two major political parties; however, the parties have not always aligned so closely with their currently associated ideologies. Recent shifts in the electorate indicate that the parties are now more reflective and divisions along party lines are more pronounced than they have been in decades (Hare & Poole, 2014; Mason, 2015).

Comparable to the ideological differences found across society, individuals within firms hold a range of political beliefs for which they may feel passionately about. The politically charged actions of individuals may motivate many outcomes, thus underscoring a complex understanding of ideology in the workplace (e.g., Johnson & Roberto, 2018). Partisanship in the US has increased in the past two decades (Mason, 2015; Hare & Poole, 2014). Accordingly, the ideology of individuals who lead firms, as well as the firms themselves, represent a range of political ideologies. These are often strong ideologies that mirror society at large as represented by the left/right dimension (Chin et al., 2013).

As such, organizational political ideology, the “prevailing beliefs among organizational members about how the social world operates, including convictions about what outcomes are desirable and how they should be achieved” (Gupta et al., 2017, p. 1019), has recently become more prevalent in management research. This growing body of research investigates how organizational political ideology influences decision making.

Organizational political ideology influences decision making through a two-step process. The first step is the propagation of the predominant ideology through the organization through the attraction-selection-attrition (ASA) process. The ASA model is the process of employees selecting into and out of organizations based on perceived fit with the organization (Schneider, 1987). The ASA model explains the process that allows an organization’s employees to become more homogenous over time. Attraction occurs as job applicants determine if the organizational characteristics are a good personal fit and are attracted to organizations that espouse similar values to their own (Chatman, 1991). Additionally, employers often select new hires that are similar in personality to the organization’s members (Oh et al., 2018). Then, as new employees
join the organization, they experience a socialization process where they increasingly align their values to the organization’s values (De Cooman et al., 2009). Finally, employees that experience stronger value congruence in the organization are likely to have higher job satisfaction experience lower levels of attrition than employees with weaker value congruence (De Cooman et al., 2009; O’Reilly III et al., 1991).

Recent research has explored aspects of the ASA model within the context of political ideology. These studies have theorized how employee political ideology congruence with an organization leads to attraction, selection, and attrition outcomes (Johnson & Roberto, 2019; Roth et al., 2020) For example, Roth and colleagues’ (2020) empirical study found that potential employees were more attracted to organizations with similar political ideologies and that employers are more likely to hire employees with similar political ideologies to the organization. Further, Bermiss and McDonald (2018) studied 40,000 investment professionals over 10 years and found that employees who were political ideological misfits with their organization were more likely to leave the firm and join a different with more similar political ideological values.

Thus, organizations can become political ideologically homogeneous which can influence decision making within the organization (Gupta et al., 2017; Gupta & Briscoe, 2020). The behavioral theory of the firm has well established that a manager’s decision making is influenced by the organizational factors (e.g., values, beliefs, routines) which set appropriate behavioral standards given the organizational context (Cyert & March, 1963; March & Simon, 1958; Simon, 1947). Thus, organizational political ideology represents predominant values and beliefs that can shape the cognition processes of decision makers. For example, Gupta and colleagues (2017) theorize that managers ranging from low-level to top level-executives create and perceive business decisions that align with the organizational political ideology. Their study found that liberal leaning companies were more likely to engage in CSR as sustainability is more aligned with liberal values. Additionally, Gupta and Briscoe (2020) theorize that organizational political ideology is salient to corporate decision makers and in turn influences their decision making on social activism. They found that liberal leaning firms were more likely to concede to social activist’s demands as they accept the activist’s claims are connected to the firm’s actions.

These works indicate that firms exhibit a predominate political ideology and that substantial variation exists among firms in their beliefs. Further, firms will advocate for organizational level outcomes that advance a similar worldview to their own (e.g., Gupta et al., 2018). Additionally, these studies show that with a clear political bent, such as CSR, are not only strategic aims for the firm but align with the firm’s predominate political position (Gupta et al., 2017). As firms are expending resources to advance strategies with a political hue, CPA can advocate public policies that compliment firm strategy through government action. Thus, these studies in organizational level political ideology provide a basis for understanding the linkage between a firm’s desired goals and how receptive a political institution might be to advancing firm outcomes. Institutions, such as the US Executive Branch, Senate, or House of Representatives, present a friendly environment for firms to advance their goals when they are politically aligned. The use of CPA by a politically driven firm paired with its politically tinged strategic aims presents an attractive means to amplify results across the market and nonmarket environment.

**THEORY**

By advancing the concept of an organizational political ideology, Gupta and colleagues (2018) emphasize the outcomes associated with a predominately liberal or conservative organization. A theme has emerged suggesting that more liberal managers tend to favor evenhandedness while conservative managers are more tolerant of disparity (e.g., Briscoe & Joshi, 2017; Chin & Samadeni, 2017; Carnahan & Greenwood, 2018). Importantly, Gupta and
colleagues (2017) argue that politically motivated strategic behavior is likely representative of the organization, not a specific individual, such as the CEO. In the context of the firm, the role of specific values underpinning political ideology warrants additional consideration as they also drive organizational outcomes (Gupta et al., 2017). Potential organizational level outcomes reflect the theoretical underpinnings illustrated in the left-right dimension. The first tenant that separates the two major ideologies is preservation of status quo versus change (Jost et al., 2003). The other basic tenant is the acceptance of disparity within society by more conservative minded individuals while more liberal minded individuals reject this ideal (Jost et al., 2003).

In the U.S., political ideologies are advanced primarily through the two major political parties, the Republican (Conservative) and Democratic (Liberal) Parties (Goren et al., 2009). Republicans tend to strongly favor preservation of the status quo, limited government, and personal responsibility while the Democratic Party favors a larger role for government in society and public policies that foster change (Jost et al., 2008; Hutton et al., 2014).

The predominance of a single political ideology within an organization may lead the firm to pursue policies that are in tune with a specific political party while also serving as strategic alternatives (Gupta et al., 2017). For instance, protection of the status quo is effective in that it can defend a firm’s current assets and market position (Oliver & Holzinger, 2008) while CSR signals an organizations commitment to broader societal aims (Gupta et al., 2017).

Given the difficulties of enacting change within the political environment, maintaining the current situation is one of the more achievable outcomes of CPA (Oliver & Holzinger, 2008). In a system of government where consensus among multiple actors is required, persuading one actor to disagree with proposed changes is more likely than obtaining broad approval from multiple actors. The odds of success in this scenario leans heavily on the alignment of political actors with the political affiliation of the firm. In the US, strongly conservative firms working to advance measures agreed to by the Republican Party (e.g., corporate tax cuts) will be met with more support if the legislative and executive branches of government are unified under the Republican Party. A political alignment occurred with passage of the Affordable Care Act (ACA) in March 2010 when both chambers of Congress and the Presidency were held by Democrats. Later that year, in the 2010 mid-term elections, Democrats lost control of the House of Representatives, thus making the passage of legislation more difficult due to the necessary support from two politically opposed chambers.

Conservative firms’ political aims to limit government and maintain the status quo results in different CPA strategies depending on the ideological leaning of the government. When conservative firms are aligned with the ideology of the government, the status quo is already being maintained by the government. Therefore, conservative firms do not need to engage in CPA as extensively to maintain the status quo. Further, through inaction, such as by not acting to raise taxes or increase spending, the government will likely not increase in size or scope. However, when conservative firms are misaligned with the ideology of the government, the pursuit of change from other interest groups must be countered. Therefore, conservative firms need to increase their CPA to maintain the status quo.

H2: Firms with a predominantly conservative organizational political ideology will spend more on CPA during periods of political misalignment than during periods of political alignment.

The left-right dimension positions a liberal ideology in opposition to the position of conservatives. Thus, a liberal political ideology is underpinned by an acceptance of change and desire for greater equality (Jost et al., 2003). These dimensions would be more salient in firms that are liberal leaning in comparison to their more conservative counterparts.

Firms with strongly liberal leaning leaders and corporate political ideologies have been shown to advance CSR more than their conservative counterparts (Chin et al., 2013; Gupta et al.,
From a government perspective, there are numerous public policies that complement the CSR of firms or direct companies to engage in activities that absent a mandate might be viewed as CSR. At the beginning of 2021, the newly elected Biden Administration and a narrowly Democrat-controlled Congress may seize on their status as a unified government to promote initiatives that address climate change, the federal minimum wage, and more inclusive hiring practices. These initiatives enjoy the support of most liberal voters and politicians while also mirroring the CSR of many liberal firms. Some of these initiatives have been promoted by firms and serve as a basis for policy adoption such as the $15 minimum wage by several influential firms (Friedman, 2020).

As liberal firms are more accepting of change different CPA strategies may be employed depending on the ideological leaning of the government. When liberal firms are aligned with the ideology of the government, this represents an opportune time to seek change. Therefore, liberal firms seeking outcomes in accordance with their political ideologies may increase their CPA expenditures during periods of alignment with the government. However, when liberal firms are misaligned with the government, the status quo is the most likely result from the government. Therefore, liberal firms do not need to engage in CPA to maintain the status quo.

H3: Firms with a predominantly liberal organizational political ideology will spend more on CPA during periods of political alignment than during periods of political misalignment.

DATA AND METHODOLOGY

The sample consists of firms listed in the 2018 S&P 100. CPA expenditures were collected from 2000 to 2018 on a yearly basis. Large firms are well suited for this study as they have the resources to engage in CPA (Drope & Hansen, 2006). Additionally, large firms are often thought of as industry leaders (Fligstein, 1990) and their actions tend to be more visible, attract more media coverage, and are more likely to be noticed by stakeholders (Rao et al., 2000). Further, larger firms are more visible (Hansen et al., 2004), and likely to attract the attention of regulators (Hansen & Mitchell, 2000). This timeframe allows for observing firm CPA expenditures across multiple configurations of government political control. After accounting for firm subsidiary spin-offs, the sample was comprised of 1,805 firm-year observations.

Equation 2 and 3 tests related hypotheses 2, and 3 and are:

\[
\text{Log\_Lobbying}_it = \alpha + \beta_1 \text{Conservative\_Political\_Alignment}_t + \delta \text{Year}_t + \delta \text{Industry}_i + \beta_2 \text{Firm\_Controls}_it + \beta_3 \text{Industry\_Regulation}_t + \epsilon_{it} (2)
\]

where equation 2 Conservative\_Political\_Alignment tests the effects of conservative political alignment and misalignment on firm lobbying expenditures. The dependent variable is the firm’s log lobbying dollars, \( \alpha \) is a fixed-effects control for time-invariant changes for firms in the sample, \text{Unified\_Government} is a time related categorical variable that denotes if the United States House of Representatives, Senate, and Presidency are controlled by the same political party for that year, \( \delta \text{Year} \) is the year time fixed effects, \( \delta \text{industry} \) is industry fixed effects.

Equation 3 is the same as equation 2 but tests the effects of liberal political alignment and misalignment on firm lobbying expenditures.

RESULTS

Hypothesis 2 and 3 are related in that they predict how firms vary their CPA strategy based on political ideology. Model 2 reports the results for hypothesis 2, which predicts that firms with a predominantly conservative organizational political ideology will spend more on
CPA during periods of political misalignment than during periods of political alignment. The Conservative Political Alignment coefficient was 0.74, not significant with $p = 0.169$, and with robust standard errors of 0.57 and the Conservative Political Misalignment coefficient was 1.04 significant at $p = 0.001$ and with robust standard errors of 0.32. These results show that compared to periods when there is a nonunified government, conservative firms increased their lobbying expenditures by 104% when misaligned with a unified government. Further, the Wald test was significant at $p = 0.006$, which indicates that categories, Conservative Political Alignment and Conservative Political Misalignment are not equal to zero and that including these categories improves the model’s statistical fit. These results support hypothesis 2.

Model 3 reports the results for hypothesis 3, which predicts that Firms with a predominantly liberal organizational political ideology will spend more on CPA during periods of political alignment than during periods of misalignment. The Liberal Political Alignment coefficient was 1.42 significant at $p = 0.000$ and with robust standard errors of 0.37 and the Liberal Political Misalignment coefficient was 1.31, significant at $p = 0.002$ and with robust standard errors of 0.4. These results show that compared to periods when there is a nonunified government, liberal firms increased lobbying expenditures by 142% when alignment with a unified government occurred. Further, the Wald test was significant at $p = 0.001$, which indicates that the categories Liberal Political Alignment and Liberal Political Misalignment are not equal to zero and that including these categories improves the model’s statistical fit. These results support hypothesis 3.

**DISCUSSION**

By bridging CPA and organizational political ideologies literatures, we advanced theory that explains how a firm’s political ideology affects the intended CPA outcomes and the strategy to achieve the outcomes when aligned with advantageous institutional conditions. Our empirical results show that during periods of a unified government firms increase their lobbying expenditures. Further, we find that predominantly conservative-leaning firms seek to maintain the status quo and therefore spend less on lobbying during periods of alignment with a unified government and more during periods of misalignment. Additionally, liberal-leaning firms seek to enact change and therefore spend more on lobbying during periods of alignment with a unified government and less during periods of misalignment. Finally, we find that liberal-leaning firms outspend conservative-leaning firms on lobbying during periods of alignment and conservative-leaning firms outspend liberal-leaning firms during periods of misalignment. This paper represents an important step in better understanding how firms deploy their nonmarket strategy to shape the political and societal environment to advance their interests.

**REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR**
PERMISSION TO WORK: CASE OF ARAB WOMEN

KATLIN CUNDIFF
Drury University
900 N Benton Ave,
Springfield, MO 65802

JANIS PREWITT
Drury University

INTRODUCTION

According to several Arab countries’ labor law, Muslim women are required to provide their employers a written permission to work from their legal male guardians. Mahram is a term in the Arabic language that refers to the legal male guardianship who holds a significant influence over a woman’s life. Mahram is either a woman’s husband, father, brother or even a son who has the power to make a range of critical decisions on her behalf. Without a permission from Mahram, a Muslim woman cannot marry, go outside of her home, travel, work, rent an apartment or file legal claims. Her economic participation or career development would not be possible without her Mahram’s permission.

This paper aims to explore the factors that are important for Mahrams, when allowing their female family members to work. This study challenges the conventional career choice theories, such as the social cognitive career theory, by addressing one of its major shortcomings, namely the question of how free women are in their career choice. While the Arab woman is free to seek employment in different industries and organizations, the final decision regarding her career choice lies with her Mahram.

Most Arab countries take steps to encourage women’s economic participation, yet women’s advancement both in terms of education and career advancement are subject to both the legal, religious and, foremost, societal norms. Increasingly, career researchers call for accounting for both the individual’s agency as well as the influence of the wider socio-cultural context of the region to develop an understanding of cultural realities that might be accountable for shaping/binding women’s careers (Afiouni, 2014).

Arab women form a very wide population group that expands from Oman to Morocco and beyond to other countries. While Arab women share the Arabic language and often the same religion, their socio-cultural contexts vary significantly. Arab women in Morocco are not easily comparable to Lebanese or Emiratis due to the different realities that influence their career advancement. When studying Arab women, country-specific contexts should be used for describing the realities that influence their economic participation and careers.

For this paper, the United Arab Emirates (UAE) is chosen as a context to study Arab women’s careers. The UAE has historically been one of the most traditional societies when it comes to the position of women, yet today the country is the most modernized Arab country. Balancing the modern life style and at the same time adhering to Islamic and traditional Arab values, is an important aspect of the Emirati identity of the 21st century. When it comes to the socio-cultural context of the UAE, Emiratis are relatively uniform in terms of ethnicity, with ancient regional tribal roots, and predominantly practice the austere Wahabi interpretation of Islam (Masoud, 1999). Regarding women’s issues, the Wahabis tend to take the strongest and most conservative viewpoint when interpreting religious texts. There is also evidence of physical segregation in the workplace, in the belief that a woman’s exposure to men may be regarded harmful to her reputation (Gallant and Pounder, 2008; Metcalfe, 2008; Syed, 2008).
Women’s advancement

Emirati females account for more than 70 percent of university graduates. The contribution of Emirati women to economic activity has increased from a mere 5.4 per cent in 1995 to 27.9 per cent in 2017, and Emirati women hold 20 percent of the seats in the national Federal Council (UAE Ministry of Cabinet Affairs, 2021). Despite the fact that the change in female labor force participation is impressive, the unemployment rate among Emirati women has recently reached a high of 19.7 per cent, compared to 8.2 per cent for males. Furthermore, two-thirds of Emiratis are under the age of 30 and youth unemployment is significantly higher than the overall unemployment rate of 20.8% in 2019 (UAE Ministry of Cabinet Affairs, 2021). One of the reasons for implementing ‘Emiratization’ policies was to encourage Emiratis to seek employment in the private sector.

In 2019, Emiratis made up only 0.5 per cent of the private sector workforce (Clark, 2019). Females constitute 66 per cent of the workforce in the government sector, of which 30 per cent are in decision making or leadership positions. However, the employment of nationals in the public sector has reached the “saturation point” as more and more Emirati national fresh graduates are seeking employment in higher paid, secure, and respected public sector. In the light of the labor market dynamic in the UAE, Harry (2007) brings out that the bias against women in employment could continue to impede their participation in it, suggesting that it may even worsen if they are to compete with their male counterparts for the same positions.

The life of Arab women has become one of the most rapidly changing elements of Arab societies due to westernization and modernization. Yet at the same time, the Arabic politico-economic and patriarchal social systems, the role and place of women in the society is gendered and limited to the private sphere (Cundiff, 2017). When women do participate in workforce or engage in public life without authorization from the government, husbands, or elders, their actions are considered an obstruction, a threat to law and order, and in direct disobedience to societal norm (Ali and Machaira, 2013).

Islamic perspective

Islam allows women to own property, run a business; buy, sell and lease; as well to involve in various trade or contract. Quran specifies that a woman can own money by the job she earns: {Whatever men earn, they have a share of that and whatever women earn, they have a share in that} (The Quran, 4:32). Hence preventing a woman from working outside home without any clear justification is contradictory action to verse and women have their right to go out of the home to work provided they adhere to Islamic guidance.

Islamic scholars and researchers have categorized the Islamic guidance for women’s work into three categories relating to the women themselves, the work involved, and the society at large (Asar and Bouhedda, 2016). First, women are allowed to work outside of home due to the economic need either because she needs to support her family or she is a widow, a divorcee, or unmarried who does not or cannot ask money from her extended family. Women are also allowed to work outside of home where her services are needed in the society due to her gender, such as nursing or treating other women. The permission of the male legal guardian of the woman must be obtained before going outside her home to do permissible work. As an underlying rule, a woman can work outside of her home if she adheres to what Islam has taught in its teachings about women’s manners. Second, the Islamic guidelines regarding women’s work deals with the type of work itself. The work activities need to be halal or permissible by Islam, and cannot result in sinful activities. Work should not prevent the woman from fulfilling her duties as a wife and/or a mother. Islamic scholars argue that the role of the wife and mother is greater than its need for female workers who could be replaced by many men especially with the high rate of unemployment among men. The work also should not lead a Muslim woman to travel without Mahram or that the woman’s work should be suitable for with the nature of
women. Third, Islamic researchers hold that a Muslim woman should work in an Islam friendly environment.

Legal context

The UAE is governed both by Sharia (Islamic law) and civil law. Issues pertaining to Muslim women are often drawn from religious principles and the UAE Labor Law (No. 8 of 1980) which continues to place certain restrictions on women’s employment options and rights based on gender stereotypes. Article 34 of the UAE Constitution provides every Emirati citizen with the right to freely choose his or her own occupation, trade, or profession. However, Article 29 prohibits the recruitment of women for “hazardous, arduous, or physically or morally harmful work” or other forms of work to be decided by the Ministry of Labor. Article 27 of the labor law states that “no woman shall be required to work at night,” which is defined as “a period of no less than 11 successive hours between 10 p.m. and 7 a.m.” This has often been interpreted as a ban on women working at night (Kirdar, 2010). Exceptions to this prohibition exist under Article 28 for instances in which a woman’s nighttime work is necessitated by force majeure, is executive, administrative or technical in nature, is in the health services, or does not involve manual labor as decided by the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs.

The UAE Personal Status Law of 2005 prescribes every Muslim woman to have a male guardian, normally a father or husband, but in some cases a brother, uncle or even a son, who has the power to make a range of critical decisions on her behalf. Without their guardian’s consent, women cannot work or travel abroad, which violates their right to freedom of movement guaranteed by Article 29 of the UAE constitution.

While the UAE has taken great steps in improving women’s role in the society such as Emiratization policies and increasing women’s political participation, the societal and familial perception of the role of women continue to pose the biggest barrier to women’s labor force participation and career development.

METHODOLOGY

Social constructionism, as a foundational approach for this research, is considered a welcome alternative to the study of careers due to its incorporation of themes relating to the social context within which careers evolve (Cohen et al., 2004). In career studies, social constructionism encourages us to acknowledge the relationship between career and social order and how context and social order influence the construction of career (Omair, 2010). Social cognitive career theory proposes a number of factors that could influence individuals’ career decision-making self-efficacy, such as personal variables (e.g. age and gender), contextual variables (e.g. perceived support or barriers from family, peers, and society), and experiential variables (e.g. learning sources) (Lent et. al., 1994). While this paper is about Arab women, the specific context of this paper is the United Arab Emirates and the focus of the paper is Emirati women specifically. The term Arab women refers to women from Oman to Morocco with diverse social or cultural contexts. A woman’s experiences in one Arabic country may not be comparable to another country. The authors believe that the narrower the research context, the more accurate results can be gained from the empirical research.

Women’s working lives and careers are traditionally studied through the interviews or surveys conducted on female respondents. While the focus of this paper is women’s careers, the need for a permission to work from male guardians, requires us to study the male respondents who in the context of this study, have the ultimate power over women’s employment choices.

The research material of this paper consists of twenty narratives from women’s legal guardians which are in the form of written text. Emirati women in professional or managerial positions, aged between 24 and 30 years, were asked to contact their Mahrams to participate in
this research. Twelve respondents for this study were husband and eight were fathers of unmarried women. All Emirati women were at the beginning of their career development. The authors believe that Mahrams’ restrictions would be more prevalent in case of younger women than the older ones with established careers.

EMPIRICAL FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Sector and industry specific characteristics
The most common sector where Mahrams would like their female family members to work was the public sector. All of the respondents expressed strong preference for their female family members to work in the public sector. Public sector employment in the UAE has reached a saturation point (Al-Wagfi and Forstenlechner, 2012, Harry, 2007; Rees et al., 2007) and the UAE government has taken steps through Emiratization policies to attract Emiratis to private sector. The proportion of Emiratis currently employed in the private sector is as low as 1 per cent (Forstenlechner, 2010). Despite the Emiratization policies, that date back to two decades and the government efforts to push Emiratis to work in the private sector, the male family members still prefer their women to work in the public rather than private sector.

The main reasons for preferring public sector employment for women was higher wages, shorter working hours and the reputation of the industry. Seventy per cent of the respondents mentioned that the concern for sexual harassment was one of the main concerns when considering employment options for their women. Public sector employment with segregated offices provide a safer environment for women to work. Omair (2009) explained that from the viewpoint of women managers in contemporary working life, this suggests that women can only leave the private spheres when completely covered and accompanied by a male guardian and women’s managerial careers are only possible in segregated work places, where the interaction of men and women is excluded.

In this study respondents also believed that public sector provides better career opportunities for women. When asked why private sector career development is not perceived as beneficial, the respondents suggested that private sector jobs are less stable and it would be harder for an Emirati woman to grow in her career. While, the Emiratization policies suggest great career development opportunities for Emiratis in the private sector, the respondents of this study disagreed. The main reason was that public sector jobs are stable and secure, within time, women especially competing against other Emirati women, can reach higher positions, especially in segregated public sector offices. Our study respondents considered public sector institutions, education, non-profit organizations and banking to be most reputable industries. The least favorable choice for employment was in law firms, construction industry and hospitality.

Job related characteristics
When asked about the type of work that Mahrams would find suitable for women, many respondents said that the work itself should not be physically straining or involve long working hours. Sales and marketing jobs were not favorable since it includes interacting with large number of people, either Muslim or non-Muslim men and women.

The most favorable jobs for an Arab woman are office bound, such as administrative work, according to this study respondents. This indicates that it is very important for Arab women’s male family members to know that women are working in a safe environment with little mobility to external environments.

Organizational characteristics
Mahrams in this study reported that organizational environment is another important factor to consider when allowing their female family members to work. The main criteria is the
demographics of the organizations. The ratio of men and women is important, as well as the ratio of Muslim and non-Muslims and the number of Emiratis working in the organizations. Preference is given to organizations that have a high number of female employees, preferable Muslim and a good number of Emiratis. It is important for Mahrams that women work among other Emirati women. Few Mahrams (25%) mentioned that the nationality and gender of the supervisor was an important criterion. Female supervisors would be preferred over male supervisors and Emirati supervisors over other nationalities. These results indicate that Emirati men would like their female family members to work in environments that are similar to their domestic environments by being surrounded by Emirati women.

The organizations that deal with haram (forbidden according to Islam) products and services, or engage in business that could lead to haram activities, are considered unacceptable working environments for Arab women. Dealings with alcohol or other harmful substances or hospitality and entertainment industry were brought as examples. Hospitality or entertainment industry may allow mixing of men and women unrelated to each other and may result in unlawful activities.

CONCLUSION

This paper contributes to the social cognitive career theory development by addressing one of its major shortcomings, namely the question of how free individuals are in their career choice. In case of Arab women and based on the Islamic guidelines and several Arab countries’ labor law, Arab women are not often free to make their own career choices. In the context of this study, women need to submit a written permission from their male legal guardians upon accepting an employment offer. While the Arab woman is free to seek employment in different industries and organizations, the final career choice decision lies with her Mahram, the legal male guardian. The results of this study show that despite government efforts to promote female labor force participation and increase the attractiveness of the private sector, the male guardians still hold a very traditional viewpoint of what jobs are acceptable for an Arab woman. Government efforts to promote Emiratizations need not only to be targeted at Emirati youth but also at their family members who ultimately are in charge of career choice decisions.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT IN THE AGE OF INFORMATION OVERLOAD

KENNETH M. SWEET
Texas A&M University-San Antonio
One University Way
San Antonio, TX 78224
kenneth.sweet@tamusa.edu

KATHRYN APPENZELLER KNOWLES
Texas A&M University-San Antonio

ETHAN WAPLES
University of Houston-Downtown

“That’s why you get paid the big bucks” is a phrase often directed at organizational leaders facing tough decisions. Indeed, decision making is an essential function of leadership (Tichy & Bennis, 2007; Vroom & Yetton, 1973), and the decisions of organizational leaders can create broad-reaching effects which transform individuals, organizations, and society as a whole (Schneider, 2002). Accordingly, how leaders make decisions, as well as methods for developing the decision-making capacity of leaders, has been studied from diverse perspectives such as rationality (Miska et al., 2014), intuition (Samba et al., 2019), empathy (Holt & Marques, 2012), and affect (George, 2000). Concurrently, the field of leadership development focuses on building the organizational capacity to recognize and solve previously unforeseen challenges (Dixon, 1993), often at least partially through building the skills of individual leaders (Day, 2000). In the field of leadership development, decision making is considered an essential skill that must be developed in individual leaders (Schoemaker, 2013).

Of late, much attention has been paid to the increasingly dynamic nature of the internal and external environments faced by organizations, oftentimes characterized by the acronym VUCA: volatile, uncertain, complex, and ambiguous (Mack et al., 2016). Today, organizational leaders frequently face VUCA environments and must now be developed to make decisions under these conditions (Lawrence, 2013). A common organizational response to VUCA environments is the systematic collection and analysis of massive amounts of data, which has been enabled by advanced technologies, hyperconnectivity, and artificial intelligence (Elkington, 2018). As a result, some business scholars have termed the current era as the information age (Roetzel, 2019), while others have more playfully called it the age of information overload (Levitin, 2015). Without doubt, there is a shift in the environment in which leaders make decisions and the related characteristics, skills and competencies previously linked to effective decision making may be incomplete for effective leader development in the age of information overload. We argue that an emphasis on quantitative reasoning is a necessary addition to contemporary leadership development programs.

The purpose of this paper is to introduce quantitative reasoning to the leadership development and management education literatures. Quantitative reasoning is a higher-order competence in the use of quantitative information (i.e., data, math, statistics, or logic) within the context of practical situations (Karaali et al., 2016). To combat information overload, organizations employ a wide assortment of experts in the analysis of data, with job titles such as business analyst, data scientist, management analyst, operations researcher, statistician, and systems analyst, who primarily serve to transform large quantities of data into digestible information to enable leader decision making. As a result, organizations have rapidly adopted terms like data-driven decision making to describe a systematic approach to leveraging big data and artificial intelligence to enable leader decision making (Brynjolfsson & McElheran, 2016).
Without the ability to make sense of quantitative information, to weigh the value of information from different sources, and to apply the information making within context, leaders may be overwhelmed by contemporary decision-making processes (Saaty, 1990). As a result, two outcomes might be expected when encountering complex quantitative information in a decision situation, neither of which likely leads to high-quality decision making. First, an underprepared leader may ignore the quantitative information as a coping mechanism to reduce the demands of the decision situation (Carillo, 2017). In these situations, the leader will likely overemphasize the value of experience and intuition and disregard the quantitative information, as supported by decades of research on bounded rationality (Simon, 1991). Alternatively, an underprepared leader may acquiesce to the quantitative information (e.g., recommendation of an analyst, artificial intelligence decision aid, or subject-matter expert) without adequately questioning the assumptions, methodology, or rigor of the data analysis. In these situations, the leader will likely undervalue their own experience and intuition, as well as other competing sources of information (Mosier & Skitka, 1996). Interestingly, both approaches serve as a form of “saving face,” rather than admitting that they did not understand the information presented and were unable to effectively integrate it into their decision schema. VUCA environments increase the demands on leader decision making, as well as the magnitude of effects that result from those decisions (Lawrence, 2013). Increasing scholarly and practitioner attention on integrating quantitative reasoning throughout the leadership development process will enable leaders to effectively incorporate quantitative information in their decision-making processes and will lead to more efficacious decisions and improved results for organizations.

Next, we briefly review the literature around quantitative reasoning, which has emerged primarily in the mathematics education field focusing on primary, secondary, and higher education. We believe that adopting the findings of this literature to the leadership development field will improve the quality of organizational leadership as it relates to decision making in VUCA environments. We then offer a model of leadership development incorporating foundational elements required to develop quantitative reasoning as a leadership competency. We conclude with implications for practice and directions for future research.

**QUANTITATIVE REASONING AND DECISION MAKING**

It seems intuitive that reasoning is an essential element of effective leader decision making and scholars have explored the fundamental role of reasons in the decision processes of leaders (Westaby et al., 2010). Further, specific forms of reasoning have been examined in relation to specific types of decisions, for example moral reasoning and ethical decision making (Small & Lew, 2021). Studies in these areas have recommended that organizational leadership development programs focus on building leader competence in reasoning to improve future decision making (e.g., Thiel et al., 2012). We extend this thinking to recommend that leadership development and management education programs focus on quantitative reasoning to improve leader decision making in VUCA environments where analytic products and quantitative information saturate decision-making situations. In the remainder of this section we briefly review the literature on quantitative reasoning and discuss its relevance to the leadership development literature.

The emergent study of quantitative reasoning is gaining prominence in the field of mathematics education as advocates recognize the need for citizens in the information age to be quantitatively literate; that is, able to understand and interpret quantitative information, identify misinformation, pose intelligent questions of experts, and confront authority confidently (Steen, 2001). In mathematics education, the lexicon of individual quantitative attributes remains hotly debated, and there is not full agreement on the definitions of several concepts related to quantitative reasoning, including numeracy, quantitative literacy, and others (Cardetti et al.,
The term numeracy, as a quantitative equivalent to literacy, first appeared in the 1959 Crowther Report. Subsequent scholars broadened the concept of numeracy and introduced quantitative literacy as at-homeness, comfort, and habit of mind when working with numerical information and mathematical representations. More recently, quantitative reasoning has been introduced to describe higher-order critical thinking necessary to understand and create sophisticated arguments involving quantitative evidence. A common thread among these concepts is individual “competence in interacting with myriad mathematical and statistical representations of the real world, in the contexts of daily life, work situations, and the civic engagement” (Kraali, Hernandez, & Taylor, 2016, p. 25). Among them, quantitative reasoning generally represents a higher-order competency in understanding and applying quantitative information (Cardetti et al., 2019). A thorough review of the debate around how these terms are used and interrelated is beyond the scope of our aims. Instead, we merge thinking on quantitative reasoning with that of other specified forms of reasoning in the management literature. With this view, quantitative reasoning is the set of cognitive skills a leader needs to reason in the face of quantitative information, much like moral reasoning is the “set of cognitive skills a manager employs to reason about a moral problem” (Elm & Nichols, 1993).

Quantitative information is constructed within social contexts and each community has its own pattern of discourse when interacting with quantitative information (Fisher, 2019). For example, data scientists, engineers, and finance professionals all understand, interpret, analyze, and create quantitative information in unique ways. Quantitative reasoning requires that individuals learn how to represent their mathematical reasoning in ways that others can follow and understand, both orally and in writing (Cardetti et al., 2019). For example, a business analyst must make assumptions about the nature of the problem, which influences what data they include, analytical methodology, and data is presented to a decision maker. As decision makers, leaders need not be experts in the specific forms of analysis, but must understand how to make sense of the information presented, question the assumptions of analysts, and integrate the quantitative information into their own decision-making processes. While it might be tempting then to try and generate a list of quantitative skills which equate to competence with quantitative reasoning, any such list is likely to grow exceedingly long. Instead, by recognizing the relationship between quantitative information, context, and communication, quantitative reasoning may be best developed by thinking about the social contexts in which numbers arise, underlying mathematical concepts, and the ways social groups use quantitative information.

Implicit in this discussion is the role quantitative reasoning likely plays in decision-making processes where the context is rich with quantitative reasoning, as it typically is in contemporary VUCA environments. Likewise, the field of mathematics education has argued that individuals must engage in quantitative reasoning to make effective decisions as citizens, students, and employees in a data-driven world (Steen, 2001). In the era of information overload, people cannot avoid engaging with data, whether they choose to embrace or ignore quantitative information. For example, media coverage of the COVID-19 pandemic was saturated with infographics, epidemiology statistics, and medical research information, and social media interactions brought to light significant gaps in the quantitative reasoning of the public at large (Ancker, 2021). While numerous articles were published to encourage citizens to make informed decisions, misinformation and disinformation were readily accepted as truth while scientifically valid evidence was disregarded as misinformation (e.g., Connor, 2021; Lewis, 2021; Wang, 2021). Moving into the workplace, employees likely had to build decision-supporting information papers and briefings to enable senior leaders to make decisions about policy changes in response to COVID-19 (e.g., remote work, face masks, vaccination mandates, etc.) with significant impacts on business operations, risk management, and financial costs. In this particular example, the ability to effectively respond to COVID-19 was dependent on effective decision making and decision making was dependent on a general understanding of probability.
While the COVID-19 pandemic may appear to be a novel situation, it has made clear that quantitative reasoning aids leaders in understanding and evaluating quantitative information to reach conclusions and make efficacious decisions.

Organizational leaders must be critical consumers of presented information, follow sophisticated arguments, and understand supporting quantitative evidence. They must have the confidence and competence to recognize the mathematical principles being employed to generate information and recommendations from data, to ask intelligent questions of the experts and analysts, to clarify misunderstandings and voice their hesitations, and to suggest alternative viewpoints. Effective leadership development programs in the information age should produce leaders with competence in quantitative reasoning, such that organizational decision makers have habit of mind, comfort, and skill when faced with quantitative information. Evidence suggests that individuals assumed to be highly numerate (e.g., medical doctors) may not be (Taylor & Byrne-Davis, 2017), and this is likely true of leaders in industry, government, and other social institutions. In the next section we briefly discuss how contemporary models of leadership development might be enhanced to improve the quantitative reasoning of organizational leaders.

QUANTITATIVE REASONING IN THE LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT MODEL

There are myriad articles covering leader development, leadership development, and management education in general. For most accurate overviews, we suggest Day (2000), Day et al. (2014), and a special issue of Advances in Developing Human Resources in 2016 (Issue 18). For our purposes, we focus on aspects of these reviews, namely the distinction between leader development and leadership development. Specifically, Day (2000) notes leader development as focusing on intrapersonal aspects of leadership, such as knowledge, skill, and individual cognition. On the other hand, leadership development hones in on interpersonal aspects of leadership, such as relationships, influence, and communication (among others). As these topics relate to quantitative reasoning, we note the importance of leader development as a foundation or antecedent of needed leadership development. That is, we couch the use of quantitative reasoning as a skill that obviously involves individual level aptitudes, but rather we stress herein the importance of leader use of quantitative data during the decision-making process. In a VUCA world – we suggest this process is mostly one that is interpersonal in nature. Below, we delve into the interpersonal nature of leader decision making.

Typically, people – in general – use one of two broad types of cognition in order to make decisions. The first, system one thinking, is relatively automatic in nature, does not question information or assumptions, and utilizes past information to make quick decisions based mostly on intuition, often automatically (CITE). On the other hand, system two thinking engages the assessment of information, the examination of assumptions, questions about the origins and meaning of the data, and an evaluation (i.e., forecasting) of multiple pathways to solving a problem (CITE). For leader development, some may argue that building the intuitive capacity (i.e., system one) can be a key for leaders to “rise in the ranks” (CITE). For leadership development, the argument is quite different. Developing leadership means supporting and enhancing the social and organizational environment where decision are made by leaders. Hence, the focus is on system two thinking – where leaders rely not only on their own cognition but the collective cognitions of those around them – to solve problems. Below, we explicate why this is essential, particularly given the VUCA world.

Perhaps one of the clearer discussions of leadership in the VUCA world was offered by Mumford et al. (2007). Here, Munford outlined a model of leader cognition specifically for complex, ill-defined environments where rapid change is occurring – leader cognition in crises. Decidedly VUCA, crisis place pressure on leaders to define the problem, identify constraints and resources required, identify the appropriate goal(s) to solve the problem, forecast solutions and
outcomes, and then message that “vision” out to followers (Mumford et al., 2007). Indeed, Mumford outlined the five conditions the typically exist during crises. First, leaders who are successful are able to optimize and choose the best solution among alternatives. Second, leaders must be able to navigate complexity and ambiguity by identifying key causes – accurately – and act on them. Third, the more novel the problem at hand, the more cognition is required in the form of generating solutions and evaluating their potential (i.e., generation and forecasting). Fourth, cognitive resources are required – meaning strategies to mitigate stress are essential to ensuring bandwidth is available. Fifth and finally, the more social support, the more potential for effectiveness in crisis. Taken together, these elements point to the notion that, for leaders to be successful in such situations, intelligence or advanced cognition will not help a leader get out of a crisis if stress and pressure soak up the available bandwidth required for problem solving. Leaders must optimize, accurately appraise and identify elements of the problem space, have time to think creatively regarding solutions, avoid additional stress and distractions, and be supported. Clearly, this sounds much like a situation suited for leadership – not leader – development. And, in fact, the approaches to develop leadership under these conditions are decidedly social in nature. So then, what does this imply for a basic building block for all future? How can leadership development be enhanced to ensure decisions in a VUCA world a driven by the appropriate use of quantitative information? Next, we offer a strategy for infusing any leadership development program – even management education in higher education (i.e., business school curriculum) – with the appropriate practice for utilizing and applying quantitative skills.

A Process-based Approach to Making (ANY) Decision

First, leaders are making decisions under uncertainty, and they must begin to do so with individuals who are equally engaged in the process of systematic thinking and decision making. By systematic, we mean not relying purely on that system one, intuitive reasoning part of our brain. The earlier the leader(s) are in their experience and level of expertise, the less they are able to reliably use their intuition to accurately judge, well, anything. Process is key. Utilizing or presenting a traditional decision making model offered in a management text is a great start. For several reasons, we recommend starting with the model offered by Mumford et al. (2007). We extrapolated the core steps and walk through them briefly – highlighting in particular the steps where quantitative information is likely to be introduced, assessed, and message.

First – scanning – where leaders are scanning internally and externally for any changes or abnormalities, according to what we know about our environments. This may, and likely will, include data. Perhaps there are stock or commodity prices, sales figures, employee absence or satisfaction data, or competitor product information. Whatever we are scanning, we are examining data to determine if a potential abnormality exists. This is the first point where we must realize that cognition, inherently biased, can lead us astray. Any number of biases – anchoring, regression to the mean, representativeness – could lead us to ignore a potential problem buried in the data. To avoid this, leadership development programs need to focus on both identification and awareness of cognitive biases as well as coaching and practicing techniques such as devil’s advocate or questioning decisions. In essence, the more individuals that are able to review data and discuss it consistency or abnormality, the more likely issues (i.e., problems) will be identified accurately and moved forward.

Following scanning, information is gathered and individuals begin to frame the problem and the underlying causes of the problem. While data is likely used at this point, it shouldn’t be scrutinized or evaluated yet – information seemingly relevant should simply be gathered. Then, as the problem is framed through the identification of causes of the problem, consequences of the problem, and goals for solving the problem – case knowledge (cf., Mumford et al., 2007; Mumford et al., 2017) is activated. This knowledge, examples of how we or others have handled
or experienced problems in the past, do not have to be exact matches to the problem, but perhaps share elements of the problem itself. Once cases are activated, we begin to analyze the cases in terms of the internal (causes, available resources, restrictions to solution, contingencies for solution) and external (goals, actors, affect of actors, systems and their interactions) elements at play. This additional framing exercise allows us to form a prescriptive mental model – which is a representation of the problem space and how we expect to navigate through the space, or solve the problem. It is a literal mental model of what is happening and how we will reach goals.

Perhaps at this moment is where the importance of quantitative reasoning comes into play most centrally. Now, we are truly forecasting – simulating and planning from a mental perspective. This begins with generating multiple forecasts, modeling out what would occur based on an optimal or perhaps suboptimal solution. Forecasts are then evaluated to determine which course of action is most likely to result in the best possible outcome, identified at the start. Implementation plans, and backup plans, are created – and then the social influence process begins in order to on board various units as to the necessary actions to address the problem or crisis at hand – effectively.

The application of the framework discussed above allows for the process based, methodical collection, discussion, and evaluation of information related to leadership decisions. Solving problems in this way is akin to tackling a mathematical problem with a specific formula – it force the steps required to train the brain – the cognitive actor – in the steps needed to reach the solution. Over time, then, leaders will identify similar problems and understand both the problems and potential solutions in faster time. This will occur much like many older adults quickly recognize 7 times 7 is 49. But again, it is only through the application of the process that leaders can be developed, over time, to slow down their tendency for quick actions and interpretations of data that are often biased and inaccurate.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
Organizational Social Media Orientation

SM marketing scope refers to the way an organization uses SM marketing to communicate with stakeholders, or their organizational SM orientation, which exists on a continuum anchored by defenders and explorers (Felix et al., 2017). For example, as a defender, Apple has openly resisted participating in SM, claiming that SM platforms harvesting and selling user data is in direct odds with Apple’s core values of protecting user data (Statt, 2017). Apple’s SM policy discourages employees from identifying as Apple employees or discussing Apple on SM platforms. Additionally, they cannot use blogs, wikis, social networks or other tools to communicate with fellow employees (Camm-Jones, 2011). On the other hand, as an explorer, IBM believes that SM platforms empower their employees to be “masses of communicators,” and has organizational policies that encourage employees to utilize SM to collaborate with both internal and external stakeholders (IBM, 2019).

Defenders primarily use SM as a one-way communication tool to push out information to consumers. Interaction between the organization and consumers is either not supported or not standardized across SM platforms. SM interaction between employees and consumers is highly controlled and/or strongly discouraged (Felix et al., 2017). This defender stance may occur as a consequence of industry factors (e.g., military defense firms protecting government secrets), product factors (e.g., luxury goods that face diminishing brand perceptions with ease of access), or resource factors (e.g., the organization does not have the capabilities to engage in interactive communication).

Comparatively, organizations that are classified as explorers use SM as a two-way communication tool with multiple stakeholders to encourage open interaction, integration, and collaboration. They focus on reciprocal relationship-building with stakeholders and strongly encourage employee SM engagement (Felix et al., 2017). SM provides the organization with the power to richly interact with and quickly respond to users (Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010). In order to carry out an explorer strategy, organizations need talented employees who can create content and interact with stakeholders. Given the broad and varying demands of different stakeholder groups, it is difficult for organizations to prepare SM responses or content in anticipation of every situation. Within the fast-paced online environment, organizations must rely on the talents and judgement of employees to create and deploy appropriate SM content. The specific skills and knowledge pertaining to SM engagement are particularly important for employees in service-driven industries, given the unique nature of each encounter with individual customers (Subramony & Pugh, 2015).

Individual Social Media Orientation

Research suggests that privacy concerns occur as a consequence of the individual’s predisposition to be guarded and protective of others’ access to their personal information (Taylor et al., 2015). An individual’s privacy orientation is defined as “the extent to which an individual guards and limits access to their personal information” (Taylor et al., 2015, p. 102).
Privacy orientation may play a part in SM usage behaviors, where individuals who are low in privacy orientation exhibit higher levels of SM usage and those high in privacy orientation exhibit lower levels of SM usage. As such, an individual’s SM orientation is defined as the extent to which the individual controls and guards their personal information on social media.

Individual SM orientation can be classified along a continuum between being guarded or interactive when it comes to sharing information on SM. Guarded individuals strive to limit access to their personal information and exhibit high levels of privacy concern on SM. They are highly selective in the information they share online and tend to use SM more as an information consumer, not as a contributor. Interactive individuals freely share their personal information with others and have a lower regard for privacy. These individuals’ value interactive relationships and see SM as a tool for building relationships and engaging with their connections.

Social Media Engagement Framework

The dual dimensions of SM orientation, based on the social media orientations of both the individual and the organization, create a matrix of four possible patterns of social media engagement. Defined as the congruence of SM orientations between an individual and an organization, the SM engagement framework represents the compatibility of the individual and organization based on SM participation preferences.

The first dimension considers the SM orientation of the individual and is identified as either guarded or interactive. The second dimension is the social media policies of the organization, with organizations categorized as being either defender or explorer (Felix et al., 2017). In the SM engagement framework, employees are classified as either contented, exposed, suppressed, or emboldened depending on the interaction of individual and organizational SM orientations (see Figure 1). An individual’s desire to be either guarded or interactive has the potential to create conflict in situations of mismatch with the organization’s SM orientation. Where emboldened and contented individuals represent congruence between the individual and organizational SM orientation, exposed and suppressed individuals represent incongruence between individual and organizational SM orientation.

Individuals who seek to work for organizations with a defender SM orientation and who are guarded in their own SM information sharing are classified as contented. Contented employees minimally engage in SM due to their desire for higher levels of personal privacy, which aligns with the organization’s policies limiting employee SM activity. As such, these individuals should experience higher levels of fit with the organization. Contented employees work well for employers or in positions that use a defender approach in SM, as they should not feel pressure to engage with, contribute to, or learn new social media platforms. Further, because of this alignment, infractions against reasonable SM corporate policies should be rare.

Individuals who are guarded in their SM orientation yet seek employment at organizations with an explorer SM orientation, are classified as exposed. These individuals may face pressure from the employer or peers to engage and contribute on SM platforms at levels above their personal comfort level. Exposed individuals may either abandon their individual SM orientation or fail to conform to organizational norms, leading to lower levels of job satisfaction and organizational commitment, as well as higher turnover intentional. Further, exposed individuals may be at a disadvantage, as their lack of SM presence would leave them with less understanding of the level of importance or usage of SM by organizations for which they are applying or working.

For individuals who are interactive, employment in a defender organization that has stricter SM usage policies may cause conflict. The strict organizational SM orientation may hamper the professional and personal engagement of individuals on SM. These individuals are classified as suppressed, due to the pressure to conform to policies that do not align with their personal SM orientation. As applicants, suppressed individuals may find it difficult to obtain
employment at firms with strict online policies if they include SM screens in the selection process. If ultimately employed, suppressed individuals may find themselves restricted in their ability to use SM or violation of corporate SM policies.

Individuals who are interactive and involved with an explorer organization are classified as *emboldened*. Emboldened individuals will likely have little compartmentalization between personal and professional SM content or networks. They will likely have a high level of compatibility with the organization as they have encouragement to be an active SM user. Their propensity to use SM must be channeled appropriately through training, as even an explorer organization must remain cognizant of the risks associated with minimally controlled SM engagement. Emboldened individuals may perceive high organizational and supervisor support, due to the congruence with organizational policies. This congruence could lead to higher levels of job satisfaction, organizational commitment, and increases in job performance and innovation.

**Attraction-Similarity-Attrition Theory**

According to Schneider’s (1987) attraction-selection-attrition (ASA) model, employees select themselves into and out of companies based on perceived fit with the organization. Applicants are more attracted to companies whose “personality” resembles theirs (Judge & Cable, 1997). They can develop impressions about an organization’s reputation even with minimal exposure and little information (Slaughter et al., 2004), discovered through employment interviews (Judge & Cable, 1997) or information found online (Braddy et al., 2006; Gardner et al., 2009).

During the selection process, potential applicants weigh different job and organizational characteristics to determine if a potential vacancy, or organization, is a good fit (Chatman, 1991). These characteristics are often the basis for forming initial impressions of fit with an organization and provide the basis for initial attraction (Thomas & Wise, 1999). Information received by applicants throughout the recruitment process helps to foster an understanding of the organization and its members (Rynes & Barber, 1990), and determine which organizations an applicant should continue to pursue (Schwab et al., 1987). Applicants are often attracted to organizations with characteristics that they infer espouse values like their own (Chatman, 1991).

An applicant’s initial impression of an organization is based on incomplete information (Schwoerer & Rosen, 1989). Signaling theory has been used to explore how both organizations and people make decisions when there is incomplete information in fields such as organizational strategy and applicant job choice (Karasek & Bryant, 2012). When applied to applicant decision making, signaling theory suggests that applicants desire to make an accurate judgment about a potential employer, but do not have the full information to do so. Therefore, the information they do possess is interpreted as signals for other organizational characteristics that they care about (Goldberg & Allen, 2008; Rynes, 1991; Turban & Cable, 2003). Observable actions of employees and the organization can be used to infer unobservable characteristics of an organization such as whether they exhibit care and concern for employees (McNall et al., 2010). For example, positive reputations of firms may serve as a signal that those organizations would be a good place to work (Turban & Cable, 2003). Using these signals, applicants make inferences about whether or not their personality, values, and needs fit with the organization (Saks & Ashforth, 1997). The greater the perception of fit, the greater the attraction the applicant will have to the organization (Ehrhart & Ziegert, 2005; Rentsch & McEwen, 2002).

The underlying process through which perceptions of fit influence organizational attraction can be explained by the similarity-attraction paradigm, which suggests that people are typically more attracted to others who are more similar to them (Dineen et al., 2002). When making comparisons, individuals, anchored by their own attributes, assess the information (e.g., values and beliefs) that any entity (e.g., an organization) provides. If that information is regarded positively, the entity is more likely to be judged favorably (Ajzen, 1991). Furthermore,
individuals assign importance to the attributes known about an entity, and the more salient and important the attribute is to the person, the more attracted one becomes to an entity that is similar on that attribute (Montoya & Horton, 2013). SM orientation may be more important to some applicants than others. While compensation and organizational reputations may generally be important to applicants, organizational SM usage and policies may also be an important aspect or signal of organizational culture.

In the same way that people form an attraction to a person based on perceived similarity, they may also become attracted to organizations that they perceive are like themselves in important ways (e.g., shared values). Two predictions stem from the similarity-attraction hypothesis. First, as the relationship continues and more similarities are found, the attraction should continue to increase. Second, people project their own sense of self on the other entity in the relationship, thereby further increasing attraction (Byrne, 1971). This is thought to occur without conscious awareness, such that perceived similarity is just as important (and maybe even more so) in predicting attraction as actual similarity (Hoyle, 1993). In forming fit perceptions, applicants may pay more attention to information that is more important to them, such that those attributes that have more influence on their perceptions of fit, and ultimately, their attraction to an organization (Montoya & Horton, 2013).

Perceived fit, similarity or congruence on specific attributes, is a predictor of attraction (Carless, 2005; Ehrhart & Ziegert, 2005; Harold & Ployhart, 2008; Judge & Cable, 1997; Schreurs et al., 2009) and attraction outcomes, such as accepting a job offer (Chapman et al., 2005). Applicants who perceive that an organization’s SM orientation matches with their own expectations, should indicate a greater sense of fit and attraction to the organization. That attraction should then increase the likelihood of applying to open positions within that organization. However, when there is a perceived mismatch between an applicant’s and organization’s SM orientation, the applicant should experience lower levels of fit and attraction to the organization, decreasing the likelihood of applying to open positions at that organization.

While an organization seeks diversity in competencies of employees (Schneider, 1987), applicants are often selected due to their “fit,” or similarity in personality to current organization members (Oh et al., 2017). Once selected, new employees undergo a socialization process where they further adapt their values to that of the organization. As such, perceptions of value congruence increase over time (De Cooman et al., 2009). However, during the socialization process, pre-hire perceptions of fit may change.

Attraction to the organization and satisfaction with the job can change throughout the socialization process as individuals gain more information about the actual environment and culture of the organization (Ehrhart and Ziegert, 2005), and their perceptions of value congruence with the organization change (Rentsch and McEwen, 2002). If information about the organization’s characteristics and what it supplies to fulfill employees’ psychological needs matches with the desires of an applicant, they will perceive greater value congruence and, as such, fit with the organization (O’Reilly et al., 1991; Harold & Ployhart, 2008; De Cooman et al., 2009; Barrick & Parks-Leduc, 2019). Value congruence fit is predictive of turnover intentions, such that greater fit reaffirms the employee’s satisfaction with choosing the job/company, which decreases the likelihood of attrition from the organization (O’Reilly et al., 1991; De Cooman et al., 2009; Barrick & Parks-Leduc, 2019). If an employee with an interactive SM orientation is initially attracted to an organization that they perceive to have an explorer SM orientation and their expectations are validated or violated, this should affect their job satisfaction and desire to remain in the organization. Similarly, whether the expectations of SM orientation congruence are met or upended for a guarded employee who values privacy and discretion in SM usage will affect their job satisfaction and intentions to leave the organization.

DISCUSSION
As part of the employment process, both employers and job seekers need to evaluate the individual’s SM orientation alignment with the organization’s SM orientation as one potential measure of perceived fit. Some job seekers who have a strong SM prowess may benefit from SM transparency, and organizations could benefit from the employee’s personal network and engagement. However, in some industries or professions, organizations may need SM guidelines that restrict usage, guard SM accounts, and use excessive caution. With varying needs among employers, there can no longer be a one-size fits all approach to how job seekers and employees treat SM. By being acknowledging different SM orientations, both from the job seekers’ and organizations’ perspective, and openly engaging in that conversation companies could attract more likeminded applicants reducing potential job offer rejections because of increased perceived fit (Chapman et al., 2005; Ehrhart & Ziegert, 2005).

The traditional advice that job seekers exercise high privacy and scrub all accounts may not be relevant across all jobs, organizations, professions, and industries. When alignment of values leads to more contented and emboldened individuals, SM orientation congruency could increase the individuals’ attraction to the organization, job satisfaction, organizational commitment, and reduce turnover intentions. Research in this area has the potential to expand the concept of organizational fit to include dimensions of SM orientation congruency.

The ASA model provides a lens to understand how organizations can reinforce their desired SM behaviors and culture. By attracting SM congruent applicants who are selected for the job and remain at the organization, the result is an increased homogeneity amongst tenured employees who reinforce the established expected behaviors (Schneider, 1987; Denton, 1999). Some employers prefer a tightly controlled SM environment where professional SM managers control messaging for the company, whether it be because information control is a critical component of their operations or it is an assumption of the company’s culture. Organizations that must maintain high levels of discretion, such as some government agencies and their affiliated contractors, need to control information flows across all mediums, including SM. Alternatively, some organizations find that value is created when they encourage stakeholders to creatively pursue company-related SM posting, sharing, and networking. Organizations may benefit greatly by emboldened employees that hold positions in recruitment, sales, and consulting. Emboldened SM users may promote products, recruit others to the organization, or promote a positive image of the organization in their networks. For instance, an emboldened real estate salesperson is likely to use personal SM to advertise a new home listing with any resulting sale of a property benefiting both the agent and their employer. In this situation, stricter SM guidelines might lead to suppressed employees, and this misalignment could reduce morale, motivation, and performance, while increasing turnover. Thus, this paper extends the attraction literature by incorporating SM orientation congruence as a factor affecting attraction. To validate this proposed model and framework, empirical testing is a necessary next step.

The concepts inherent to this framework could also be applied to the organization’s standpoint. For instance, congruity affects may be relevant to several human resource functions. One area for consideration may be the selection process. A mismatch in the framework could lead to a rejection of a qualified applicant by the company and loss of opportunity for the applicant. Further, if an employer monitors employee SM, incongruent behaviors could lead to disciplinary actions or termination of good employees. Organizations need to be explicit with regards to their SM policies. As companies adopt new SM policies, long-time employees may find the changes to conflict with their values, leading to higher levels of turnover and talent loss.

SM has proven to be a powerful force for organizations as a tool to carry out a number of functions or a liability in situations when not handled properly. Organizational leaders need to more fully address SM usage in employee policies and training. Toward this end, an important step is to understand what benefits and outcomes an organization might obtain from employee
SM usage. Policies should consider the degree of latitude that an organization is willing to extend their employees at all levels and positions within the firm. Having engagement disparity between levels and positions introduces an additional potential degree of concern over fairness in terms of SM engagement, as the CEO and/or SM team may have more flexibility in terms of their online activity than front-line employees or those in more sensitive positions (e.g., information technologies, accounting, human resources). Future research should consider how SM policies affect employees with different ranks and functional roles. Even advocating for expanded guidelines for applicants/employees and SM engagement, one must still use caution on SM, even in environments that may promote high levels of personal expression. Employees must consider SM use to have consequences, just as with their offline actions.

The theory underpinning SM research has tacitly accepted the restraint of SM use as the means to address user privacy concerns and corporate liability. Considerable research has been advanced that reflects these underlying assumptions. The framework herein advances theory by promoting a better understanding of the two-way interaction inherent with SM (e.g., Smith & Kidder, 2010). Reorienting the understanding of SM information can benefit firms who are aptly able to assess the SM skills applicants possess and can utilize in their work with stakeholders on behalf of the firm (e.g., Agnihotri et al., 2016). SM orientations may present a value that can attract individuals to an organization (e.g., Chatman, 1991), and help understand why people may choose to leave an organization (e.g., Barrick & Parks-Leduc, 2019).

In a relatively short time, SM has evolved to encourage and promote user engagement through adaptation of content and usability to meet changing demands. How various individual users and organizations engage with SM will continue to transform as demands and technology allow. Through this framework, a more inclusive view of SM’s role in the organization is provided, serving as a basis for additional theoretical development to reflect these changes.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
INTRODUCTION

In behavioral research, reciprocity is a term generally used to describe an internalized social norm that involves mutually beneficial exchanges among individuals, organizations, or institutions (Fehr and Gachter, 2000; Fehr et al., 2002). In the current study, we adopt the theoretical concept of reciprocity, and empirically test the hypothesis that reciprocity is one of the possible incentives that encourage corporations to engage in more CSR activities in exchange for government efforts to ease the regulatory burden on businesses.

Data and Methodology

The study gathers and merges data from various sources, including the CSR ratings gathered from CSRHub database, the ease of doing business (EDB) scores from the World Bank, and other influential variables from the International Country Risk Guide (ICRG). Then, regression analysis is performed so as to determine the reciprocal relationship between government and business. To ensure the robustness of the findings, the generalized least squares (GLS) and the Tobit censored regression are also performed, respectively.

Results

The regression results provide strong evidence that the ease of doing business (EDB) has a significant positive impact on firms’ CSR contribution toward community. This implies that government efforts to ease business regulations can enable firms to engage more in CSR initiatives that directly contribute to the local community, where their businesses operate. These results are strongly robust across all the estimation methods, providing strong support for the reciprocal relationship between government and business.

Conclusion

The study provides meaningful evidence that corporations appear to exhibit positive reciprocity mainly in the community domain of CSR, as they recognize that positive contributions to their local communities will effectively induce cooperative behavior and enable a long-term relationship with their local governments. For policymakers, business managers and educators, the reciprocal nature of firm–government relationships discovered in this study highlights the importance of such relationships in promoting CSR initiatives that intend to support community development.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
Abstract: As the pandemic shatters the world around us, professionals, particularly within the discipline of Human Resource Management (HRM), are called upon for their expertise in people management; to help navigate the labyrinth of worker perspectives and priorities. Emerging from the pandemic, HRM leaders will need to reinvent organizational programs and policies to cultivate a productive and safe post-pandemic workplace. To do so, they must embody emotional intelligence and demonstrate empathy, while providing motivation for the post-pandemic worker. Our findings, however, demonstrate that these social psychological competencies are lacking in HRM professionals and points to graduate HRM programs as the culprits.

“[…] universities create such teaching and learning settings in which future professionals are enabled to cope with issues of sustainable development and to deal with wicked problems in their future fields of work and, thus, will contribute to a sustainable future” (Rieckmann, 2012, p.12).

The COVID-19 pandemic has caused rapid changes in society, holding vast implications for the workplace. Among the most evident effects of the pandemic on organizational life is the adoption of work from home (WFH) and remote practices (Carnevale & Hatak, 2020). As organizations realize the many benefits of WFH models, such as reduced labor and overhead costs (Butterick and Charlwood, 2021; Kaushik & Guleria, 2020), greater productivity potential (Kaushik & Guleria, 2020), and saved time through telecommuting (Kaushik & Guleria, 2020), remote work will significantly increase in the post-pandemic workplace (Dirani et al., 2020). Despite these many advantages, this new work model poses some unique challenges, as shifts in the work environment alter employee perceptions (Pedersen and Ritter, 2020; Carnevale and Hatak, 2020), and as organizational leaders struggle to implement and sustain new policies and practices that recognize and accommodate these changes while still facilitating a productive workforce. The successful implementation and ongoing maintenance of such practices and policies will be crucial in enabling organizations to fully recognize the benefits of the new work model, while avoiding common pitfalls. In other words, these effective practices and policies are a must for perseverance and sustained competitiveness in a post-pandemic world.

Key to facilitating these policies and managing the post-pandemic workplace is understanding the changing dynamics of employees’ person-environment fit. Carnevale and Hatak (2020) explain that employees choose to work at companies that possess an environment and culture that match their own values, ensuring their needs are satisfied and maximizing their ability to flourish within the company. The understanding of employee needs in their application to workplace performance and flourishment can be further expanded upon and studied through Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs Theory, rooted in the field of social psychology and the study of motivation. Maslow’s hierarchy contains five tiers of needs: Physiological needs, safety needs, needs for belongingness and love, esteem needs, and the need for self-actualization (Maslow,
The theory suggests that the lower tiers must be satisfied before focus is drawn to the higher ones, which are more oriented towards prosocial goals that are likely to help the workplace. Upon reaching self-actualization, Maslow suggests, employees fulfill their potential (Maslow, 1954). However, as the workplace environment changes as we shift to remote practices, so too does the nature of the employee’s fit with the organization, threatening the satisfaction of their needs and wellbeing and, thus, their productive potential in the company (Carnevale and Hatak, 2020). As organizational success relies on employee performance (Bedi and Khurana, 2020), now, more than ever before, the needs of the individual must be recognized as the needs of the organization. And HR managers, as the parties responsible for promoting organizational effectiveness through the maintenance and development of the workers (Scarpello, 2008), are the catalysts for identifying and maintaining the strategies needed to ensure these unmet demands are accommodated in the new work environment.

Complicating matters, however, is the idea that the pandemic has disparately impacted individuals, as the pandemic situation and emerging virtual workplace hold different implications for people of varying family statuses, personality traits, and demographic features (i.e., gender and age) (Kniffin et al., 2021). This means that the way in which this hierarchy of needs is compromised in the new workplace varies from person to person, and managers must take an individualistic approach in accommodating them. However, this also indicates that the implications of redirecting attention towards the prioritization of employee needs and wellbeing expands beyond organizational sustainment and profit lines. Butterick and Charlwood (2021) assert that some of the pandemic’s disparate effects have revealed inequalities in the workplace, and the underlying HRM practices therein. Thus, HR managers, in the emerging work world, are not only challenged with regrowing and sustaining the financial stamina of the organization, but also face a unique opportunity to do so in such a way that promotes socially responsible initiatives (Fenner and Cernev, 2021). Coherent in this is that the ongoing recognition and fair accommodation of employee needs and well-being will help in facilitating both such initiatives.

However, identifying and responding to the unique contexts of each employee requires HR managers to be able to put themselves in others’ shoes and manage the work environment in an emotionally aware way (cf., Pavlovich and Krahkne, 2012; Drigas and Papoutsi, 2019). Thus, they must be equipped with a keen sense of social psychology skills. Specifically, HR managers, in face of the emerging changes of pandemic, must draw upon their understanding of motivation, as well as empathy and emotional intelligence, in order to implement and maintain effective policies and practices that will accommodate employees’ unique contexts. This will further enable them to sustain organizational momentum and promote greater social responsibility and sustainability in the post-pandemic workplace. With this in mind, we looked to the current state of HR higher education with a research agenda of identifying the degree to which it incorporates social psychology concepts in the training and development of the next generation of HR managers.

For the purpose of investigating our research question, we employed case studies (exploratory in context) of five leading human resource management graduate programs. This approach was particularly advantageous, here, as it answered through an examination of the variable, thus gaining a deeper understanding of the subject and leading to more precise theory development (Flyvbjerg, 2006; Yin, 2014). It included an analysis of the curriculum through the course descriptions, with particular attention paid to the elective-choice or mandatory course nature, direct references of our social psychology concepts, relative course focus on social psychology, and any potential application of social psychology skills regardless of the articulation of their use. These four metrics were then used to identify the overall integration of social psychology into the coursework, as well as the way in which the concepts were integrated. In keeping with the work of Glaser and Strauss (1967), we exercised the “constant comparison” technique throughout the analysis, thus supporting the “Grounded Theory” approach. In the
following step, we cross-referenced all documentation for similarities and differences, and subsequently grouped findings into thematic categories (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). Finally, we conducted a triangulation assessment of similar themes, concepts, and linkages between the literature and all available data (Flyvbjerg, 2006; Yin, 2014; Creswell, 2015). Together these techniques helped us determine the effectiveness of the programs in equipping students with the necessary social psychology skills to be successful in the post-pandemic world.

Our evaluation of the universities’ curricula identified five key trends among the programs. First, required courses of programs with both mandatory and elective components largely lacked the incorporation of social psychology concepts. Among the 23 total required courses listed by these programs, 11(47.8%) classes focused on the development of technical skills such as finance, people analytics, IT, total rewards, and research techniques; while only 2 courses formally introduced and drew upon social psychology concepts. Consistent with these findings, our second conclusion shows that, while references to social psychology concepts were sparse, they were much more common among electives. For programs with an elective component, more than twice as many references to the concept of motivation were made in the elective courses (11 times) than in the required course descriptions (5 times); and “social psychology” was similarly referenced in 8 of the elective courses, versus only 1 mandatory course. The concepts of empathy and emotional intelligence were only referenced a total of two times each, and were completely lacking in the curriculum at two of the universities. While these terms were loosely referred to among the course descriptions, our third finding showed that there were only a few courses that emphasized a central focus on developing student’s understanding of social psychology (11 courses among the 130 evaluated). Furthermore, only one of these courses was part of the required curriculum for the three universities that contain both elective and mandatory course components. Giving us a glimpse of hope, our fourth and fifth conclusions from the analysis showed that many course descriptions mentioned general but ambiguous “competencies” (which may or may not include social psychology skills) and that a lot of them exhibited the potential to indirectly contribute to the development of student’s social psychology competencies.

Upon analyzing the HR programs of five top graduate business schools and deriving key trends and results, we were left with the crucial question: Is this enough to meet the heightened demands and unique challenges of the post-pandemic, virtual workplace? Our results suggest that, at large, the evaluated programs are anemic in delivering social psychology competencies to the eventual human resource management leaders that will struggle in the provision of support in the post-pandemic workplace. Our results help inform HR educators as they strive to reinvent the current curricula to better meet the demands of HR managers in the post-pandemic workplace. Students may lack the necessary competencies to be successful if they fail to choose relevant elective courses or do not pick up on the application of the skills in the courses that utilize them but neglect to articulate their role. Thus, students would be more adequately equipped with these much needed competencies if HR programs were to consistently incorporate a core course that emphasizes the use of social psychology skills, including empathy and emotional intelligence.

Our study makes multiple contributions to the fields of social sustainability and green human resource management, where the worker is not solely utilized for performance, but rather considered a critical resource, with health and safety as part and parcel of the conversation. Previous studies have examined the effects of the pandemic on employees (viz., Kniffin et al., 2021; Carnevale and Hatak, 2020; Kaushik &amp; Guleria, 2020; Dirani et al., 2020) and the role of HR managers in mitigating these effects (Lloyd-Jones, 2021; Kniffin et al., 2021; Carnevale and Hatak, 2020; Bedi and Khurana, 2020; Ahmed et al., 2020; Kaushik &amp; Guleria, 2020; Dirani et al., 2020); but very few have emphasized the need for social psychology competencies to help HR managers adequately fulfill these roles (Dirani et al., 2020; Pavlovich and Krahmke, 2012; Drigas and Papoutsi, 2019). Our paper picks up from where these studies left
off, and fills in the gaps comprehensively by delving into the curricular frameworks of HR education with these demands in mind, drawing attention to potential sources of gaps in these critical HR managerial competencies and providing suggestions to ensure the future generation of HR managers are adequately prepared to meet the heightened demands identified by the literature.

As a final remark, other studies on HR pedagogy continue to vastly overlook the increased importance of social psychology and have, instead, focused on the evaluation of HR curricula for general consistencies in the coursework (Parks-Leduc et al., 2018; Sincoff and Owen, 2004; Kuchinke, 2002; Charlier et al., 2017). Our study maintains this latter point, but we also examine the missing pieces necessary in ensuring fulfilment of the worker, and overall longevity of the human being – key elements in the embodiment of life.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
EXAMINING EDUCATIONAL DELIVERY MODES, POLITICAL FACTORS, AND 
COVID-19 CASES ACROSS US PUBLIC EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS

ANDREW F. JOHNSON  
Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi  
andrew.johnson@tamucc.edu

KATHERINE J. ROBERTO  
Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi

The COVID pandemic has caused significant tension among the various public institutions charged with setting public policies and protecting public interests. In the United States, the responsibility to oversee pandemic response has largely fallen to individual state governments alongside their traditional duties. One state agency that has been particularly affected is institutions of higher education. The 2020-2021 academic year was marked by significant pressures rooted in institutional financial considerations, public health concerns, and a divisive political climate.

The politics of each state contributed to university decision makers’ implementation of a specific delivery method for the fall 2020 semester – choosing a fully online method, a traditional face-to-face method, or a hybrid method. States with Republican governors and Republican controlled legislatures were more likely to have universities who opted for a traditional face-to-face delivery method. Further, increased state appropriations for universities affected the universities’ decision to move online in Democrat controlled states more so than Republican controlled states. Interestingly, the number of cases in the states was not a significant predictor in the delivery method decision (Johnson et al., 2021). At the conclusion of the fall 2020 semester, what is the consequence of the decision to move fully online or resume face-to-face instruction? What type of outbreaks, if any, have the institutions experienced?

COVID-19 Pandemic and Decision Making

The coronavirus disease or COVID-19 (the virus is referred to as SARS-CoV-2) pandemic began in late 2019 in central China (Zhang et al., 2020). By April 2021, there have been over 132 million cases and nearly 3 million deaths worldwide reported, with the US experiencing 31 million positive cases and over 550,000 deaths (Johns Hopkins, 2021). The large number of affected individuals can overwhelm available hospital resources adding to the widespread health concerns (AHA, 2020).

Coupled with an economic downturn, the pandemic has placed an additional burden on policy makers, often paralyzing government actors. The framework of the theory of punctuated equilibrium suggests that numerous factors presented at the same time must be considered within an increasingly complex environment affecting decision making (Baumgartner et al., 2006). The hurdles for higher educational institutions not only include the health crisis, enrollment declines, financial challenges, but political pressures are also present (Johnson et al., 2021). As institutions began the fall 2020 semester, delivery modes largely fell into three categories: online, hybrid, or in-person delivery.

Decisions on campus reopening are not made in a vacuum as numerous external pressures affect the decision-making process. Some institutions are better suited to hold courses online while others with smaller student bodies may be able to more adequately social distance in face-to-face classes (WHO, 2020). In terms of financial considerations, some campuses rely heavily on fees collected from students to maintain auxiliary services (e.g., recreation centers; parking; student housing), as such a fully online delivery method threatens a massive financial
shortfall. Other campuses may have large endowments, reserves, or state appropriations to provide financial cushion and thus flexibility for administration (Bevins et al., 2020).

**Higher Education Response to COVID-19**

The fall 2020 semester presented a challenge for higher educational institutions. Many abruptly cancelled in-person classes in the spring 2020 semester with the initial outbreak of COVID-19 (Johnson et al., 2021). These closures were part of widespread global efforts to curb the spread of the virus and ease the burden on strained healthcare systems. These widespread restrictions contributed to further economic decline in industries such as travel, tourism, and hospitality.

Perhaps no other developed nation has faced a more complex and perilous situation in responding to the pandemic than in the US. Considering the number of cases alone, the US has outpaced virtually all other nations on a per capita basis (Johns Hopkins, 2021). A volatile political situation coupled with a contentious national election have injected politics into public policy decisions about the response to the virus (e.g., Gollust et al., 2020). Institutions have not been spared the inordinate political influence. Politicians, at both the state and federal levels, have been active in voicing their opinion on how schools should approach the 2020 fall semester, including dangling funding sources as incentives to comply (Baker et al., 2020). This is particularly concerning for institutions of higher education who face financial troubles. While additional funding for higher education was extended early in the pandemic, but additional relief measures have not been passed by the federal government in months (Johnson et al., 2020).

US higher educational institutions are diverse in their student body makeup, enrolling students from around the world as well as from other states. International travel restrictions have impacted foreign student’s ability to return to the US to continue their studies, also affecting a funding source for universities who rely on the higher international tuition (THE, 2020). Many domestic students optioned for a school closer to their home instead of traveling a longer distance to attend university (Binkley, 2020) or to not attend college at all for the 2020-2021 academic year, leading to a substantial decline in first-year enrollment (Nadworny, 2020). This loss of revenue also affects the financial health of universities. However, these students who travel to attend classes for the year also pose an increased risk for spreading infections. During the summer of 2020, institutional leaders grappled with how best to deliver courses and keep students safe while cases continued to rise for much of the nation (Johnson et al., 2021).

Even with safety guidelines in place to guard against the spread of the virus, there remains significant risk for transmission in a campus environment (Paltiel et al., 2020). Reopening for the fall 2020 semester involved university administrators making the critical decision on how to deliver classes. Broadly speaking, institutions can implement a plan to place all courses online, deliver courses in a hybrid mode, or hold traditional in-person courses. Delivery of online courses allows campuses to be less populated and lessen the spread of the virus at that campus location (e.g., Melnick & Darling-Hammond, 2020). Online courses provide for the highest health precautions; however, there are concerns over the quality of online university level courses (Roberto & Johnson, 2019). These concerns may be particularly true if institutions and/or professors had little experience in this modality prior to the pandemic. Hybrid courses employ a combination of face-to-face and online experiences. The definition of hybrid courses varies greatly. This type of delivery method may mean a combination of fully online and fully face-to-face courses within the university or that every course has a component of each delivery method within it. This might be applicable for a course that has a lab component delivered face-to-face while the lecture is delivered online. Campuses that deliver courses face-to-face, would hold courses in a traditional format yet implement practices, such as additional cleaning, required face coverings, plexiglass barriers, and social distancing to lessen the spread of the virus (e.g., Elbanna et al., 2020).
Hypothesis 1a: Institutions with in-person courses will have higher COVID-19 case counts.

Decision makers at higher educational institutions have been under considerable political pressure throughout the pandemic. Typically, conservatives (represented by the Republican Party) have prioritized a faster and more complete reopening of the economy. Alternatively, liberals (represented by the Democratic Party) have urged more restrictions (Lawder, 2020; Kumar, 2020; Stein & Costa, 2020; Jost et al., 2009). Institutions of higher education employ over 3 million people across the country (IBISWorld, 2020) and often contribute substantially to the local economy (Valero & Van Reenen, 2019). To better understand the ramifications of conservative and liberal political policies on campus level outcomes, the authors suggest that the political party of a state’s governor and control of the legislature will have an effect on the number of case counts.

Hypothesis 2: Campuses within states lead by a Republican governor will have higher numbers of COVID-19 cases than states with a Democratic governor.

Hypothesis 3: Campuses within states with a conservative legislature will have higher numbers of COVID-19 cases than states with a liberal legislature.

METHODOLOGY

Sample and Variables of Interest

Campus COVID cases. Data on the number of cases at institutions of higher education was collected from The New York Times (2020) as of November 19, 2020. This date was selected as many campuses ended in-person instruction ahead of the Thanksgiving break and, soon thereafter, the semester. Further, these case counts included would not include any cases related to mass holiday travel, providing a more accurate picture of cases that might be contributed to the campus environment.

Method of delivery. The Chronicle of Higher Education collected data on intended course delivery methods on an ongoing basis beginning in the early summer of 2020 (Chronicle, 2020). Institutions were classified either fully online, hybrid, or face-to-face modality. The data was downloaded from this source on July 17, 2020 (30 days in advance of the widespread fall semester start date for universities, and over 90% of institutions publicizing their delivery method plans). Data on the publicly stated delivery method of 442 public higher educational institutions were collected. Only state public institutions, who may be more susceptible to gubernatorial or state legislative influence, that declared their delivery method intention were used in the sample (n = 369). It should be noted that institutions may have adjusted the delivery format up to the beginning of the semester or even in response to changes in the situation as the semester progressed. This data would not reflect any of these changes.

State political variables. The political affiliation of each state’s legislature and governor was collected. The political party of the governor and the controlling party of the state legislature was collected from Ballotpedia.org. Governors were coded as either Democratic or Republican. State legislatures were measured based on party control – as both chambers being controlled by Democrats or by Republicans or spilt a legislature where each party controlled a chamber.

Control variables. Population at the campus level is an important consideration. Sprawling college campuses with tens of thousands of students are prime areas for widespread infection compared to smaller more controlled environments. Campus data was collected from the institution’s prior year student enrollment from College Source Online database.
**Analysis.** Data was analyzed using linear regressions and Bonferroni post-hoc analysis in SPSS v26.

**Results**

The first hypothesis examined the number of cases at universities in relation to their method of delivery. Controlling for campus size, the method of delivery significantly predicted the number of cases experienced by the university [\(\beta = .32, t(326) = 8.20, p < .000\)] as well as a significant portion of the variance [\(R^2 = .51, F(2, 326) = 170.41, p < .000\)]. Post hoc comparisons using a Bonferroni test demonstrated that universities utilizing the face-to-face delivery method had higher case counts than those who optioned for fully online delivery (MD = 515.51, SE = 148.99, p < .01, CI [120.28, 910.73]). There was no significant difference found for hybrid instruction.

The second hypothesis examined the number of cases in relation to the political party of the governor of the state. Results showed that universities in states with Republican governors had higher cases counts than those with Democratic governors [\(\beta = .14, t(326) = 3.43, p < .000; R^2 = .43, F(2, 326) = 123.32, p < .000\)]. The third hypothesis examined the number of cases in relation to the political control of the state legislatures. Results showed that universities in states with Republican controlled legislatures had higher case counts than those with Democratic controlled legislatures [\(\beta = .25, t(326) = 6.08, p < .000; R^2 = .47, F(2, 326) = 144.68, p < .000; \text{MD} = 351.29, \text{SE} = 107.67, \text{CI} [92.18, 168.86]\}]. There were no significant differences for states with split legislatures.

**DISCUSSION**

In the face of tremendous political pressure, university administrators had difficult and unenviable decisions to make heading into the 2020-2021 academic year – how to continue the mission of their institutions amid a pandemic. The response was varied but more than half of US public institutions chose to return to a more traditional face-to-face format. Institutions implemented health and safety protocols (Elbanna et al., 2020), limited the number of students on campus (Quintana, 2020), and developed contingency plans to return to online course delivery methods if cases on campus rose to certain levels (Haney, 2020; Korte, 2020).

Even with health and safety plans in place, universities that chose to resume face-to-face courses saw higher rates of COVID-19 cases among students, faculty, and staff than did universities that offered courses solely online. Furthermore, universities in states with Republican controlled legislatures and governors, who were more likely to resume face-to-face instruction (Johnson et al., 2021) and with fewer implemented rigid health and safety protocols statewide (Adolph et al., 2020; Akovali & Yilmaz, 2020), had higher rates of COVID-19 cases than in states with Democratic controlled legislatures and governors.

These findings highlight how public institutions can be hampered by conflicting priorities. What otherwise should have been a politically neutral decision, driven by public health policies was skewed due to the political motivations of public officials. The muddling of the politics-administration dichotomy has been easily visible as of late. Public administrators, such as leaders of institutions of higher education, should be unhampered by the urgency and animosity of politics as administrative issues should not be political ones (Wilson, 1887). These findings further suggest that the division of politics and administration has been challenged, blurred, and crossed. Partisanship in politics has impacted public policy, including healthcare and education decisions across all levels of government. By failing to appropriately manage the national messaging regarding COVID-19 and potential health consequences (Sherman & Roberto, 2020), misinformation misled the public, increasing the political polarization of public health issues.
such as social distancing (Hatcher, 2020) and wearing face covers/masks (Pazzanesse, 2020). This in turn affected the reopening decisions for universities (Johnson et al., 2021).

**Limitations and Future Research**

As with any study, there are limitations. This study only examined public universities in the United States. Private institutions and smaller colleges may have faced different pressures resulting in different decisions and outcomes. Further, institutions in other countries may have experienced the pandemic in much different terms as large-scale lock downs and restrictions on movement were in effect. The data analyzed in this study did not reflect changes in delivery method based on increased case counts on campuses. As the data was analyzed at the state level, as opposed to the national level, comparing these results to other nations’ responses and outcomes may be difficult.

While this study solely focuses on conflict during the pandemic, situations that position state decision makers at odds with agencies is not uncommon. Future research should continue to look at how state governments control or affect policies of individual institutions of higher education. Future research should consider various government influence on higher education across different nations. Future research should also compare educational institutions’ response to the pandemic across different countries systems of government.

**Conclusion**

Public officials have faced extreme levels of political pressure and public scrutiny, with even the scientific method under assault as the public demanded and questioned the accurateness, timeliness, and effectiveness of the process (Ridley, 2020). It is important to let this process take place and allow objective findings to drive decisions about educational policy. Decisions made by officials are not without consequences. The public, university administrators, and other stakeholders need to be aware of how political pressures affect decision making at various public institutions. These concerns are particularly crucial during trying times such as the COVID-19 pandemic.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
Abstract: With the emergence of blockchain technology, and the convergence of telecom and computing, we now have a unified platform for doing business in the 21st century. Blockchain technology is most likely to change the next decade of business. It enables transfer of digital property from one Internet user to another in a secure way without any intermediaries. The consequences of this breakthrough technology have a vast potential in all areas of business. In this paper, we study the various ways in which blockchain technology can help small businesses.

INTRODUCTION

Blockchain technology enables transfer of digital property from one Internet user to another in a secure way without any intermediaries. The consequences of this breakthrough technology have a vast potential to positively influence all business enterprises including small businesses. Information technology provides ready to use, end-to-end solutions and allow small businesses to focus on their core business. Recent innovations in digital technology such as blockchain can play a significant role in spurring the growth of small businesses. Small and medium scale enterprises account for more than 90 percent enterprises in most OECD (Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development) nations and provide about 80 percent of economic growth (Scupola, 2009). Research shows that these businesses contribute to economic growth in multiple ways. Their presence in an economy leads to more competitive large enterprises that can outsource some of their activities to smaller firms. Compared to their relatively small sizes, they create more jobs than large firms (Passerini, 2012). Smaller size is an advantage, particularly in terms of the ability to anticipate and respond to changes and achieve a deeper and closer interaction with the customers.

This paper is organized as follows. First, we provide a brief overview of blockchain technology. The next section analyzes the various blockchain applications suitable for small business. Concluding remarks form the last section.

BLOCKCHAIN TECHNOLOGY

The beginnings of blockchain technology go back to a white paper published by S. Nakamoto (2008) where the concept of bitcoin was introduced. Blockchain is a distributed computing architecture that leads to a global database of interfaces and data which will integrate multiple machines and plugin various sources of data (Morabito, 2017). Blockchain technology is built around the theory of “distributed ledger” in which the ledger is stored and maintained on a distributed computer network (Froystad, 2016). The ledger brings about the possibility of the network as a whole to cooperatively produce, develop and record past transactions as well as consecutive digital events.

Blockchain technology is a data store that has the following characteristics:

- It subsists within a decentralized peer-to-peer network,
- Specific users can write it,
It employs the use of digital signatures and communication security to authenticate user identity,
- Its scheme brings makes it very difficult to alter historical records,
- Its scheme makes it very easy to detect any attempt to alter historical records,
- Financial transactions are typically a constituent part,
- Specific users and an extensive audience can read it,
- It is reproduced throughout the network virtually in real-time.

As stated by Zheng (2018), blockchain applications have attracted attention due to the following reasons.

- **Decentralization.** In a conventional centralized transaction system, each transaction needs to be validated through the central trusted agency (e.g., the central bank) inevitably resulting the cost and the performance bottlenecks at the central servers. On the other hand, a transaction in the blockchain network can be conducted between any two peers (P2P) without the authentication by the central agency. In this manner, blockchain can significantly reduce the server costs (including the development cost and the operation cost) and mitigate the performance bottlenecks at the central server.

- **Persistency.** Since each of the transactions spreading across the network needs to be confirmed and recorded in blocks distributed in the whole network, it is nearly impossible to tamper. Additionally, each broadcasted block would be validated by other nodes and transactions would be checked. So any falsification could be detected easily.

- **Anonymity.** Each user can interact with the blockchain network with a generated address. Further, a user could generate many addresses to avoid identity exposure. There is no longer any central party keeping users’ private information. This mechanism preserves a certain amount of privacy on the transactions included in the blockchain.

- **Auditability.** Since each of the transactions on the blockchain is validated and recorded with a timestamp, users can easily verify and trace the previous records through accessing any node in the distributed network. In Bitcoin blockchain, each transaction could be traced to previous transactions iteratively. It improves the traceability and the transparency of the data stored in the blockchain.

With reference to small businesses, applications suitable for blockchain technology can be studied under the following three categories: ‘Creating Unbreakable Contracts,’ “Safer Data Storage for an affordable Price,” and ‘Reduced Complexity in Supply Chains’ (TechHQ, 2019). Businesses deal with contracts on a daily basis. Blockchain can fill up this part of business by creating smart contracts. As the name suggests, smart contracts are self-executed, coded agreements that deliver guaranteed outcomes if the predetermined conditions are met. The significant difference from paper contract is that smart contract is digitized and that it cannot be tampered with in any way because it is in a blockchain.

There are certain advantages in using blockchain for data storage compared to cloud computing. Cloud servers are centralized at the service provider’s end and users are legitimately concerned about the possibilities of breaches and cyber-attacks. With blockchain, users can store data in a safer digital space, for a reasonable price. The stored data is encrypted and will only accessible to those who have the crypto-key. Many small businesses will find themselves at some level in a complex supply chain. Shipping and logistics operations can be admin-heavy, resource-swallowing process to organize and keep track of. Blockchain can serve as a central repository for all documents, records, and data relating to shipping and logistics information, with each partner involved able to gain real-time visibility across the entire supply chain they are part of and adjust their operations accordingly.
Small businesses can leverage information technology (IT) in two different ways. One way is to enhance operational support and transaction processing activities. Small businesses adopt and use simple IT innovations without any form of planned strategy to integrate other aspects of business (Qureshil, 2009). In this approach, any form of IT-based competitive advantage is accidental rather than planned. The second way is typically taken to use IT to improve interaction and relationship with customers. A majority of small businesses depend on a small number of customers who purchase large amounts of goods and services. These major customers influence the price of goods and services provided by small businesses. Close relationships among small businesses and customers enable these businesses to respond quickly to any change in customer requirements.

Levy (2001) has proposed an analytical framework that incorporates both forms of strategic focus. In this Focus-Dominance Model, customer dominance is compared with strategic focus. This framework provides four different strategies to IT adoption. The “Efficiency” quadrant consists of small businesses that exploit simple systems such as word processing and spreadsheets. The “Coordination” quadrant consists of small businesses that have a need to increases market share and their customer base. The “Collaboration” quadrant indicates those small businesses that attempt to incorporate emerging technologies to manage relationships with major customers. The “Innovation:” quadrant consists of those businesses that actively seek to adopt new IT innovations to achieve competitive advantage.

In a follow-up study, Levy (2002) investigated 43 small businesses to observe their positions in the Focus-Dominance Model. The results revealed that most of the small businesses make only one move, from “efficiency” to “coordination” or from “efficiency” to “collaboration.” Small businesses taking either one of these paths tend to avoid losing control and stay within their current markets. It was also observed that only 17 out of the 43 small businesses wanted to move to the “innovation” quadrant perhaps due to environment scan that indicated possible business growth.

Blockchain technology can be a critical part in business process engineering (BPR) sought by many small businesses. Business process reengineering (BPR) began as a private sector technique to help organizations to fundamentally rethink how they do their work in order to dramatically improve customer service, cut operational costs, and become more competitive (Bogdanoiu, 2014; Dowson, 2015). A key stimulus for reengineering has been the continuing development and deployment of sophisticated information systems and networks. BPR involves changes in structures and in processes within the business environment.

Applying BPR techniques to small businesses differ substantially from the way large enterprises deal with this issue. BPR concept requires an organization to have a strategy and then set business objective to achieve that strategy. In order to achieve the objective effectively, organization can apply BPR concepts to put the right processes in place (Rashaniphon, 2011). However, in the case of many small businesses, this classical approach may not be workable. Most of the successful people in small businesses are hands on persons and most likely they do not even bother about the word ‘strategy’, especially in the business environment of developing countries. It is more effective to try out hands on approach to make changes quickly. They are only looking for short term objectives.

Here are some guidelines that are especially relevant to small businesses (Mansar, 2007):

- Read the market for your business clearly by SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats) analysis,
- Develop a strategy that optimizes cost, quality, time, and flexibility,
- Execute the developed strategy by strengthening the processes identified for reengineering and without interfering unnecessarily.
Small businesses can leverage techniques and tools that have become increasingly available as open-source software such as ‘Alfresco’ software for content management (Passerini, 2012). Along with the traditional knowledge management processes that include acquisition/creation, storage and retrieval, dissemination and application, SMEs benefit from various size-based advantages. For example, in the area of knowledge storage and retrieval, the proximity of project teams to the company owner enables quicker and more frequent transactions compared to large organizations.

**BLOCKCHAIN TECHNOLOGY FOR SMALL BUSINESS**

Here is a summary of eight blockchain applications that can help small businesses.

1. **Payments and Money Transfers**
   Perhaps the most well-known blockchain application is being able to send and receive payments. Since blockchain technology has its beginnings in cryptocurrency, this makes sense. But, how exactly is this beneficial for small business owners. By using blockchain technology, you’re able to transfer funds directly and securely to anyone you want in the world almost instantly and at ultra-low fees. That’s because there aren’t any intermediaries slowing down the transfer of funds between several banks and charging outrageous transaction fees. This practice is especially useful if you have remote employees or are involved in the global marketplace. Companies like Abra, Bitwage, and Coinpip are leading the charge in using the blockchain to transfer funds or handle payroll.

2. **Smart Contracts**
   Believe it or not, the term “smart contract” has been in-use since 1993, but now it’s associated with the blockchain thanks to the emergence of 2013’s the Ethereum Project. This Project “is a decentralized platform that runs smart contracts: applications that run exactly as programmed without any possibility of downtime, censorship, fraud or third party interference.” “Smart contracts” are “self-automated computer programs that can carry out the terms of any contract,” writes Chris DeRose in American Banker. In a nutshell “it is a financial security held in escrow by a network that is routed to recipients based on future events, and computer code.” With “smart contracts” businesses will be able to bypass regulations and “lower the costs for a subset of our most common financial transactions.” Additionally, these contracts will be unbreakable. Companies like Slock, which is an Ethereum-enabled internet-of-things platform, is already using this application so that customers can rent anything from bicycles to apartments by unlocking a smart lock after both parties agreed on the terms of the contract. Furthermore, global banks are using “smart contracts” to improve the syndicated loan market. One such company that is using blockchains to issue microloans is Synaps.

3. **Notary**
   Blockchain technology can also be used as a convenient and inexpensive notary service. For instance, apps like Uproov, which is a smartphone multimedia platform, can be notarized instantly after a user creates an image, video, or sound recording. Meanwhile, stampd.io, can actually be used to notarize proof of ownership of digital creation.

4. **Distributed Cloud Storage**
   Cloud storage will be another application that businesses can take advantage of. Storj, company that’s using the blockchain to provide users with affordable, fast, and secure cloud storage. While talking to VentureBeat Storj founder Shawn Wilkinson said that, “Simply using
excess hard drive space, users could store the traditional cloud 300 times over,” much like how you can rent out a room on Airbnb. Wilkinson added, “Considering the world spends $22 billion on cloud storage alone, this could open a revenue stream for average users, while significantly reducing the cost to store data for companies and personal users.”

5. Digital Identity

Did you know that fraud is estimated to cost the industry around $18.5 billion annually? In other words, that means that for every $3 spent, $1 is going to ad fraud. Because of that, security is a top concern for businesses of all sizes. “Blockchain technologies make tracking and managing digital identities both secure and efficient, resulting in seamless sign-on and reduced fraud,” writes Ameer Rosic, founder of Blogeeks, in a previous Due article. “Blockchain technology offers a solution to many digital identity issues, where identity can be uniquely authenticated in an irrefutable, immutable, and secure manner,” says Rosic. “Current methods use problematic password-based systems of shared secrets exchanged and stored on insecure systems. Blockchain-based authentication systems are based on irrefutable identity verification using digital signatures based on public key cryptography.” With blockchain identity authentication, “the only check performed is whether or not the transaction was signed by the correct private key. It is inferred that whoever has access to the private key is the owner and the exact identity of the owner is deemed irrelevant.” Blockchain technology can be applied to identity applications in areas like IDs, online account login, E-Residency, passports, and birth certificates. Companies such as ShoCard are using the blockchain to validate an individual’s identity on their mobile device.

6. Supply-Chain Communications & Proof-of-Provenance

“Most of the things we buy aren’t made by a single entity, but by a chain of suppliers who sell their components (e.g., graphite for pencils) to a company that assembles and markets the final product. The problem with this system is that if one of these components fails “the brand takes the brunt of the backlash,” says Phil Gomes of Edelman Digital. By utilizing blockchain technology “a company could proactively provide digitally permanent, auditable records that show stakeholders the state of the product at each value-added step.” Provenance and SkuChain are just two examples of companies attempting resolve this issue.

7. Gift Cards and Loyalty Programs

The blockchain could also assist retailers that offer gift cards and loyalty programs by making the process cheaper and more secure by cutting out the middlemen and using the blockchain’s unique verification capabilities. Gyft Block, which is a partnership between Gyft and bitcoin API developer Chain, issues digital gift card that can be securely traded on the blockchain’s public ledger.

8. Networking and IoT

IBM and Samsung have teamed-up for a concept known as ADEPT, or Autonomous Decentralized Peer-to-Peer Telemetry, which uses blockchains “to provide the backbone of the system, utilizing a mix of proof-of-work and proof-of-stake to secure transactions.” With ADEPT a blockchain would act as a public ledger for a large amount of devices. This would eliminate the need of a central hub and would “serve as a bridge between many devices at low cost.” Without the need of a central control system, all of these devices could communicate with one another autonomously in order to manage software updates, bugs, or manage energy.

CONCLUSION
Small businesses can benefit from using techniques made available by blockchain technology. New technologies are paving the way for new market creation. As a direct result of this, we have seen new small businesses emerging to cater niche markets as an alternative to impersonal commercial companies. Blockchain technology and business process engineering have been used successfully in the corporate world. However, using these techniques for small businesses can pose some problems. The basic building blocks of IT implementation consist of digitized versions of interactions among various business processes. In this paper, we have presented a framework that can identify and categorize the different types of business processes/transactions. Restructuring these processes and then using the appropriate blockchain application in a systematic way affords a practical approach to leverage blockchain technology. Monitoring the critical success factors will help in evaluating the success of these measures. Future work in this area focuses on developing a comprehensive framework that will enable entrepreneurs and researchers to point out the potential priority areas that can use blockchain applications and yield a realistic estimate of resources needed to achieve such transformation. In addition, such an approach will also help in giving a better insight into business process restructuring.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
THE U.S. MILITARY AND ORGANIZATION DEVELOPMENT: A STRATEGIC PERSPECTIVE

ROBERT L. REINHARD
Drahnierr Enterprises
drahnierr@gmail.com

PETER F. SORENSEN
Benedictine University

THERESE F. YAEGER
Benedictine University

Abstract: The purpose of this study is to provide a strategic analysis of the unfolding of Organization Development (OD) programs within the U.S. Army, Navy, Air Force and Marine Corps. In parallel with the military’s defense power is the powerful ‘people side’ of the U.S. military. This study covers a particularly significant period of time in the application of the behavioral sciences in the U.S. military. It is a period in which the behavioral sciences and the field of OD in particular were becoming popular in organizations in general. The environmental context of the early 1970s, complicated by the war in Vietnam, necessitated the military to turn to nontraditional management methodologies to remedy what was deemed as people problems. Our work finds that although the military committed considerable resources to OD programs, and the people problems were acceptably remedied over the timespan of the programs, most claims of success were based on anecdotal evidence, with little empirical evidence that OD either changed the organizations or resulted in improved effectiveness. With the magnitude and scope of the military presented, we will explore the significance of OD in the U.S. military by recounting the application of OD and human process interventions in four military branches.

INTRODUCTION

The people side of the U.S. military is daunting. According to the 2017 Bureau of Labor Statistics, the U.S. Armed Forces employs 1.3 million active-duty service members. The U.S. Armed Forces are one of the largest militaries in terms of the number of personnel, and Credit Suisse reports that the U.S. Armed Forces are the world's most powerful military. As of 2019 data provided, the U.S. military received $693 billion annually to fund its mandatory and discretionary accounts. As of 2018, the U.S. military accounts for roughly 36 percent of the world's defense expenditures. The U.S. Armed Forces has significant capabilities in both defense and power projection due to its large budget, resulting in advanced and powerful technologies which enables a widespread deployment of the force around the world, including around 800 military bases outside the United States. The U.S. Air Force is the world's largest air force, the U.S. Navy is the world's largest navy by tonnage, and the U.S. Navy and the U.S. Marine Corps combined are the world's second largest air arm.

THE U.S. MILITARY: A PRELIMINARY REVIEW

Research concerning the U.S. military’s choice to use human process OD interventions within its organizations points to a few distinct contributors that elicited the use of the behavioral sciences to affect change in the programs, processes, strategies and training utilized in the Department of Defense (DoD). The late 1960s and early 1970s in the U.S. military was a time of perceived racial discrimination, the widespread use of
Drugs, and the transition to an all-volunteer force (West, 1990; Umstot, 1980; Getty & Maxwell, 1981; Barrett, 1986; Young, 2014). All of these contextual factors contributed to a new focus—one that could elicit change of behavior while improving impartiality—one that could facilitate accord in the service branches. One of the most related environmental contributors to the contextual factors of concern for the DoD was the Vietnam War. The U.S. military was in the midst of much needed change in order to resolve these concerns and others like them as they were detracting from the effective execution of the U.S. military’s mission.

The 1960-1970 timeframe was a tumultuous period in the United States. Women, minorities, and other marginalized Americans continued their fight for equality, and many Americans joined the protest against the ongoing war in Vietnam. Today, the Vietnam War is characterized as a prolonged military conflict that started as an anti-colonial war against the French and evolved into a Cold War confrontation between international communism and free-market democracy (Iber, 2017). However, this sterile description fails to capture the experience of war as it relates to the American citizen and those serving in the military during the war.

By 1970, America had already been involved with a war in Vietnam for many years. As American involvement increased, opposition was fueled as the violence and moral ambiguity was televised for the first time ever. Millions of Americans, night after night, watched the war unfold in their living rooms. Opposition to the war deepened and protests widened. The war caused a great rift within American society—raising doubts about America’s role in the world, its morality, and its priorities. The manner in which the war was conducted also fed into a growing cynicism about government and its institutions.

In early 1970, when Ohio National Guard soldiers shot and killed four Kent State students and wounded nine others while protesting the U.S. bombings in Cambodia, American disappointment and frustration with the war elevated to new heights. Deepening the rift in America, the release of the “Pentagon Papers” in the summer of 1971 furthered speculation that the U.S. Government was misleading the public about Vietnam as The New York Times published articles based on the classified papers which revealed top U.S. officials were told in advance how long, costly and improbable a victory would be in Vietnam (Dunlap, 2016). Additionally, the draft, intended to be a social leveler, was perceived by many Americans as corrupt—as it became easier for affluent young men to avoid service with college and other deferments.

As the war in Vietnam matured, new social causes came to the foreground and the U.S. military experienced bitter sectarian divisions and poor discipline. During the waning years of Vietnam, racism, drugs and even "fragging" of leaders in the combat zone threatened to undermine the organization from within. According to George Lepre’s (2011) book, Fragging: Why U.S. Soldiers Assaulted Their Officers in Vietnam, forty-two soldiers and fifteen Marines were killed in fragging incidents while more than two-hundred servicemen died from drug overdoses during the war. The Chief of Historical Services at the Army Heritage and Education Center characterized the Army at this time with the following description, "The Army in the 1970s was a terrible organization." (Michaels, 2013). The following is an elaboration of Drugs, and Racial Unrest.

**Drugs.** During the Vietnam War, American servicemen used drugs more heavily than any previous generation. From heroin to amphetamines to marijuana, drugs were commonplace among military members serving in the war. Unfortunately, in 1971, a liaison to the Bureau of Narcotics and Dangerous Drugs told President Nixon “you don’t have a drug problem in Vietnam—you have a condition. Problems are things we can get right on and solve.” (Janos, 2018). According to a 1971 report by the DoD, fifty-one percent of the armed forces had smoked
marijuana, thirty-one percent had used psychedelics, such as LSD, mescaline and psilocybin mushrooms, and an additional twenty-eight percent had taken hard drugs, such as cocaine and heroin (Janos, 2018).

Racial Unrest. Between 1968 and 1971, perceived patterns of racial discrimination in both the military and surrounding communities contributed to an increase in recorded violent incidents at military installations in the U.S. and overseas (Kamarck, 2019). In August 1968, incarcerated U.S. military members rioted at the Navy Brig at Danang, as did U.S. military inmates later that month in the over-crowded Long Binh Jail on the outskirts of Saigon where sixty-five soldiers were injured, and one inmate was killed. In July 1969, while other U.S. troops were fighting in Vietnam, dozens of Marines at Camp Lejeune, North Carolina were fighting each other. The explosion of racial violence on the base left one Marine dead and more than a dozen others injured. Ten days later, there was a confrontation between whites and blacks at Millington Naval Air Station in Tennessee. Later that year, a fight erupted in Kaneohe Marine Corps Air Station in Hawaii after approximately 50 African Americans gave a black power salute during the lowering of the colors. For over four hours an estimated 250 Marines, armed with sticks, pipes and entrenching tools, fought with each other leaving sixteen injured and three hospitalized.

In the next few years, rioting or racial warfare occurred at numerous bases, including Fort Bragg, Fort Hood and Fort McClellan in the U.S. and overseas from South Korea and Okinawa to West Germany and Labrador, Canada (Westheider, 2007). Between 1970 and 1971, Cam Ranh Bay, Vietnam experienced endless successions of small gang wars going back and forth between races. Finally, in 1971 an incident at Travis Air Force Base, California, began with a barracks altercation and escalated into riots that ended in 135 arrests, ten injuries, the death of a civilian firefighter, and significant property damage (Leidholm, 2013).

All-Volunteer Force. During the greater part of the 20th century, the American people were generally willing to accept the practice of conscription when service was perceived as universal. However, in the 1960s, that acceptance began to erode. According to a study by the Congressional Research Service, there were five major reasons:

- Demographics. The size of the eligible population of young men reaching draft age each year was so large and the needs of the military so small in comparison that, in practice, the draft was no longer universal.

- Cost. Obtaining enough volunteers was possible at acceptable budget levels.

- Moral and economic rationale. Conservatives and libertarians argued that the state had no right to impose military service on young men without their consent. Liberals asserted that the draft placed unfair burdens on the underprivileged members of society, who were less likely to get deferments.

- Opposition to the war in Vietnam. The growing unpopularity of the Vietnam war meant the country was ripe for a change to a volunteer force.

- The U.S. Army’s desire for change. The Army had lost confidence in the draft as discipline problems among draftees mounted in Vietnam (Rostker, 2006, p.1).

These views were reinforced by the findings of the Gates Commission, set up in 1969 by President Nixon to advise him on the establishment of an all-volunteer force (Gates Commission, 1970). It concluded that the nation’s interests would be better served by an all-volunteer force than by a combination of volunteers and conscripts. In 1971, President Nixon signed a new law
to end the draft and put the selective service structure on standby. After a two-year extension of induction authority, the end of the draft was formally announced in January 1973.

The contextual environment in the U.S. military during this period led to the need for change and prompted measures previously not considered. An emerging managerial practice, that was scientifically and foundationally mature enough to draw the attention of U.S. military leadership, offered promise. The practice of a multidisciplinary approach to achieve organizational change and improvement, called "Organization Development" presented a variety of change techniques focused on human process interventions. It was gaining attention and momentum in the private sector and just might be the mechanism needed for sustained change while also creating conditions favorable to improve the unique missions within the military.

**DISCUSSION**

Findings indicate that without measurable outcomes, such critically needed programs often do not succeed. This research, like most organizational research, exposes the realization of the military’s (management’s) insistence for concrete measurements of OD interventions.

The Department of Defense and its subordinate military departments fall under the Executive Branch of the U.S. Government. The programmatic allocation of funds from Congress fluctuates proportional to the nation’s discernment for military resources. Even though the U.S. military has traditionally taken a significant portion of discretionary government spending, the departments operate in a complex environment of competing political, social, and economic forces. Hard choices that balance weapon system modernization, infrastructure, and allocation of human capital must be made each year as the military departments compete for ever-changing levels of Congressional support. Therefore, programs that are considered ‘nice to have’ often fall to the wayside in order to reallocate funds to source other operational necessities. As such, Organization Development appears to be one such program.

The formal OD programs established in the early 1970s by the Army, Navy, Air Force and Marine Corps were considered priorities due to the humanistic issues facing the Department of Defense. Dissimilar emphasis was placed on the level of resources and methodologies. Nonetheless, within a decade, the U.S. military had resolved most of its people problems and established a functioning all-volunteer force. The calls for reform were addressed and although the military was by no means the exemplar for an idealistic democratic organization, many of the looming concerns with racial discrimination and widespread use of drugs were considered to be remedied to an acceptable level. As this collective perception became a consensus within the military departments, the decision to reallocate spending to other emerging priorities seemed rational.

During the last year of the *Army Organizational Effectiveness Journal*, the Commandant, Colonel Donald K. Griffin (1984) made the following fortuitous remarks when reflecting on the history of the OE program:

“The contrast between major issues in 1971 and today is quite clear. Big problems then were drugs, racial tension, discipline, ethics, and how to create an all-volunteer force: "people problems." Big problems now are forced integration and modernization, information management, and dealing with change: problems with things and with systems. Or are they? Ultimately, the problems we face today are still "people problems." They result from how people handle information, how they deal with and resist change, and how they perform in complex organizations.”

Everything Colonel Griffin stated was true. However, his initial perceptions seemed to convey what senior military leadership was thinking as well. The priority was no longer “people
problems” and their new concerns dealt with the effective manipulation of systems and technology. Although Griffin was correct when he continued his thought conveying that ultimately the problems were still "people problems," it was not viewed the same way by those decision makers further removed from the program.

Without hard data and rigorous empirical research to validate the effectiveness of the OD programs, leadership from all branches ultimately made the hard call to eliminate funding of these programs.

CONCLUSION

Evidence of the demise or closing of OD programs in the U.S. military, as provided in research (above), included:

Army
- “… in the performance of other duties, the ‘secondary’ skills took second place.”
- “… the results of the PD program were difficult to evaluate.”
- “… it was not standardized.”

Navy
- “The mandatory nature of the program created doubt about whether OD was meeting the needs of the client or simply conforming to mandated requirements.”
- “… low level of involvement of some commanding officers in the process caused problems…”
- “When survey data was collected and not acted on, expectations were raised and dashed.”

Air Force:
- “Despite a large backlog of requests, the LMDC’s OD consulting program closed its doors due to budget cuts in 1986.”

Marines:
- “The use of experts necessitates economic justification which diminishes the cost-benefit impact of the entire effort.”
- “The current model places very little emphasis on problem solving- the commences is channeled directly from diagnosis to action.”

With well over a thousand people involved full time in OD, the U.S. military, at one point, had the largest OD programs in America (Umstot, 1980; Jones, 1981). The size, scope, and eventual demise of the human process OD programs in the military can be interpreted as an indirect measure of the success and perception of the programs. However, without leadership support at the highest levels and considerable allocation of resources, the OD programs would not have survived for more than a decade in the highly autocratic and bureaucratic structure. The perception of success in the U.S. military was based largely on anecdotal reports, testimonials, and personal support of the senior leaders and decision makers. Nevertheless, hard data and rigorous empirical research were sparse, and the successes were often perceived by the masses as soft or an artifact of a compliant system (Umstot, 1980).

This work reports on the most authoritative and comprehensive scholarly work on OD in the U.S. military, accomplished by Umstot (1980). His work was accomplished at the zenith of the OD programs in the Army and Navy and before the centralized efforts of the Air Force were recognized. Additionally, much of this research is the collection of research from exhaustive
resources including extant studies in journals such as *Group and Organizational Studies*, the *Academy of Management Review*, the *Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, the *Journal of Applied Psychology*, *Personnel* and the *Harvard Business Review*, particularly during the 1970s and 1980s.

This study covers a particular historically significant period of time in the application of the behavioral science concepts in the U.S. military. It is a period in which the behavioral sciences and the field of OD in particular were becoming popular in organizations in general. However, the field of OD has continued to modify and develop in the military. Illustrations of improvement efforts using the OD concept of Appreciative Inquiry in the U.S. Navy, and large-group interventions in the U.S. Marine Corp are evidence of OD’s newer developments (Tripp & Zipsie, 2002).

Finally, Umstot, cited the posits of Argyris (1970) and Bowen (1977) explaining that: “Since most military OD processes concentrate on developing valid information, allowing participants free choice about how to proceed, and developing internal commitment to the decision made, it may be that the consulting process itself is more important to OD success than is value congruence.” (Umstot, 1980, p. 197).

The initial purpose of this study was to provide a strategic analysis of the unfolding of Organization Development (OD) programs within the U.S. Army, Navy, Air Force and Marine Corps. Our findings indicate that without measurable outcomes, such critically needed programs often do not succeed. This research, like most organizational research, exposes, yet again, the realization of the military’s (management’s) insistence for concrete measurements of OD interventions. Our future work calls for an exploration of current change improvement (OD) efforts in the entire U.S. Armed Forces.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
INTRODUCTION

Innovation research seeks to explain how, why, and at what rate novel ideas and technologies are adopted (Rogers, 2003). While key findings from Rogers and others’ innovation research are critical to understanding innovation, they do not explain why people do or do not work together in disparate organizations to enrich localities’ economies and growth. Regional differences in taxing authority, education availability, innovation infrastructure availability and its management, availability of regional financial intermediaries, and the like were found to differentiate between the likelihood of innovative organizations coming to a region or not (Cooke, et al., 1997). While these findings are important and useful, they are not granular enough to help explain how regional innovation comes about specifically.

Research on municipalities eventually developed to explain innovation at the needed level of granularity. This research linked human capital to social capital to innovative behavior, in an attempt to fully describe the innovation of municipal innovation ecosystems (Mercan & Goktas, 2011). The problem is that the research seems incomplete as it was not conducted at the individual level, which is where innovation occurs. The research described in this study addresses that gap.

This study examines innovative behavior in a municipal innovation ecosystem (MIE) which is defined as “the large and diverse array of participants and resources that contribute to and are necessary for ongoing innovation in a modern economy” (Witte et al., 2018, p.3). This research contributes to the research on MIEs by addressing the question: how do personal resources such as human capital and social capital impact individual level innovative behavior within a municipal innovation ecosystem? Additionally, this study explored emerging patterns of MIE participants’ perceptions and behavior to answer a secondary research question, how do well-being and institution engagement mediate and moderate, respectively, the relationship of social capital and innovation behavior? This is important because understanding these complex relationships can contribute to both the economic development and innovation literature. For companies and managers, the insights from this study shed light on how intra and interorganizational innovation occurs. In the following sections, relevant MIE literature is explored and used as the basis for hypothesis development. Then, the research methodology is outlined and followed by research results. After the discussion of findings links the results to past research, the limitations and implications are shared.
development of innovation. The types of innovation within an MIE include product, process, service, social, and entrepreneurial innovations. Examples of high functioning MIEs can be seen in areas such as Menlo Park, CA, and Boston, MA. Both municipalities are comprised of world-renowned R&D institutions, impact investors, science and technology corporations and a constellation of world-class universities involved in teaching high-tech and high-tech activities, and emerging social innovation enterprises. The human capital resources and the connectedness of these institutions within these cities function as opportunities for open innovation and economic growth within the city.

Open Innovation
Open innovation is defined as “the use of purposive inflows and outflows of knowledge to accelerate internal innovation, and expand the markets for external use of innovation, respectively” (Chesbrough et al., 2006, p. 1). Chesbrough’s (2003) seminal work on open innovation presented an organizational model of actor participants who were externally orientated in seeking to commercialize both their own ideas and ideas that originated externally. At its most basic level, open innovation is anchored in the idea that sources of knowledge for innovation are widely distributed throughout the economy (Chesbrough & Bogers, 2014). Leckel et al (2020) applied open innovation to a bounded local region using the term local open innovation (LOI) defining the term as “a specific form of OI that constitutes a local intermediated network approach aimed at facilitating collaboration on concrete problems while at the same time establishing a regional innovation ecosystem of diverse organizations within a community” (p.1). Because innovation occurs more eagerly in urban settings or clusters, it is appropriate to apply the concept of local open innovation to the study of municipal innovation ecosystems and their impact on economic growth.

Endogenous Growth Theory
Classical economic theory identifies land, labor, and physical capital as the three basic factors shaping economic growth (Woolcock, 1998). However, in the 1960s, neoclassical economists such as Schultz (1961) and Becker (2009) began to argue that human capital (population, education, and training) determined how effectively the factors of production could be utilized (Woolcock, 1998), and that the social capital (relations and interactions of an economies’ participants) allowed for the combination of these skills to be efficiently applied toward common objectives. As a result, Paul Romer (1994) proposed Endogenous Growth Theory (EGT). EGT posits that economic growth is primarily the result of internal instead of external forces and proposes that investment in human capital, innovation, and knowledge alongside population growth are significant contributors to economic growth. Jones and Romer’s(2010) recent update to the theory includes idea/knowledge sharing as one of the dynamic variables which account for the complexity in explaining economic growth.

By integrating these theories, this study leverages the aforementioned literature to build a theoretical framework proposing how innovative behavior emerges from the interactions of MIE participants. This framework will be used to describe and explain the MIE in Mobile, AL.

Mobile, AL MIE
Mobile is a port city on Alabama’s Gulf Coast. It is the fourth most populous city in Alabama, the most populous in Mobile County, and the largest municipality on the Gulf Coast between New Orleans, Louisiana, and St. Petersburg, Florida. Aerospace, steel, ship building, retail, services, construction, medicine, and manufacturing are Mobile's major industries (cityofmobile.org).

In 2013, a Business Insider article ranked Mobile, AL as the third most miserable city in the United States (Zeveloff, 2013). The unfortunate ranking was a result of combining
statistics on the city’s high crime, high poverty, and low education rates with reports by Mobilians of low happiness. More recently, Gallop’s 2017 survey that ranked community well-being placed Mobile, AL in the 148th spot out of the 186 metropolitan communities surveyed. The well-being survey measured self-reported data on respondents’ mental health, physical health, social relationships, economic security, and happiness. Despite concerted efforts among the Mobile Area Chamber of Commerce, the state and city government, and local firms, Mobile shares with many other Southern, small to mid-sized cities a reputation for struggling with innovation. Because Mobile has seen its fair share of bad publicity, the city has expanded their focus from a more traditional approach to economic growth of procuring and maintaining manufacturing jobs to a more contemporary approach of embracing innovation and entrepreneurship.

HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT

To develop a deeper understanding of innovative behavior within Mobile’s MIE, this study tests a hypothesized model that explains innovative behavior in an MIE as an outcome of both the human capital and social capital of MIE participants. Human capital is a form of innovative capacity and is defined as the skills, knowledge and experience of individuals that creates economic value (Becker, 2009; Mouhallab & Jianguo, 2016). While innovative capacity is the foundation for innovation potential within a region, capacity alone lacks the ability to fully explain innovativeness within an MIE. Innovativeness within an MIE requires both capacity (human capital inputs) and capability (social capital connectedness) (Dakhli & De Clercq, 2004; Weaver & Habibov, 2012). Human capital functions as a social input that acts as a bonding agent in forming business clusters and as a bridging mechanism to connect skilled workers across industries (Putnam, 1995). As such the following hypothesis is offered:

H1. Human capital will relate positively to social capital.

The social capital bonds and bridges, resulting from human capital, are pathways that allow for innovation (Putnam, 1995). Social capital is defined as the network of relationships among people who live and work in a particular society enabling it to function (Coleman, 1988). Connectedness between people in an MIE produces opportunities and constraints particular to the specific network, which results in outcomes not predicted by standard economic explanations (Granovetter, 1983; Marsden, 1981). Simply put, connectedness is a measure of interactions within a social network. Connectedness within an MIE is important because it is the means by which ideas are shared between organizations and institutions. If an idea cannot be shared, it cannot be implemented across the MIE. Both social capital and human capital are tied to innovativeness within a municipal economy (Florida, 2005 Glaser, 2002); therefore, the relationships are assumed to apply to MIEs as well. As such, the following hypothesis is offered:

H2. Social capital will relate positively to innovative behavior.

An MIE encompasses not only the key components for a city’s economic growth but also factors that impact a city’s quality of life. The quality of life within an MIE is reflected in the well-being of MIE participants. Well-being is defined as the experience of health, happiness, and prosperity: having good mental health, overall life satisfaction, a sense of meaning or purpose, meaningful relationships, and the ability to manage stress (Tchiki, 2019). Recent research has shown well-being as having a significant and positive relationship with individual level innovative behavior and social capital (Constanza et al., 2008; Cohen et al., 2016; Dolan & Metcalf, 2021; Fafchamps & Minten, 2002; Narayan & Cassidy, 2001; Wang et al., 2017). Thus,
the following hypothesis is offered:

**H3. Well-being will mediate the relationship between social capital and innovative behavior.**

Institution engagement within a region is also recognized as impacting economic growth and innovation (Etzkowitz & Leydesdorff, 2000). Business, government, and academic institutions influence innovative behavior in a municipal economy (Jackson, 2011). Institution engagement results from the connections, communications, and negotiations between institutional partners (Etzkowitz & Leydesdorff, 2000). The multi-institution interactions are important to MIE economic performance and can impact social and territorial learning and innovation (Muscio, 2006; Porter, 2000). As such, the following hypothesis is offered:

**H4. Institution engagement will positively moderate the relationship between social capital and innovative work behavior.**

**METHODOLOGY**

**Research Design**

This study employed a mixed methods design, both qualitative and quantitative data were collected to enhance the integrity of the study’s findings. Mixed methods approaches are considered ideal where neither quantitative nor qualitative methods by themselves are sufficient to capture the dynamic nature of complexity (Schoonenboon & Johnson, 2017).

**Instrumentation**

Person-to-person interviews were used for the first sequence of data collection. The content for the interview questions was curated from the daily observations of the primary researcher during her participation in innovation related activities in the city of Mobile. The qualitative instrument employed a semi-structured interview design and data was collected via telephone interviews with each of the predetermined six participants; each interview lasted approximately 30 minutes. The interview protocol included 20 open-ended questions. The participants received the interview questions via email prior to the scheduled phone interview.

The second sequence of data collection was quantitative. The instrument questions consisted of a mix of fill in the blank and closed ended questions. The questionnaire was comprised of three types of indicators: (1) established scales for reflectively measured constructs; (2) self-reported individual demographics, some of which were used as indices for formatively measured constructs; (3) fill-in-the-blank questions for collecting the respondent’s workplace or details if the option “other” was chosen.

**Data Analysis**

Multiple iterations and approaches were used for data analysis. The qualitative data was initially explored manually using a content analysis approach. The data was then explored using Leximancer, a validated textual analysis tool that can be used to understand the content of collections of textual documents and to visually display the extracted information (Smith & Humphreys, 2006). Combining both software and manual analytical approaches provides a robust basis for delineating the concepts and themes derived from qualitative data (Verreyne, Parker & Wilson, 2013).

Following qualitative analysis, the quantitative data was cleaned and assessed to ensure data quality and integrity. Then, the descriptive statistics for the latent variables and sample characteristics were aggregated. Next, the measurement model was confirmed, and the structural model assessed. PLS-SEM was then applied to test the hypothesized relationships put
forth by this study. Smart PLS software was utilized for the PLS-SEM analysis (Ringle, et al., 2014). The PLS SEM measurement model was confirmed using the Confirmatory Composite Analysis (CCA) process before the structural model was assessed (Hair et al., 2020; Henseler et al., 2015; Schuberth et al., 2018). Both the structural model and measurement model were confirmed as valid and reliable prior to conducting hypothesis testing.

RESULTS

Hypothesis Testing

The path coefficients were assessed using bootstrapping with 5000 subsamples. Human capital had a significant positive relationship with social capital ($\beta = .272$), which aligns with the existing literature. Therefore, Hypothesis 1 is supported. Social capital had a significant positive relationship with innovative behavior ($\beta = .463$), which represented the strongest path relationship in the model; this finding aligns with the literature on social networks and innovation, and therefore Hypothesis 2 is supported.

Mediation analysis found direct effects of $a = .406$ ($p \leq .001$) and $b = .175$ ($p \leq .001$) which when multiplied together result in the indirect effect of $0.071$ ($p \leq .099$), and the total effect for the mediated model is $0.534$ ($p \leq .001$). All effects are significantly different from zero in that their confidence intervals do not contain zero, suggesting that well-being partially mediates the relationship between social capital and innovative behavior at work. Therefore, H3 is supported. Moderation analysis identified Institution engagement (W) as a significant antecedent to the dependent variable innovative behavior at work and the moderating effect of innovation trust is statistically significant from zero (confidence interval does not contain zero; $0.004; .294$). Therefore, H4 is supported.

Results Summary

There is a significant relationship between human capital and social capital; social capital has a meaningful effect on innovative behavior. A closer examination of this effect found that an individual’s well-being represents a mechanism that underlies the relationship between social capital and innovative behavior. Additional analysis revealed that engaging with local institutions positively influences the relationship between social capital and innovative behavior.

LIMITATIONS

The data was collected during the COVID pandemic, which likely impacted respondents’ self-reports of well-being. In addition, a number of the scales in this research relied on self-report data that could suffer from respondent self-inflation bias. This is important because perceptions of personal relationships were collected in the survey. Also, the survey collects data on all variables at one point in time, creating potential for common method bias (CMB). This was assessed by conducting a variance inflation factor (VIF) analysis, the VIF values suggest there is no issue with CMB.

The mediated relationship between social capital, well-being and innovative behavior is weak with a .099 significance and only a small change in social capital. However, as a new theoretical construct, and under the difficult circumstances mentioned, it is worth further consideration and study. Future research should consider a possible redevelopment of the well-being construct as it may not fit prior literature’s operationalization in the MIE context.

DISCUSSION

This study focused on building a novel framework that for the first time examined
innovative behavior in a city-region at the individual level. The insights generated by this research provide new and useful variables, methods, and insights for researchers interested in municipally bounded systems of small to mid-sized US cities. Furthermore, the findings have practical implications for corporate and policy decision makers in MIEs.

The qualitative findings suggest a new variable to include in future MIE research. MIE age was suggested by interview participants as a potentially useful variable in comparative MIE research. MIE age (the length of time innovation is pursued in an MIE as a tool to impact economic growth) should be used as a control or moderator variable in MIE research.

The quantitative findings also support inclusion of a new construct. A formative measure of institution engagement was created and contributes to regional innovation theory research. This construct measures the frequency of interactions, the perceived value of interactions, and the types of interactions with academic, government, and local business institutions. This new construct should be considered for future research as it proved significant in moderating the relationship between social capital and innovative behavior.

An MIE participant’s length of time spent working within an MIE should be used as an indicator in any human capital index. By expanding how human capital is measured to also include years of work experience, this study delivered empirical support that human capital should not be measured using only education and income as it has typically been measured in previous studies on regional economic development.

Contributions

This study makes three important contributions to the growth theory and regional innovation literature. First, it provides empirical support for the integration of macro (institutions) and micro (personal resources) economic theory to explain individual level innovative behavior in a regional economy. Second, it advances our understanding of the theoretical foundations for innovative behavior as it relates to bridging and bonding social capital. Third, two new constructs – individual well-being and institutional MIE engagement are shown to be important to innovation outcomes. Finally, it contributes practical implications, which can guide MIE participants setting out to organize, design, and implement structures and activities to promote innovative behavior in an MIE.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
Abstract: This is a working paper being developed for a Doctoral course at University of Dallas that discusses the glass ceiling and how it is alive and thriving today. Thus far, hypotheses and a literature review, along with some direction for the research are given. We would like a mentor to work with us to help build the paper into a publishable work.

INTRODUCTION

There are hundreds of research papers found with a direct search of Glass Ceiling. This is a mature topic. An integrative literature review will be performed to see how research has evolved over the years to measure how the research has been reconceptualized. Due to the topic’s maturity, a Temporal Structure will be used. Temporal Structure is defined as “More appropriate for mature topics, reviews with temporal or historical structure present literature according to a timeline of the origins and development of the topic and how this is represented in the literature” (Torraco, 2016, p. 11). This search has been narrowed to research papers written within the past ten years and which are focused on women working in the business environment.

Theory of the Glass Ceiling

When the term Glass Ceiling is raised in academia, it is inevitable that Edwin A Locke’s 1969 Value Theory be mentioned. This is a bit ironic as this study was nine years before the term Glass Ceiling was first mentioned by Marilyn Loden at the 1978 Women’s Exposition. Locke himself wrote “There have been numerous studies in which satisfaction has been correlated with such variables as age, tenure, pay, seniority, education, intelligence, Ethnic group and religion, etc.” (Locke, 1969, 321). There is no mention of gender, nor the word woman used in the paper.

An article on the topic Glass Ceiling was published by University of Wollongong in 2012. The title was How are women’s glass ceiling beliefs related to career success? (Smith et al., 2012). The study wanted to hypothesize how resilience, denial, acceptance, and resignation impacted career satisfaction, happiness, emotional wellbeing, physical health and work engagements. The theory is a woman would choose a mental position that best mediated her family life with work; a tradeoff, per se. The authors defined acceptance as a pessimistic set of beliefs of women achieving leadership positions. “Thus, we suggest Acceptance will be associated with positive emotions and actions at home and away from work. This will result in a positive relationship- between Acceptance and happiness, physiological wellbeing and physical health. However, Acceptance is a negative way of looking at gender inequality in workplaces and thus we expect it to be negatively related to career satisfaction and WE” ?? what is WE?? (Smith et al., 2012, 4,5).

Building on the Theory

Establishing acceptance as creating a negative work environment without proof to support the assumption is incorrect. In a 2018 paper titled Internalized equality and protest
against injustice: The role of disadvantaged group members’ self-respect in collective action tendencies (Renger et al., 2019). The authors set out to prove self-respect by itself can establish how one handles injustice and takes collective and cooperative action to protest the injustices. Injustices do not necessarily lead to negativity in the workplace. One of their hypotheses was “We suggest that self-respect differs from other self-constructs in one crucial feature and that, from this, we hypothesize that self-respect predicts cooperative but not hostile collective action against injustice” (Renger et al., 2019, 548).

A 2019 study published by the Journal of Business Ethics took a novel approach in researching Glass Ceilings. The report titled The Corporate Board Glass Ceiling: The Role of Empowerment and Culture in Shaping Board Gender Diversity (Lewellyn & Muller-Khale, 2019) . In this study, they took part of Hofstede’s theories and combined with a bit of their own to create what they defined as:

“Using both a longitudinal correlation-based methodology and a configurational approach with fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analysis, we integrate theoretical mechanisms from gender schema and institutional theories to develop a mid-range theory about how female empowerment and national culture shape gender diversity in corporate boards around the world” (Lewellyn & Muller-Khale, 2019, 329).

The results were as expected. There are opportunities to change the mindset of corporate board members on the selection of women for the boards and opportunities to write better policies with defined quotas.

Benjamin Newman conducted extensive research in a 2016 research paper titled Break the Glass Ceiling: Local Gender-Based Earnings Inequality and Women’s Belief in the American Dream. There are three things of note to this research. The extensive coverage of mainland USA is clearly mapped out, the quantity of the respondents reduced the standard deviation significantly and finally the author collaborated his research by comparing the results to an early Pew Research Center Poll on Gender conducted in 2008. In the conclusion of the report, the author summarized his paper in the belief that women’s discontent caused by the Glass Ceiling Hypothesis would also increase a woman’s political activism (at work??). He states “Indeed, as grievances with ‘the system’ have long been theorized as a source of political activism and protest (Gurr 1970; Klandermans 2003), one implication of the results presented here is that gender pay gaps in local labor markets may serve as a diffuse ‘bottom-up’ catalyst for political activism among women” (Newman, 2016, 1022).

Of the more interesting recent studies conducted in one titled Descriptive Elements and Conceptual Structure of Glass Ceiling Research ((Martinez-Fierro & Sancho, 2021) was published in July 2021. The two authors’ research was to define the number of research papers written on the Glass Ceiling, measure the increase/decrease over recent time, and to seek possible forms of future research. From 1987 – 2020, they found 823 documents from 580 sources. One must visualize the research to receive the full impact. Below are two select graphs from the report.

The first chart reflects the number of articles written by year.

Figure One (from Martinez-Fierro & Sancho, 2021)
The second figure is a three-fold analysis of glass ceiling literature.

**Figure Two (from Martinez-Fierro & Sancho, 2021)**

The research has so much detail such as the most cited papers and separately the most cited authors. The practical implication of the paper was stated as being. “Our analysis allows us to identify new research trends that academics and researchers can take advantage of in their future work. Academic institutions interested in studying this topic have a guide to the leading journals and can subscribe to those not yet available to their researchers” (Martinez-Fierro & Sancho, 2021, 18).

Hundreds of research papers over 30 years have made information available, but women are still facing Glass Ceilings around the world. We see some countries, such as the USA, implementing laws to ensure equality in numbers or other quantifiable measures. What we do not
see are qualitative reports on the value or benefits of leading women in the workforce. Simply put, show me the numbers. Measuring the performance of the companies with highly leveraged female board members is but one example of a possible new approach to not only measure, but to show results.

**Practitioner View Versus Academic view**

Practitioners versus academic’s topic? Academia has struggled to provide the real sources of the actual glass ceiling by using women’s perceptions about it. Some argue the choices of women in their jobs as they go through their career is the major source of a perceived glass ceiling. Women, after all their growth in the business world, still are the primary caregivers when it comes to children and their family members, such as aging parents and grandparents (known as the Sandwich Generation – (Gregg & Clinton 2000)). In real business life, practitioners are aware that women will have to take off work for these family issues if they arise and have thus provided them with more jobs that are somewhat more flexible. Along with this flexibility comes reduced responsibilities that lead to less pay. (Gregg & Clinton 2000).

Maybe part of the study should be whether or not women with children see this flexibility as a perk that can’t be measured in dollars and cents. Women without children often are not awarded this “perk” and are the ones who are left to take up the slack while their peers are away and are thus could actually be those who see the glass ceiling most vividly. Many of them have put off having a family to pursue their careers, yet because there is the “fear” by upper management that a woman could drop out at any time to balance family and work, they aren’t promoted to jobs with more responsibility. (Gregg & Clinton 2000)

**Planned Project Research**

The planned study will include a survey of the nurses at a large Texas hospital about their perception of what is happening in their work environment. These questions will be related to variables shown in several previous studies that are related to a perception of the glass ceiling. These will cover issues such as pay, benefits, work hours, levels of responsibility, movement into management positions and representation of men and women in management positions. The researcher will obtain records from Human Resources, without names, to determine pay rates of men and women in management, movement of men and women into management positions, and relative responsibilities of each management position. The perceptions of the employees from the survey questions will be compared to the actual data gleaned from HR records. It is believed that those who have been denied positions in management and are thus paid less than managers will show a higher belief that the variables related to a glass ceiling exist in their workplace. This higher belief will be related negatively to employee job satisfaction.

**REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR**
HIGH-PERFORMANCE WORK PRACTICES, PERCEIVED ORGANIZATIONAL SUPPORT AND COMMITMENT: DOES GENERATION MATTER?

NATASHA JOHNSON
Lipscomb University, Nashville, TN
natasha.johnson@lipscomb.edu

CAITLIN E. SMITH SOCKBESON
ZONGHUI LI
JOHN C. SHAW
Jacksonville University

INTRODUCTION

As organizations strive to attract and retain talented employees to achieve competitive advantage (Kinicki & Williams, 2016), one consideration is how employees from different generations will respond to various organizational offerings. To realize their objectives, organizations seek to cultivate organizational commitment (Klein et al., 2012), defined as an “individual’s psychological bond with the organization, as represented by an affective attachment to the organization, internalization of its values and goals, and a behavioral desire to put forth effort to support it (Judge & Kammeyer-Mueller, 2012). Research indicates that organizational commitment is linked to organizational success and decreased turnover costs (Bateman & Strasser, 1984; Mowday et al., 1979; Vazifehdoost et al., 2012). Although commitment may be more important than ever (Klein, 2016), today’s workforce may not be consistently or proportionately committed.

High-performance work practices (HPWPs) are complementary Human Resource Management (HRM) practices that empower employees to contribute favorably toward organizational performance (Ogbonnaya & Valizade, 2016). As such HPWPs have the potential to influence organizational commitment. The purpose of this study is to explore the relationship between HPWPs and organizational commitment, 2) whether the positive effects between HPWPs and organizational commitment are mediated by perceived organizational support (POS), and 3) whether the mediation effect is further moderated by generational cohorts.

This study provides theoretical insights into the mechanisms underlying organizational commitment by examining the effect of HPWPs and the mediating effect of POS. Furthermore, we contribute to the literature by highlighting the variations across generational cohorts and testing a moderated mediation model regarding the relationship between HPWPs and organizational commitment. Finally, this study is among the few using survey data from employees in the healthcare industry. As such, this study provides new theoretical insights and evidence on the relevant organizational studies and the generational cohorts literature.

THEORETICAL DEVELOPMENT

Organizational Commitment, HPWPs, and POS

HPWPs are practices that optimize employees’ skills, motivation, and opportunity to exert discretionary effort (Appelbaum et al., 2000). As such, HPWPs serve to empower employees to contribute favorably toward organizational performance (Ogbonnaya & Valizade, 2016) and improve the overall quality of employees’ functioning at work. In addition, HPWPs promote important employee outcomes including job satisfaction, commitment, trust, and psychological health (e.g., Jensen, et al., 2013; Macky & Boxall, 2007; Paré & Tremblay, 2007; Van De Voorde et al., 2012; Whitener, 2001).
Due to its relationship with individual outcomes including turnover, job satisfaction, and performance, organizational commitment continues to receive theoretical and empirical attention (e.g., Cohen, 2007; Reichers, 1985). Based on extant research (Cohen, 2007; Brammer et al., 2007; Finegan, 2000; Ogilvie, 1986), it seems reasonable to propose that generational cohort and organizational practices such as HPWPs are related to organizational commitment.

Drawing on social exchange theory (Gouldner, 1960) and organizational support theory (Eisenberger et al., 1986), this study explores the mediation effect of POS. POS, the extent to which employees perceive their organization values their contributions and cares about their overall well-being (Thompson et al., 2020), is central to social exchange relationships in employment (Pazy & Ganzach, 2009). Eisenberger et al. (1986) suggested that employees who perceive that they are supported and valued by their organization respond in ways that benefit the organization. HPWPs communicate to employees that they are valued by their organizations (Van De Voorde & Beijer, 2015) which, in turn, increase perceptions of support and engenders the norm of reciprocity (Gouldner, 1960).

Such support elicits employees’ feelings of obligation toward the organization, and, as a recent meta-analysis found, may encourage employees to respond with increased levels of organizational commitment, job satisfaction, and employee job performance (Kurtessis et al., 2017). This study investigates two specific HPWPs, employment security and flexible work design, due to the fact that they align with the work-related values of the generational cohorts in this study and are expected to elicit a reciprocated exchange from them. We suggest that the receipt of these HPWPs increases perceptions of support from an organization which, in turn, initiates an exchange relationship reciprocated by employees’ commitment to organization. Overall, both HPWPs are expected to have a positive effect on organizational commitment through increasing perceived organizational support.

H1: POS mediates the positive relationship between HPWPs ((a) employment security and (b) flexible work design) and organizational commitment.

Generations in the workplace

A generation is a group of individuals born within a certain period or span of time that share in the experience of specific socio-economic events during the developmental stages of their lives (Mannheim, 1952; Schaie, 1965). Each generation is influenced by specific events that contribute to a distinct collective personal value system (Zabel et al., 2017) such that each generation holds similar values and attitudes toward work (Zabel et al., 2017).

Today’s workforce includes five generational cohorts (Meriac et al., 2010). Following previous research (Meriac et al. (2010); Zabel et al., 2017), this study focuses on three generations which account for the majority of the workforce — Baby Boomers (1946-1964), Gen X (1965-1980), and Millennials (1981-1999).

Prior studies have suggested that Baby Boomers respect authority (Gursoy et al., 2008), prefer a hierarchical work structure (Yu & Miller, 2005), work hard, and are highly committed to their organization (Davis et al., 2006). On the other hand, Gen X are more individualistic (Twenge et al., 2012) and feel less committed or obligated to their respective organizations (Hess & Jespen, 2009). Lastly, Millennials are labeled as spoiled and possess a sense of entitlement (Hershatter & Epstein, 2010; Twenge, 2006).

Generational differences in work values can result in distinctive job attitudes and behaviors. For example, Benson and Brown (2011) showed that Baby Boomers have higher job satisfaction and are less likely to resign than the Gen X cohort.

Although employers enact policies to encourage positive attitudes and behaviors, employees may not react to these policies in a similar way. While prior studies have found that variations exist across generational cohorts regarding their individual values, beliefs, and
attitudes, we argue that employees’ behaviors are also shaped by organizational policies and inputs. According to social exchange theory (Blau, 1964; Emerson, 1976; Gouldner, 1960), reciprocal transactions occur between employees and their respective organizations (Eisenberger et al., 2001). When employees perceive that the organization is taking care of their needs, psychological bonds are strengthened which in turn increase organizational commitment (Cropanzano & Mitchell, 2005; Panaccio & Vandenberghe, 2009). However, we contend that the relationship between POS and organizational commitment is moderated by generational cohorts. While prior research has found that Millennials have a sense of entitlement (e.g., Twenge, 2006) and are less altruistic (Twenge et al., 2010), Millennials may be less likely to respond to POS with desired job attitudes and behavior. Feeling entitled to certain levels of organizational support, Millennials may not feel the need to reciprocate to the extent as other generations. Therefore, we contend that the relationship between POS and organizational commitment is weaker for Millennials than for other generations. Seeing that Baby Boomers are the most committed and least likely to job-hop of any generation (Carver & Candela, 2008; Twenge, 2010), their level of organizational commitment may be high regardless of POS. Thus, we suggest that Gen X will be the most responsive to POS with organizational commitment. Prior research has shown that Gen X employees may respond differently to organizational support (e.g., Benson et al., 2018).

H2: Generation will moderate the positive relationship between POS and organizational commitment, such that the association will be strongest for Generation X and weakest for Millennials.

Taken together, we predict that the HPWPs will increase POS, but that this will not translate equally to organizational commitment for all employees. Instead, we predict a moderated mediation model where the indirect effects of HPWPs on organizational commitment vary by each generation’s response to POS.

H3. The indirect effect of (a) employment security and (b) flexible work design on organizational commitment through POS is conditional on generation. The indirect effect is strongest for Generation X employees and weakest for Millennials.

METHOD

Data and Sample

For this study, nurses in U.S. hospital facilities were surveyed. Nurses were eliminated if they were not working in a hospital or medical facility, if they were managers, if they were not from the Baby Boomer, Gen X, or Millennial generations, or if they failed attention checks. This resulted in 150 valid responses retained: 51 Baby Boomers, 48 Gen X, and 51 Millennials. Mean age was 48, and 85% of the sample was female.

Measures

Generational Cohort. Based on the categorical generational cohort groupings proposed by Meriac et al. (2010), participants’ reported birth year was used to classify them as Baby Boomers (1946 - 1964), Gen X (1965 - 1980) or Millennials (1981 - 1999).

Flexible Work Design. The flexible work design scale included 10 items adapted from the McCloskey/Mueller Satisfaction Scale (Mueller & McCloskey, 1990) and the Flexible Work Practices Survey (Halpern, 2005). Response options ranged from Strongly Disagree to Strongly Agree on a 7-point scale ($\alpha =0.79$).

Employment Security. The employment security scale consisted of six items adapted from
the High-Performance Human Resource Practices Scale (Zhang et al., 2008) and Kuhnert and Lahey (1988). Response options ranged from Never to Always on a 7-point scale (α = 0.76). Higher scores were associated with higher perceived levels of employment security.

Perceived Organizational Support. The Survey of Perceived Organizational Support (SPOS) scale (Eisenberger et al., 1986) was used to measure POS. The SPOS uses a 7-point Likert scale (α = 0.97).

Organizational Commitment. Organizational commitment was measured using 10 items from the organizational commitment scale developed by Allen and Meyer (1990). Response options ranged from XXX to XXX on a 7-point scale (α = 0.83).

Control Variables. Employee reported gender and organizational tenure served as control variables.

RESULTS

Examination of the correlations between variables shows that generation has a significant relationship with tenure (such that older generations report more tenure, as expected), flexible work design, employment security, perceived organizational support, and organizational commitment. The correlations indicate that older generations perceive more HPWPs, POS, and report more organizational commitment.

Additionally, a preliminary MANOVA indicates that the perceptions of HPWPs do not vary by generation when organizational tenure is included in the model. Without organizational tenure, perceptions of employment security and flexible work design do vary by generation with Millennials reporting the lowest perceptions of these HPWPs. This is not possible to disentangle from tenure effects, however. Even controlling for tenure, though, there are generational differences in POS and organizational commitment. As expected from prior research, Baby Boomers report the highest levels of organizational commitment as well as the highest POS.

We ran regression analyses using PROCESS macro in SPSS (Hayes, 2017). First, we tested the proposed mediation. Employment security has a significant positive effect on the mediator, POS; it also has a direct effect on organizational commitment. POS has a positive effect on organizational commitment as well. The indirect effect of employment security through POS is also significant. Thus, hypothesis 1a is supported. Flexible work design also has a positive effect on POS, and the indirect effect on organizational commitment through POS is significant. Thus, hypothesis 1b is also supported.

Next, we tested generational moderation of the POS-organizational commitment relationship. There was one significant moderating effect, indicating that Gen X employees respond more positively in response to POS than Millennials do. All three generations respond positively to POS with organizational commitment, but POS is particularly important for Gen X’s level of commitment. Thus, Hypothesis 2 is supported.

Last, we tested moderated mediation: Whether the indirect effects of HPWPs on organizational commitment through POS would vary by generation such that the relationship would be weaker for Millennials. For employment security, results showed that the coded variable comparing Gen X to Millennials had a significant effect on organizational commitment. Likewise, the interaction between that variable and POS had a significant effect on organizational commitment. With the generational interactions in the model, employment security maintains a significant effect on organizational commitment, but the effect of POS becomes non-significant. Conditional effects showed that POS had a significant effect on organizational commitment for Generation X, but not for the other generations, and that the indirect effect of employment security on organizational commitment through POS was likewise significant for Gen X but not for the other generations. The index of moderated mediation is significant for the generational variable comparing Gen X to Millennials but not for the variable comparing Baby Boomers to Millennials. Thus, H3a is supported.
For flexible work design, again the interaction between POS and the generational variable coded to compare Gen X to Millennials is significant, though the generational variables do not have a significant direct effect on organizational commitment. With the generational variables and interactions in the model, neither flexible work design nor POS have a significant impact on organizational commitment. The conditional indirect effects show that flexible work design affects organizational commitment through POS for both Baby Boomers and Gen X, but not Millennials, but the index of moderated mediation is not significant for either generational variable. Thus, H3b is not supported.

DISCUSSION

Although the relationship between HRM practices and organizational commitment has received considerable scholarly attention (e.g., Fiorito et al., 2007; Ogilvie, 1986), the mechanisms underlying this relationship remain less clear. This study draws upon social exchange theory, arguing that employees who feel that their organization values their contributions and cares about their overall well-being tend to reciprocate with positive attitudinal outcomes. We theorize that the positive relationship between HPWPs (i.e., employment security and flexible work design) is mediated by POS, and generations moderate the positive relationship between POS and organizational commitment. Using survey data collected in a sample of registered nurses in U.S. hospital settings, we find that employment security affects organizational commitment directly as well as indirectly, through POS. However, flexible work design only impacts organizational commitment indirectly through its effect on POS. Additionally, the effect varies somewhat by generations. As expected, Baby Boomers report the highest organizational commitment of all. Our moderation analyses indicate that ensuring high POS is beneficial for all generations but that it is particularly important to Generation X. Millennials show moderate organizational commitment overall; their level of commitment at high levels of POS is roughly equivalent to Baby Boomers’ commitment at low POS. Generation X, on the other hand, will be motivated to go from low organizational commitment to high organizational commitment as POS increases. The findings also indicate that employment security is one way to improve Generation X’s organizational commitment through POS, as the significant moderated mediation model showed that the conditional indirect effect of employment security on organizational commitment was only significant for Generation X. For flexible work design, the results were not as clear. Flexible work design only had an impact on organizational commitment through POS. Additionally, the index of moderated mediation was not significant, although the conditional indirect effects did show positive impacts on commitment for Baby Boomers and Gen X. Flexible work design may have stronger positive relationships with other organizational outcomes, but it does not impact organizational commitment directly in this sample.

The findings from this study offer at least two contributions. First, this study theorizes and reports mediation effects of POS on the HPWPs-organizational commitment relationship by drawing on social exchange theory. Second, this study underscores the importance of generations in the workplace and examines the moderating effects of generational cohorts on the POS-organizational commitment relationship. The debate over whether generations are meaningful in organizational research rages on (Benson et al., 2018; Campbell et al., 2017; Kowske et al., 2010; Twenge, 2010).

Overall, our results support the “entitled Millennial” rhetoric, at least to the extent that Millennials reciprocate the receipt of HPWPs with organizational commitment. Baby Boomers are not significantly more responsive to POS than Millennials although their organizational commitment does tend to be higher overall. More practically, our results also support paying particular attention to Generation X’s POS as a mechanism for increasing job attitudes like
commitment and potentially reducing turnover. In addition to offering advances to theory, the findings offer relevant implications for managers. For example, management and HR practitioners can strategically incorporate the findings into HR policies to stimulate a positive exchange response, in the form of commitment, from their multigenerational workforce. This study also reveals that various HPWPs may have different direct and indirect impacts on commitment across the generations examined.

In conclusion, different generations of respondents responded differently to POS. Gen X, in particular, is likely to reciprocate with organizational commitment when POS is high, and providing employment security is one way to increase organizational commitment through POS. Determining which HPWPs are perceived as supportive by Gen X employees may help facilitate organizational commitment and other positive workplace outcomes.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
Abstract: Followership style and follower outcomes are intricately linked, and there are many aspects that influence that link. This paper investigates the relationship between followership style, leadership style and follower outcomes. Specifically, the five followership styles of the sheep, the yes-people, the alienated, the pragmatics and the star followers are studied in the followership style construct. The charismatic leadership style is investigated for its role as a moderator, and the specific follower outcome studied is that of organization citizen behavior (OCB).

In this paper, we address the specific aspect of followership styles (Kelley, 2008) and investigate the impact of charismatic leadership on the relationship between followership styles and organizational citizenship behavior (OCB). OCB can be classified as the extra efforts (extra-role behavior) that an employee takes undertakes that is not required as part of one’s job tasks (Organ, 1988). Our paper aims to study the relationship between followership styles, OCB and charismatic leadership. Previous studies on followership that have explored the topic of followership have primarily focused on job satisfaction and organizational commitment and have either considered followership as a whole or only considered the dimension of active engagement (Blanchard et al. 2009; Gatti et al. 2014). Factors such as stresses and strains may affect the relationship between followers and OCB (Sosik, 2005), where followers were found to be willing to engage in OCB ‘because of their favorable perceptions of the leader, based on their trust, loyalty, and obedience to the leader’. Our research question is: What is the relationship between followership style and follower outcome of OCB when moderated by the charismatic leadership style? Figure 1 shows a representation of our research question, where the charismatic leadership style impacts the relationship between followership style and OCB?

Figure 1. A representation of the relationship between followership styles, OCB and charismatic leadership.

METHODS

Our proposed model investigates the relationship between followership style and the follower outcome of OCB under the impact of charismatic leadership. This can be expressed as follows:

\[
OCB = f \left( F_i \pm C + F_i \ast C \right) \quad (1)
\]

\[
OCB = \alpha \ast F_i + \beta \ast C + \gamma \ast F_i \ast C \quad (2)
\]
where, $F_i$ denotes followership style and $C$ denotes charismatic leadership. The $\pm$ operator between $F_i$ and $C$ indicates that the followership style’s impact on OCB may be amplified or diminished. The values given by $\alpha$ and $\beta$ denote the weights of followership style and charismatic leadership, respectively, on the overall outcome of OCB, where $0 \leq \alpha, \beta \leq 1$. The term $F_i * C$ denotes the interaction between followership style and charismatic leadership. This interaction term is modulated by the variable $\gamma$, where $0 \leq \gamma \leq 1$. A value of $\gamma = 0$ denotes no impact of charismatic leadership on the followership style, and a value of $\gamma = 1$ denotes complete impact of charismatic leadership on followership style.

Below, we hypothesize upon the significance of equation (2) for each of the five followership styles. As the values of the coefficients $\alpha$, $\beta$ and $\gamma$ vary from 0 to 1, the dependence of OCB on the specific followership style and the impact of charismatic leadership varies.

**Sheep:** The presence of a charismatic leader has the potential to elicit greater motivation among the sheep-style of followers (Choi, 2006). Thus, although the sheep followership style affects OCB negatively, the presence of charismatic leadership might weaken the negative relationship between the sheep followership style and follower OCB in such a way that as charismatic leadership increases, there will be more follower OCB.

**Yes-people:** Followers with the yes-people style are responsive to the leader’s requirements and their behavior leads to higher OCB (Thomas et al, 2016). Thus, charismatic leadership can potentially amplify the positive relationship between the yes-people followership style and follower OCB in such a way that as charismatic leadership increases, there will be higher follower OCB.

**Pragmatic:** The pragmatic followership style has a positive relationship with OCB (Woods, 2009). However, the presence of charismatic leadership could alter this indifference in such a way that as charismatic leadership increases, there will be even more follower OCB.

**Star:** The star followership style might affect OCB positively (Hinic et al, 2017), and charismatic leadership could increase the positive relationship between the star followership style and follower OCB such that as charismatic leadership increases, follower OCB will increase more.

**Alienated:** Alienated followership style affects OCB negatively (Morton et al, 2011), and the presence of charismatic leadership could weaken the relationship between the alienated followership style and follower OCB such that as charismatic leadership increases, follower OCB might continue to diminish.

**DISCUSSION**

While the charismatic leader can lead to greater OCB among the passive followers (sheep and yes-people) and achieve highest OCB among the active followers (star and pragmatic), we hypothesize that the charismatic leader’s influence does not increase OCB among the alienated followers. Alienated followers are already antithetical to a leader’s vision and leadership, and charismatic leadership can potentially to increase the antagonism among alienated followers toward their charismatic leader. Analysis of this hypothesis has important implications for understanding why certain employees cannot be motivated to achieve higher OCB. Future work in this direction includes the development of instruments to measure the relationship between OCB, charismatic leadership, and followership styles in both controlled and field studies. Additionally, further testing is required to determine the distributions of the coefficients of $\alpha$, $\beta$, $\gamma$, and include additional variables that affect the relationship between OCB, charismatic leadership, and followership styles. Charismatic leadership is manifested differently in diverse environments, thus the development of new and rigorous models would yield richer insights into how followership styles impact OCB, and what role the charismatic leader plays in that process.

**CONCLUSIONS**
This paper developed an analytical model to represent the relationship between followership styles and OCB in the presence of charismatic leadership. Our model has important implications for leadership training, sensitivity to followership styles, and composition of teams. While leadership training is designed to achieve the best possible outcome for leaders, team members, and ultimately the organization, it is important to also design such training to be responsive to the different kinds of followership styles and leadership styles. A charismatic leader inspires most people to achieve more, but there are limits to the charismatic leader’s influence.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
A TRANSACTION COST ECONOMIC FRAMEWORK FOR DEVELOPING THE ADOPTION CRITERIA OF OPEN-SOURCE SOFTWARE IN ORGANIZATIONS

ROBERT MURIMI
University of Dallas
rmurimi@udallas.edu

Abstract: In recent years, the increased frequency of cybersecurity breaches, the growing complexity of malware and the rapidly expanding networks of Internet-connected devices have culminated in a renewed urgency of software security. This paper develops a framework based on transaction cost theory to develop the criteria for adoption free or open-source software. Since open source software is freely available, an important concern is the security of such software. Currently, open-source software is categorized into three categories: public domain, permissive licenses and copyleft licenses. The goal of this paper is to propose a framework based on transaction cost economics (TCE) to study the security and usability of each of these categories of software. This work derives distinct criteria that characterize the various categories of open-source software, and thereby provide usable metrics of security for each open-source software category. The findings of our study can be used in a wide variety of environments to assess the security of open-source software.

INTRODUCTION

Open-source software (OSS) is software whose source code is released under a license that makes it freely available to users. As of 2018, OSS exceeds the number of proprietary software (Black Duck). This paper investigates if the various categories of OSS impact the security and usability of the software. Currently, OSS is divided into three categories: public domain, permissive and copyleft. These categories are delineated by the number of freedoms that the software licenses afford the users. For example, can users download the software, create derivative works and then charge for the derivative works? What is the kind of security and usability afforded by such software licenses versus the licenses that do not allow users to copyright derivative works? We explore the complex decision-making processes underlying these research questions by using the framework of transaction cost economics (TCE). TCE has been widely used in various domains as a foundational theory that improves efficiency and reduces waste in organizational processes.

Specifically, this paper studies the following two research questions, motivated by the TCE-inspired framework in Figure 1.

![Figure 1. Representation of factors impacting security and usability of OSS](image-url)
RQ1: What is the relationship between category of OSS license and security of software?

RQ2: What relationship exists between common metrics of vulnerability assessment and usability of OSS?

These research questions are inherent in all kinds of organizations that use information systems in any capacity. This paper looks at issues of security in terms of access controls and authentication procedures available in the software license and examines usability in terms of the user freedoms and the user-friendliness of software.

BACKGROUND

OSS is categorized into three categories: public domain, permissive licenses and copyleft licenses. These categories are based on the number of freedoms available to the user of the software (Ballhausen, 2019). In copyleft software, the user can copy, distribute, and change the software under the same license as the original software. On the other hand, permissive licenses impose no such constraints on the user. Public-domain software is software that is placed in the public domain for use by anyone, without any requirement for attribution. Guadamuz (2004) found that for software developers who wish to disseminate their work to the largest possible audience without interference from commercial interests, copyleft licenses with simple contractual agreements offer the best possible solution. A popular application of free software licenses has been found in the licensing afforded by Creative Commons (CC) Broussard (2007). Work in Mustonen (2003) found that program implementation costs and size of the consumer market determine whether or not a firm will invest in the development of copyleft software, which is freely available licensed software. Sen et al (2011) found that the larger the effort that goes into the development of the software, the more likely it is free from restrictions. In Colazo et al. (2005), the authors found that copyleft software projects had a higher rate of success in projects than non-copyleft software projects, with higher developer membership and productivity. Similar work found that software developers preferred less-restrictive licenses than non-developers and administrators (Subramaniam et al, 2009).

METHOD

In order to study the relationship between security and usability of OSS by its category, this paper will look at the most downloaded software in each category of OSS – public domain, permissive and copyleft. For each software that is downloaded, we will examine the Terms and Conditions (T&C) license to extract information about the access control, authentication and user-freedoms that are available with the software. User-friendliness of each OSS software will be studied using an online survey. This study will be an associational, quasi-field study with a convenience sampling approach. The population will be software developers in different organizations, who will be asked to participate in the study based on their knowledge of the most-downloaded software in each category. Since there are no treatment and assignment groups, the study will be non-experimental. Our paper is based on the premise that there exists a relationship between security and usability, and that the category of OSS determines the kind of relationship between the two. Conventional design thinking places security and usability as inverses of each other – i.e. high security offers low usability and vice versa. However, existing research does not offer specific perspectives on this relationship for the case of OSS. Although the study proceeds with the assumption of a negative relationship between the two, our study will help to uncover the precise nature of relationship between security and usability for each
category of OSS. The dependent variables are security and usability of the most-downloaded software in each category. The independent variable is the software category. The mediators are the access control, authentication, user-freedoms and user-friendliness of each software.

Since our paper deduces the security and usability of OSS from the T&C, it is important to note that T&C might get updated with newer versions, and third-party libraries offer their own set of T&C that are different from that of the original software. Thus, it becomes challenging to assess the security and usability for software that exists in multiple versions and that has been built by several contributions from third-party developers. Another limitation of the study arises from the metrics that we are using to study the security and usability. Our focus on the access control and authentication mechanisms to study security, and the metric of user-freedoms to study usability are not comprehensive, and different ways of studying software security may be envisioned that requires more rigorous models. Further, usability of software will be determined from the responses of 120 software developers, which is a limited sample with which to gauge the usability and security of software.

CONCLUSIONS

The work in this paper explored whether the category of OSS impacted the security and usability of the software. The importance of software security continues to rise, especially with the rise of networks of all kinds that enable seamless integration of users and their devices in networks populated with humans and IoT devices. The study of OSS in terms of its usability and security offers multiple avenues or further research. For example, what is the value of OSS to the developing organizations? How do they benefit from devoting valuable resources to the development of applications that do not result in revenue? Would incorporating additional security features during the development process significantly increase the burden of development? These and other questions related to security and usability will help reveal more clearly the broader implications of software solutions on the overall cybersecurity best practices of individuals and organizations.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
THE MEDIA CHOICE FOR ORGANIZATIONAL MEMORY IN DISPERSED ORGANIZATIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

HELOISA ARAGAO
College of Business
University of Texas Arlington
heloisabenevide.aragao@mavs.uta.edu

Abstract: The advancement of technology has enabled changes in the traditional business models by allowing organizations to conduct business dispersed geographically. The new scenario brings a new concern about how knowledge may not flow efficiently within the organization as it travels through geographical boundaries. Likewise, how lived experiences are stored into memories to further support organizational decisions. In this paper, I suggest a framework for conceptualizing the most optimal media choice to be used by organizations to promote organizational learning, particularly organizational memory, when dispersed geographically. The framework discusses the media’s ability to achieve synchronicity, reach, capacity, and retainability.

INTRODUCTION

The digital revolution or the “development of digital information processing and storage technologies” (Baum and Haveman, 2020: 271) is here to stay. This trend has influenced the way companies deliver goods and services, and has impacted organizations’ strategies, structures, and processes. One main effect of digitalization involves the change in traditional business models by enabling organizations to conduct business through dispersed geographical arrangements (Baum and Haveman, 2020). Digital media, e-mail, video conferences, chats, and instant messaging, among others, enable the interaction of workers and workgroups, even when they are physically away from each other. Because of these technologies, many organizations have allowed workers to telecommute either full-time or part-time. In addition, the COVID-19 pandemic has forced the worldwide workforce to rely on technology (e.g., virtual collaboration tools) to continue to operate remotely.

However, the way organizations acquire, create, and maintain knowledge and skills is yet a topic that needs further investigation in such dispersed organizational structures because knowledge may not flow smoothly as it travels through geographical boundaries. In particular, organizational memory (OM) is imperative to organizational success (Huber, 1991; Moorman and Miner, 1997) because it allows organizations to use gained experience (Dunham and Burt, 2014) as input into their decision-making processes, and their framing and solving of problems. As a strategic organizational resource (Kameo, 2017), OM becomes crucial to organizational learning (Huber, 1991). Yet, building OM when workers are dispersed geographically may be challenging. In light of this, in this paper, I answer the following research questions: How do organizations nurture OM when adopting disperse organizational arrangements? What are the media attributes that contribute the most to OM?

To answer these questions, I propose an updated perspective on the dimensions of digital media used by a geographically dispersed workforce. I argue that the effectiveness of digital media in creating, retaining, and retrieving knowledge within dispersed organizational arrangements depends on the digital media’s ability to be reachable, synchronous, and retainable, and media’s transfer capacity. This paper represents an evolution to theories, such as the Media Richness Theory and the Social Influence Theory, grounded in the concepts of the OM, by including the latest digital media channels available to connect dispersed workers such as social media into the literature.
The main objective of this paper is to develop a framework for conceptualizing the most optimal media choice to be used by organizations to promote OM considering the type of knowledge. The framework values rational, social, and situational aspects and aims to identify which media can enhance the collection, storage, and retrieval of knowledge to support the organizational decision-making processes and framing and solving of problems when the actors are distributed geographically.

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

Organizational Memory
Organizational learning research indicates that organizations can learn from their past experiences. As one of the organizational learning dimensions (Huber, 1991), OM refers to how knowledge is stored and retrieved whenever necessary, linking the past gained experiences to the present situations (Martin de Holan and Phillips, 2004; Oliveira, 2000; Stein, 1995; Walsh and Ungson, 1991), which can impact organizations in distinct ways, leading to positive and negative outcomes. OM main roles are the support of knowledge for decision-making process (informational), the reduction of cost associated to obtain new information (control), and the provision of individual’s power over organizational members (political) (Walsh and Ungson, 1991). To fulfill those functions, the memories are stored in different repositories - individuals, culture, transformation, structure, and ecology (Walsh and Ungson, 1991). While individuals are the primary source of knowledge (Cross and Baird, 2000), the interaction among work members is crucial in creating collective knowledge, which therefore is stored to and retrieved from the other retention bins. The social networks, then, play an important role in the development of OM (Olivera, 2000), and the communications channels choices allow the interaction to happen.

In a context where employees are remote or dispersed, the social interactions do not happen easily. The employees rely on the availability of communication channels to retrieve (remember) and retain (learn) memories from the many organizational repositories. Thus, OM faces barriers to be developed and there are challenges to be overcome.

Communication Channels
According to the Media Richness Theory, different communication channels available to organizations differ on their ability to allow user to interact, share, and interpret information (Lengel and Daft, 1988). The theory classifies the media based on the degree of the “richness”, being the face-to-face the richest media while interpersonal static media the lowest one. The classification is based on the “ability to handle multiple information cues simultaneously, ability to facilitate rapid feedback, and ability to establish a personal focus” (Lengel and Daft, 1988). Findings from Baltes et al. (2002) confirmed face-to-face, by its degree of synchronization and degree to communicate beyond words, as the most effective media in relation to decision-making process when compared to email, chat, teleconference, and video conference.

The media choice was also explored by Webster and Trevino (1995), based on rational and social theories. They argued that Media Richness Theory emphasizes the content of the message, however situational traits (i.e., geographical distance and capacity to reach many people) (Trevino et al., 1987), social aspects (e.g., norms, attitudes, and behaviors) (Fuik et al., 1990), and symbolic cues (e.g., formality and legitimacy) (Trevino et al., 1990) should also be considered, completing each other instead of competing against each other.

Given the many advances in telecommunications the business world has experienced in the past years, including channel reliability, the increasing usage of mobile devices and collaborative systems, I propose four dimensions that drive the media choice in dispersed organizations grounded in the Media Richness Theory (Lengel and Daft, 1988) and the Social Influence Theory (Fuik et al., 1990) classification to nurture OM.
Media Reach. A medium can vary in its capacity to reach a greater number of people within the organization. I define *media reach* as the capability to deliver knowledge to a greater number of people. Recorded videos, e-mails, and social media are examples of media that can easily reach the intended audience and simply deliver the message.

Media Synchronicity. A medium can vary on its ability to allow real-time feedback. I define, *media synchronicity* as the capability to allow coworkers to react in real-time to the message, enabling both the conveyor and receiver to develop a collective understanding of the message, enhancing knowledge creation and interpretation. Etter et al. (2019) stated that a medium that offers synchronicity contributes to creation and diffusion of information by social interaction which allows the flow and exchange of ideas. The use of live video conference, social media, and cellphone exemplify media high in synchronicity while media broadcast, email, and text messages represent lower levels of synchronicity.

Media Retainability. A medium can vary on its ability to keep a record of the knowledge being transferred and make it accessible. I define *media retainability* as the capacity to allow knowledge to be stored into a specific repository and remembered when needed. For example, knowledge posted in either website or social media can be easily extracted by employees. These media also keep track of time period for each event that contribute to the flow of the knowledge and enhance people understanding of the overall business history.

Media Capacity. A medium can vary on its ability to transfer different volumes of knowledge. I propose that *media capacity* refers to the volume or amount of information that can be transferred at one time. As in the bandwidth definition, capacity refers to “how much relevant information a medium can present within an exchange” (Potosky, 2008: 636). Emails, websites, intranet, and social media represent examples of media that can delivery large amounts of knowledge at once within the organization, while cellphone, chat and text message hold a low volume of knowledge.

Model Development

Media high in synchronization can mimic a face-to-face interaction, with real-time feedback and instant collaboration. The social integration allowed by synchronous media increases the assessment of memories for interpretation of current situations, therefore new experiences can also be stored to be used in the future. In addition to synchronization, if the media choice is also able to carry a large amount of information, the sender and the receiver(s) can expand their understanding of the message, enhancing knowledge creation. Imagine an organization planning the launch of a new product, which demands the participation of many actors, from marketing, sales, and operations departments spread geographically, for example. The flow of information in real-time is needed to ensure cooperation and collaboration among all actors. Successes and failures experiences are revisited. Media high in synchronicity and capacity would be considered the best option to guarantee that the social interaction would be as close to face-to-face as possible. Therefore, I propose that a media choice high in both synchronicity and capacity enhances its positive effect on OM:

**Proposition 1:** OM in disperse organizational arrangements will be enhanced when knowledge is transferred through a medium that is high in both synchronicity and capacity.

Tacit knowledge is known as "practical, action-oriented knowledge or 'know-how' based on practice, acquired by experience, seldom expressed openly, often resembles intuition" (Smith, 2000: 314). Tacit knowledge is then formed and developed based on the existing social interaction among organizational members and depends on the existing social network. It represents a collective understanding. Unlike explicit knowledge, which refers to written and formally maintained knowledge, tacit knowledge emphasizes the need for the synchronicity
dimension to develop common thinking. By using media that is both high in synchronicity and high in capacity, organizations become able to handle extensive knowledge, leading the volume of exchange and sharing knowledge to increase significantly. This is relevant for complex situation discussions when the use of memory contributes to accessing previous organizational experiences, strategies, achievements, and failures to support the decision-making process and framing and solving of problems. Thus, I propose that:

**Proposition 2: The positive effect of a medium that is high in both synchronicity and capacity on OM will be enhanced when the knowledge transferred is extensive and tacit.**

For media low in synchronicity and capacity dimensions, I understand that the individual memory is promoted. As an example, imagine the choice to use chat or instant messaging to integrate a dispersed workforce. In general, it creates a scenario in which only a few actors interact for a short period of time, and it offers a limited capacity to exchange much knowledge. By adopting other media choices such as phone calls and phone meetings to increase the level of synchronicity, the exchange of knowledge tends to rise but the volume transferred is still constrained, thus encouraging the individual or group memory. On the other hand, if the organization decides to increase the capacity of the media while the level of synchronization remains low, a large volume of knowledge is transferred but without sufficient interaction among the actors, which would incite the creation of individual learning. This scenario can be represented by the use of email, website, and social media.

The ability to reach a greater number of people within the organization is another dimension proposed. The distribution of knowledge is essential to organizational learning and for the creation of organizational memories (Huber, 1991). When the knowledge is held by only one person, it influences individual memory, and the organization is at risk if this person leaves the company. If the knowledge reaches a small number of people, it can impact the workgroup memory and influence the decision-making process on a single department or site. However, when the knowledge reaches a large number of people, it becomes rooted into OM. Considering the knowledge shared among the organization is stored on “experiential knowledge” repositories (Olivera, 2000), the media choice degree will affect the level of retainability. Knowledge exchanged verbally over the phone represents a low level of retainability because it relies only on the individuals’ minds. On the other hand, a company website offers numerous sources of knowledge. Using the previous example in which an organization is planning the launch of a new product, the firm intranet can be used to publish up-to-date plans, actions, deadlines, and results to the entire workforce, while all historical data from the previous launches are also available. As described by Olivera (2000: 821), the intranet represents a medium that “collects and stores a vast amount of codified knowledge that the firm has developed through experience and research. The Knowledge Intranet was designed to be easily accessible to anyone in the firm, taking into consideration that users may be located anywhere in the world.” Therefore, I propose that a media choice high in both retainability and reach enhances its positive effect on OM:

**Proposition 3: OM in disperse organizational arrangements will be enhanced when knowledge is transferred through a medium that is high in both retainability and reach.**

Smith (2000: 314) discussed the explicit knowledge attributes as being "'know-what' that is described in formal language, print or electronic media, often based on established work processes, use people-to-document approach". Explicit knowledge is stored in different forms, such as documents, norms, routines, processes, and so on, and can be extracted at any time. In this case, social interaction is not essential for sharing explicit knowledge, but the ability to hold and maintain knowledge, which is related to the retainability dimension. When using a media
that is both high in retainability and high in reach, organizations can benefit from spreading knowledge across their boundaries by using many repositories which in turn can handle a large volume of code, norms, routines, procedures, and so on. Knowledge can be easily retrieved to support daily tasks, often used to perform a specific activity, or accomplish a certain goal. Thus, I propose that:

Proposition 4: The positive effect of a medium that is high in both retainability and reach on OM will be enhanced when the knowledge transferred is extensive and explicit.

For media low in retainability and reach dimensions, I understand that individual memory is promoted. Imagine the use of chats. In general, it creates a scenario in which only a few actors interact, and provides limited access to memory repositories, except for individual memory. As the level of retainability increases, the volume of knowledge stored rises, but the reach remains restricted to a limited group of people, thus encouraging group memory. The use of email is an example that can hold many attachments but not necessarily is sent to a large group of people. If the organization assumes that the level of retainability remains low but the reach of the media grows, many people can be reached but with limited memory accessibility, which would incite the creation of at least group memory.

For visual clarity, Figure 1 depicts the four propositions detailed above for media choice in dispersed organizational arrangement considering knowledge attributes.

**Figure 1: Proposed Model for Media Choice in Disperse Organizational Arrangements.**

**DISCUSSION**

The main objective of this paper is to develop a better understanding of which media fits better the need to promote OM in organizations geographically dispersed. I proposed the analysis of four dimensions (synchronicity, reach, capacity, and retainability) to support the media choice decision to be used by disperse organizations to enable effective communication and consequently the promotion of OM. From the analysis of combinations of the dimensions, 2 pairs emerged significantly: (1) synchronicity and capacity, and (2) reach and retainability. Synchronicity and capacity dyad demonstrated to be best employed for extensive and tacit
knowledge and I suggest the use of live video conferences as the most optimal media, especially in framing and solving complex problems. Reach and Retainability dyad demonstrated to be best employed for extensive and explicit knowledge and I suggest the use of live social media, intranet, and website as the most optimal medium, relating to extracting memory to support daily tasks. The four dimensions proposed play an important role in the media choice adopted by organizations, interconnecting all actors, and enabling the link between the past and current situations.

This paper contributes to the management literature discussing OM and media choice attributes, with propositions to be tested empirically. Also, it contributes to the information system literature, emphasizing technological advances and up-to-date communication channels. As practical implications, the paper supports managers to identify and decide on the optimal media choice to nurture OM and the use of past experience, encouraging knowledge sharing, re-use of knowledge, and a positive return on the knowledge acquired. It not only reveals the importance to retrieve memories to interpret current situations but also balancing the use of the acquired knowledge (exploitation) and the search for new ones (exploration) to obtain positive organizational outcomes.

I envision that the current COVID-19 pandemic, which has forced the world’s workforce to rely on technology to continue to operate remotely, is setting the stage for a massive change in organizational arrangements. As stated by Jack Dorsey (2020), Twitter CEO, the entire Twitter workforce can work from home forever, if they decide not to go back to the office and to the traditional format. This signals that flexible work arrangements will become a new normal and could lead to other work changes. In addition, the pandemic has impacted the work environment by forcing organizations to adjust their operation through layoffs and downsizing, which put the OM at risk with the loss of talent and, consequently, their individual memories. The negative consequences to business can come in the form of loss of competitiveness, competence, creativity, and performance. Future research should explore how organizations may keep their memory in such turbulent situations, and how organizations learn and store experiences under pressure.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING IS THE NEXT BIG THING IN MANAGEMENT EDUCATION

STEPHANIE DYGICO GAPUD
Division of Business, Spring Hill College
Mobile, Alabama

CHRISTIAN ACOSTA-FLAMMA
TELANTO, Global Academic Business Network
Barcelona, Spain

Abstract: Experiential learning should be beyond analyzing well-written case studies to hone the capabilities of our future managers. We will present how to bring industry collaborations inside the classroom. We will share the experience of the Spring Hill College, Division of Business students as they solved challenges posted by the industry collaborators, sourced through Telanto. Moreover, we will explain the importance of experiential learning in imparting real-world experience to the future business leaders at SHC. We argue that the academe’s understanding of the high levels of engagement in the workplace through meaningfulness of work should translate to the way we engage our students in the halls of higher education.

INTRODUCTION

“Education is not the learning of facts, but the training of minds to think.”
“Education is what remains after one has forgotten what one has learned in school.”
Albert Einstein

The next decade of education will be big on experiential learning (Cantor, 1995; Kolb & Kolb, 2017). Textbooks for management courses present opportunities and suggestions for engaging students in experiential learning. Traditionally students in management courses analyze cases presented to them in class. Some of these suggested activities encourage the conduct of research activities that simulate the needs of the industry. We argue that schools of business across the globe should limit the “mute and academic” exercises that we give our students. Future knowledge workers should be honed to make decisions and analyze workplace challenges not just through textbook business cases but through real-world problems faced by the industry (Kolb & Kolb, 2017). Furthermore, we posit that real experiential learning incorporates the concept of meaningful work (Bailey et al., 2019) in the way we teach. Traditionally, this kind of experiential learning can be achieved through industry internships. However, Covid-19 made it hard to do international business internships. Furthermore, Globalization 3.0 is upon us; therefore, the internet of everything can make the world smaller by bringing industry challenges to the academe.

Experiential Learning and Meaningfulness of Work

Bringing industry challenges to the classroom helps the student see the meaningfulness of the concepts read from the textbook because they can apply them to the challenge at hand. Moreover, the feedback of the industry representative enhances the sense of pride in the accomplishment. It most probably increases students’ self-efficacy in solving problems and working in teams. The learning experience of working in groups as the students tackle the industry challenges provides confidence to engage in the real work environment. It is interesting to note that the final student output will definitely be original and not lifted from the homework
help websites because the “case” or the challenge from the industry is unique and has not been solved elsewhere.

If we, the academicians, are genuinely preparing the students to be workplace ready, then this experiential learning through Telanto bridges the gap between the academe and the industry expectations. Moreover, in this process, the faculty can have a glimpse of what is about to go in the market because the challenges from the industry are technologies and industry aspirations that are yet to hit the market or decisions that the industry partners are still pondering to make. However, bringing an internship in the classroom is not for all. The professor must have the foresight, design a very flexible curriculum, and put into practice the skills and mindset in managing an innovative organization. The management professor must interweave the reflective, analytical, global (worldly), collaborative, and action mindset (Gosling & Mintzberg, 2003).

**Experiential Learning in Class Increases Inclusion in Education**

Like any Jesuit business school, Spring Hill College envisions shaping righteous and purpose-driven business leaders. Providing study abroad opportunities and making international internships available through its Italy campus is one of the college’s bragging rights. However, that is not an inclusive educational opportunity because not every family can afford to send their students abroad. Spring Hill was the first and only integrated college in the Deep South. It earned the respect of Dr. Martin Luther King Jr., who mentioned the moral significance of Spring Hill’s initiatives in his 1963 “Letter from a Birmingham Jail.” Having the industry internship in the classroom democratizes education because when the industry experience is brought to the classroom, it ensures inclusive and equitable education. When the internship is brought into the classroom, students develop relevant industry skills and competencies through practice-oriented and action learning methodology that is equally accessible to all. The affordability of international travel to gain global experience has become a non-issue.

**Experiential learning and Employability**

Time and again, we hear employers across industries saying that academic qualifications alone do not generate employees ready for the workplace. There is a need for educational solutions to balance theoretical and practical learning more than ever. Employability is a key concept in higher education. The graduate employment rate is often used to assess the quality of university provision, despite the fact that employability and employment are two different concepts. Employability as a measure of student success has recently become a topic of discussion in the United States (Arum & Roksa, 2011). Learning for the sake of learning does not guarantee the sort of occupational success it once may have. Instead, students need to garner skills, knowledge, and abilities while in college to prepare them for gainful employment after graduation.

A focus on employability is a pragmatic response to review experiential learning as a concept embedded in educational practice. In other words, the role of experiential learning goes well beyond ensuring that students are knowledgeable in an academic discipline to ensure that they are prepared for the labor market. In the classic work of Newman (1852, p. ix), the university is described as a place of teaching universal knowledge. Oakshott (2017; p.9) depicts a university as “a home of learning, a place where a tradition of learning is preserved and extended and where the necessary apparatus for the pursuit of learning has been gathered together.” There are intrinsic and subjective motivations for going to university apart from its potential economic advantage to the graduate. However, with globalization, internationalization, and a dramatic rise in for-profit institutions, the role of higher education has been redefined. Universities are expected to prepare the students for a complex society that demands employees have diverse skills and capacities (Chen, 2016). In this day and age, employability has become the core essence of higher education.

**What is employability?**
Existing definitions of employability can be categorized into three main groups. The first group emphasizes the capabilities of individuals (De Vos et al., 2011). These definitions resonate with the idea that an individual’s employability depends upon personal assets or intrinsic characteristics. While Hillage and Pollard (1998) refer to it as capability, Yorke (2006) term it as a set of achievements – skills, understanding, and personal attributes, and for De Vos et al. (2011), these are capabilities and willingness. These definitions emphasize the absolute dimensions of employability, which relate to whether individuals possess the appropriate qualifications, skills, and attitudes that employers need (Morrison 2012).

**Experiential Learning via Telanto**

Telanto is a European startup that enables collaborations between business and academia. It offers access to a structured collaboration process and a custom-made platform that hosts the industry-academe collaboration. Telanto also provides a coaching service that supports company representatives in formulating the challenges and professors in integrating them into their curricula. At the end of the collaboration, students are rigorously assessed by both sides on skills demonstrated and the quality of their solutions. Through our partnership with Telanto, students work in teams, communicate with the decision-makers from the industry, research relevant information, and present solutions. Industry representatives answer the students’ questions to guide them in finding solutions to the challenge. The professor mentors the “junior industry consultants.” Students receive a certificate of internship at the end of the course. Bringing industry internships inside the classroom is the new way to tap and hone the future knowledge workers; it is “big yet Telanto.com makes it easy.”

**DELIVERY OF CONCEPTS**

We will present faculty and students’ testimonies on how industry challenges influenced their course engagement. This is a joint faculty, student, and industry representative presentation. This presentation will introduce challenge-based collaboration as an experiential learning methodology and Telanto - a global leader enabling university-industry collaborations. We will present the experience of Spring Hill College in integrating three challenges from international companies into the curriculum of the International Business module. The faculty and students will testify how working with the industry challenges influenced their course engagement. We will also present the company representatives’ feedback on their contribution to business students. Thus, the presentation will demonstrate the shared value created for all three stakeholder groups (professors, company representatives, and students) through university-industry collaboration.

**REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR**
ETHICAL DECISION MAKING: A CULTURE INFLUENCED VIRTUE SPECIFIC MODEL FOR MULTINATIONAL CORPORATIONS

ANDREW I. ELLESTAD
College of Business
George Fox University
Newberg, Oregon

Abstract: This paper theorizes a new approach to ethical decision making research for multinational corporations with the inclusion of moral virtues that are mediated by national culture. This rationalist model builds off of the existing work by Trevino’s Person-Situated Interactionist Model. Hofstede’s work on individual national culture characteristics is used to move the conversation forward by explaining the relationships between individual moderators in Trevino’s model and the effect of national culture on them. It concludes with implications of this theory for ethical decision making models for multinational organizations.

INTRODUCTION

Friedman and Wyman (2005) coined the term, “The World is Flat”, back in 2005. Their concept spurred the idea that the global playing field of commerce had been leveled thanks to technological advances and national trade agreements. Today’s society has eclipsed that concept and moved to be interconnected globally in real time. The need for understanding ethical implications for strategic decisions for organizations has never been greater.

This paper theorizes that the inclusion of culture as a force impacts all decision making both on the organizational and individual level. Norms vary from culture to culture and multinational corporations are required to navigate the waters of each territory in which they operate (Donaldson & Dunfee, 1994). This paper also proposes the inclusion of moral virtues, using the examples of integrity and honesty. It also considers the role of national culture as a mediator upon individual factors within a proposed model. Few frameworks exist that explicitly consider the role of national culture within ethical decision making. There is very limited research that have the explicit inclusion of moral virtues (Jackson, 2004).

Trevino (1986) offers a widely cited theory for ethical decision making that can serve as a basis for discussion. This paper will use Trevino’s Person-Situated Interactionist Model and look to enhance it to better identify with the functions of a multinational corporation so that they can make the best possible decision for the dilemma presented. This paper looks to fill the gap in the current literature on culture, virtues, and ethical decision making as it relates to multinational corporations.

REVIEW OF ETHICAL DECISION MAKING LITERATURE

Since the 1970’s, process models and frameworks for ethical decision making have been a constant discussion in the field of business ethics (Ferrell & Gresham, 1985; Jones, 1991; Sonenshein, 2007). The literature has spanned the fields of moral philosophy, moral psychology, social psychology, organizational behavior, business ethics and more (Schwartz, 2016). Of the most widely discussed models (Trevino, 1986; Hunt & Vitell, 1986; Jones, 1991; Schwartz, 2016), most take their cues from Rest’s four-part model either implicitly or explicitly (1986). His rationalist model is comprised of Awareness, Judgement, Intent, and Behavior.

Trevino’s model for Person-Situated Interactionist model (1986) puts heavy emphasis on the individual themselves. A key part to the model is Kohlberg’s model of cognitive moral
development (1969). This six-stage model represents an individual’s cognitive development from adolescence to adulthood.

Trevino’s model goes on to emphasize that both individual and situational factors influence an individual’s decision-making process. Individual factors of self-reliance, called Ego Strength, level of independence, called Field Dependence, and degree of situational control, called Locus of Control, combine together in one opposing force. Conversely, Trevino points to situational factors that are comprised of organizational culture, authoritative and influential figures, and the individual’s role as competing factors. After the individual processes the issue with the consideration of individual and organizational factors, they engage in the behavior.

Gaps in the literature exist around the inclusion of specific moral virtues within ethical decision-making models. The role of culture is also absent in most process models. Organizational culture is regularly included but cultural frameworks like Hofstede’s (1984) and Donaldson and Dunfee’s (1994) have not been included in the models. Additionally, feedback mechanisms are often left out of ethical decision-making models (Trevino, 1986; Jones, 1991; Sonenshein, 2007). With these gaps in mind, this paper looks to resolve those concerns by proposing a new model for ethical decision-making.

**CULTURE INFLUENCED MORAL VALUES IN ETHICAL DECISION MAKING**

The implications of poor ethical decision-making have been made clear throughout the last century. Corporations have made what turned out to be the wrong decision and paid dearly for it (Meredith, 2018). Trevino’s Person-Situated Interactionist Model is one of the most widely cited amongst the literature (1986). Trevino’s model brought an entirely new perspective to ethical decision-making by homing in on the cognitive level of the individual. The cognitive level of the individual is key to the decision-making process because it determines the level of understanding.

**Integrity and Honesty as Moral Virtues**

This paper proposes that process models are more useful to individuals and practitioners with the inclusion of the specific moral virtues, like integrity and honesty. Integrity is defined as having strong moral values that you refuse to waiver on. Those who have high integrity are trustworthy and incorruptible. Honesty is defined as a strict adherence to the facts with a high commitment to fairness. Honesty implies a refusal to be deceptive, lie, cheat, or steal even in the midst of the opportunity to do so (Ashton et al., 2014).

Adding virtues to the individual moderators in Trevino’s model addresses the moral component that the Person-Situated Interactionist Model is lacking. While ego strength, field dependence, and locus of control are representative personality traits, they do not address the specific moral nature of the individual. It also gives a more complete look at the specific forces weighing on the individual. In adding moral virtues into the equation, they work to offset pressures put on by the organizational factors presented.

**Role of Integrity**

While honesty is a more generally accepted concept, integrity has been debated and defined multiple times throughout the literature. Trevino-Rodriguez (2007) defines integrity as a three-part issue comprised of moral integrity, personal integrity, and organizational integrity. According to Kolb (1998), integrity is not living by a principle, but choosing the principles by which one likes to live. Multinational organizations will need to traverse these issues carefully. In consultation with Hofstede’s model, decisions on principles will need to incorporate the country in which the issue occurs. Simply accepting the home nation’s principles would not be sufficient within a multinational environment. It may well be that outcomes of similar ethical
issues within the same multinational organization are different based on the geographic location in which they occur.

A key for multinational organizations is to have radical transparency in their principles. Simply having principles as an organization is not enough. Organizations need to be radically transparent and authentic when it comes to the principles they hold. When an ethical dilemma does arise, it will be clear to all stakeholders how their aforementioned principles will impact their decision making.

Role of Honesty

In most cultures, honesty is synonymous with truth and does not need to be further explained. However, when it comes to moral philosophy, additional explanation is required. While telling a lie is certainly considered dishonest, concealing information or selectively disclosing information, dependent on situation, may not be. In the medical field, HIPAA prevents the unauthorized sharing of confidential patient information. Clergy, attorneys, and counselors often withhold information they deem privileged or confidential to a case. In terms of research ethics, intentionally leaving out information or failing to disclose pertinent information would be considered being dishonest.

Recent research into honesty in modern psychology has highlighted its importance as a key personality trait (Ashton et al., 2014). What was once known as the Big Five, was later expanded to be the HEXACO model. Ashton et al.’s research into honesty breaks it out into four facets: Sincerity, Fairness, Greed Avoidance, and Modesty.

Honesty also has a communal element as well. Heintz et al., (2016) states that honesty’s role is determined by the social norms and how one interacts within them. Honest choices by their definition are those that do not deprive any other individual from a natural benefit. The implication is that there always exists an opportunity cost when considering to be honest.

Individuals with a high level of integrity choose their principles carefully and they are resolute in nature. A person of high honesty is clear, transparent, and forthcoming with all pertinent details. When you combine both characteristics in one individual, it is apparent that such an individual will stand firm against oppositional pressure regardless of their stature within the organization.

Proposition 1: Individuals within multinational corporations with high integrity and high honesty will be more likely to resist pressure from authority to make an unethical decision.

Culture as an Impactful Force

Originating from the field of anthropology, the concept of culture has been studied for decades. Hofstede (2001) defines culture as the collective programming of the mind that distinguishes members of one group from another. Multinational corporations require a need for cultural understanding more than any other organizational type. Many theorists, from Donaldson and Dunfee (1994) to House et al., (2004) to Hofstede (1984), have produced research that demonstrate this. One of the most widely referenced frameworks in literature for culture as it relates to the organization is Hofstede’s Cultural Framework (1984). Hofstede’s framework consists of four dimensions: Power Distance, Individualism versus Collectivism, Uncertainty Avoidance, and Masculinity versus Femininity.

Organizations reflect power distance within their structure. Hierarchical organizations that have many layers of management would be considered a high power distance organization. A flat organization with little to no layers of management would be considered a low power distance organization. Within the context of a low power distance society, power is shared and a strong emphasis is placed on equality among all. As Trevinyo-Rodriguez (2007) describes,
integrity is an action or a verb. It is lived out communally for all to see. Given both are true, it is proposed that someone in a low power distance society with high levels of integrity would be more thoughtful and considerate of others when making a decision.

Additionally, for individuals in a high power distance society, they accept that power is distributed unequally. They feel inadequate and helpless to take on the larger forces within their society. When you combine that feeling of helplessness with an individual of low integrity that does not have principles to live by, it is proposed that they would carry out a decision even if they perceive it to be unethical or wrong.

Proposition 2a: Individuals in societies with low power distance and high levels of integrity would be more prone to consider alternate views before making a decision.

Proposition 2b: Individuals in societies with high power distance and low integrity would be more prone to obeying authority even if they perceive it is the wrong decision.

The second dimension in Hofstede’s framework is individualism versus collectivism. Individualism focuses on the individual as it relates to the group, whereas collectivism refers to the degree in which society focuses on the relationship of the group as a whole (O, 2019). Individualism drives self-interest and internal motivation for one’s own gain while collectivism puts a commitment to the group ahead of one’s personal interest.

Within Trevino’s model, it looks to the role of social referents to guide behavior. Trevino calls this field dependence. Having external guideposts can give a person clarity as they work their way through an ambiguous decision making process. For those that are labeled as field independent, this is not required. Those individuals function autonomously at a high level. For an individual who exists in a highly individualistic culture with field independence, it is theorized that they would work to resolve any unethical issues by themselves rather than communally.

Proposition 3: Individuals with field independence and in high individualistic cultures would be more likely to independently resolve the ethical situation rather than include others in their peer group.

The third dimension measures a societies tolerance for risk and uncertainty. Those in high uncertainty avoidance societies look for security and assurance. Conversely, those in low uncertainty avoidance societies are comfortable with change and unpredictability. On an individual level, locus of control, measures the amount of control an individual exerts over their life. For those externally oriented, they perceive that any outcome is beyond their control. For those internally oriented, they perceive that their actions are a direct line to the results they see. If one perceives their actions dictate a potential outcome and require a high degree of certainty when making a decision, it is proposed that this individual will be more likely to pick an outcome with a clear answer rather than a solution with a potential unknown.

Proposition 4: Individuals with high uncertainty avoidance and internal locus of control will be more likely to select an outcome with a clear answer rather than a solution with potential unknowns.

The final dimension to Hofstede’s model is the roles of masculinity and femininity. This looks at the values the individual places on their lifestyle. In high masculinity environments, they tend to be more competitive within the organization. But according to Hofstede, in high femininity environments, the individual tends to be more satisfied with their pay and working conditions without the felt need for advancement. Therefore, it is proposed that when an
individual operates out of a high masculinity culture and has few to no principles, their activities only look to support their own interests.

Proposition 5: Individuals in high masculinity societies with low integrity and low honesty are more likely to act in their own self-interest.

A Culture Influenced Virtue Specific Model
This paper theorizes that Trevino’s Person-Situation Interactionist Model (1986) would be better served with the inclusion of the specific moral virtues like Integrity and Honesty, as well as the inclusion of national culture and a feedback mechanism (Figure 1). Trevino does include organizational culture within the model under situational moderators but that is only one side of the equation. The model fails to consider the impact of society on the individual themselves.

First, this model adds to the list of individual moderators with moral virtues. This solves one of the most common problems with ethical decision making models. They are almost always void of specific virtues. In lieu of guidance, the individual or practitioner is required to fill in their own virtues upon the model (Jackson, 2004). Culture is a prevailing force upon individual characteristics, personality and decision making. An individual’s ego strength quotient is highly impacted by the role of individualism or collectivism within the individual’s society. An individual’s locus of control is shaped by the society’s level of uncertainty avoidance. Both integrity and honesty are shaped by power distance, individualism, uncertainty avoidance, and masculinity.

Figure 1. New Proposed Culture Influenced Virtue Specific Model

Organizational and individual learning grows through experience. Ethical issues are not once-in-a-generation events. Learning from the outcomes of past ethical issues is paramount for both the individual and the organization in order to survive future ethical dilemmas. Ferrell and Gresham (1985) call this the evaluation of behavior, Schwartz (2016) refers to this as a feedback loop, and Hunt and Vitell (1986) refer to this as natural consequences. Learning from the result of behavior informs each stage of the process model. Once we have experienced an ethical dilemma, we can recognize a future similar issue much quicker. Decision making is impacted as the individual weighs the prior outcome (consequence) along with all other relative possibilities. Given this, it is proposed that a feedback mechanism within an ethical decision making model will lead to a greater level of virtue over time.
Proposition 6: A feedback mechanism within an ethical decision making model leads to a greater level of virtue for the individual and organization over time.

A multinational organization faces unique challenges as they look to navigate ethical decision making. The cultural impacts that face the organization vary by region. Individuals within an organization are impacted by the social norms in which they live and work in. As demonstrated, these norms not only affect the situational moderators, but they also affect the organizational moderators as well. It is incumbent on each organization to recognize the forces of culture as they impact internal and external factors, define the social influenced principles that each country assumes, and use them to conduct their business in a culturally sensitive manner. The inclusion of these new elements in the model serves as a counterweight to balance out unrealized effects on the ethical decision making process. Recognizing the impact of culture by region as it affects individual moderators of Locus of Control (Uncertainty Avoidance), Ego Strength (Individualism & Masculinity), Field Dependence (Collectivism), along with the social influenced principles set by integrity and honesty, a firm can counter correct the outside influence to make the best possible decision based on region (Trevino, 1986; Hofstede, 1984).

Implications
If empirical testing finds this model and propositions to be valid, this model could be used for analyzing ethical decision making within multinational corporations. What has been proposed is the inclusion of moral virtues within the traditional process model framework. This gives individuals that hold on to moral virtues a way to integrate them into their daily decision making process to weigh them equally with additional moderators. The key to this model is recognition of the moderators and mediators that impact ethical decision making. When an individual or organization fully understands the impact of each force on the decision making process, they can counter those effects with decision making if they so choose.

The inclusion of a feedback mechanism is a critical tool for managers to use. Given the interconnected nature of our world today, managers do not need to rely on just learning from their own experiences. Learning from the experiences and decisions of competitors and others in the market is equally as valuable. Feedback mechanisms can be used universally for decision making on both the individual and organizational levels.

CONCLUSION
This paper offers a limited assessment to the use and applicability of ethical decision making models for a multinational corporation. The greatest possible outcome for a multinational corporation is that they can understand the individual factors that impact the decision making process in any way so they can look to course correct that influence and make the best possible decision for all parties involved. This paper argues that the inclusion of honesty and integrity as specific moral traits should be required for any deliberation of an ethical dilemma. Ethical models without the inclusion of specific values requires individual practitioners to fill in the gaps and supplement with their own beliefs. By recognizing the role of culture, virtues, and internal and external moderators, the multinational corporation will have a stronger holistic view for ethical decision making.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR
INTRODUCTION

Despite their importance to the economy and communities, small businesses are “financially fragile”, having a higher rate of failure than other businesses (Bartik, et al., 2020, p. 3). While the failure of the small business does not prove fatal as one or two collapses, the continued and pervasive failure of a source of employment for 8.4 million people between 2000 and 2017, can prove fatal to the United States economy (US Small Business Administration, 2018). An organization’s business model serves as both the foundation and the road map for growth and direction, articulating the logic and providing the “data and other evidence that demonstrates how a business creates and delivers value to customers” (Teece, 2010, p. 173). As internal or external changes occur to an organization, businesses, and business owners experience VUCA events or a VUCA environment – volatility, uncertainty, complexity, and ambiguity (Schoemaker, Heaton, and Teece, 2018). Instances of VUCA can range from internal corporate upheavals to external market volatility to extreme instances like a financial crisis (ex. 2008 recession), natural disasters (ex. Hurricane Katrina), and global health pandemics (ex. COVID-19). All businesses are faced with VUCA events or weather a VUCA environment, however, those with a strategic business model and access to financial resources will prevail. The duality of an ambidextrous business model coupled with optimal financial resource availability allows a small business owner to successfully navigate VUCA particularly by exploiting existing capabilities within their organization to react to market changes while still meeting customer needs. Successfully employing the strategies included in this developmental paper should diminish the fatality rate of small businesses in the United States, supporting stability in the U.S. economy.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Business Models & Business Model Innovation

An organization’s business model is not only a foundation for the business, it provides a road map for the growth and direction of the business (Teece, 2010). Teece, Doz, Zott, and others emphasize the significance of the business model and its relationship to organizational performance (Zott et al., 2011). A great deal of discussion focuses on the importance of business model innovation while not examining specific business models.

Business model innovation is the concept of reengineering the business model as a source of competitive advantage (Teece, 2010). Teece (2010) discusses its significance in a changing environment without a specific focus on a particular business model in response to a VUCA event as a means of increasing the rate of business survival. Business model innovation is widely used in the literature with a focus on strategies to modify the business model yet never specifically designating a business model. During a VUCA event, a small business owner must ensure they continue delivering value to customers amid tumultuous internal or external conditions. Continued communication with stakeholders, adjustments to operations, along with strategically supporting the business and its survival during and after a VUCA environment, as
interpreted from the roles discussed by Spieth and colleagues (2014), aligns with the duality of an ambidextrous business model.

**Ambidextrous Business Model**

Business models are situational and iterative and developed from the needs of the customer and gaps in how an organization’s competitors address those needs (Teece, 2010). Numerous types of business models exist including multiple e-business models, media business models, industry models, revenue models, and enterprise models, among others with each responding to how business is conducted (Zott et al., 2011). An ambidextrous business model centers on “developing exploration and exploitation activities simultaneously” (Pertusa-Ortega & Molina-Azorin, 2018, p. 84). Exploration or explorative strategies of an ambidextrous business model proactively seek new knowledge and opportunities to bring additional value to customers (Kauppila, 2018; Randhawa, Wilden & Gudergan, 2020). Exploitative strategies react to market changes while developing existing business knowledge and competencies to meet customer needs (Kauppila, 2018; Randhawa et al., 2020). Existing literature discusses the sensing, seizing, and reconfiguring of both exploitative and explorative strategies of an ambidextrous business model (Randhawa et al., 2020).

**Exploitative and Explorative**

Exploitative strategies of an ambidextrous business model address cost, operational efficiency, and incremental innovation (Santos & Alves, 2017). Exploitative sensing, seizing, and reconfiguring emphasizes learning existing aspects of customer needs and competitor offerings, strategic investment in existing markets and value creation, and responsive or iterative approaches to designing and delivering products and services for customers (Randhawa et al., 2020). Constructs of exploitation include “improve existing product quality”, “improve production flexibility”, “reduce production cost”, “improve yield or reduce material consumption” (Pertusa-Ortega & Molina-Azorin, 2018, p. 84).

Explorative strategies depart from the day-to-day operations of a business, requiring businesses to seek outside-of-the-box solutions in anticipation of the changing needs of the customer by learning new information and creating new products or services (Pertusa-Ortega & Molina-Azorin, 2018). Explorative sensing, seizing and reconfiguring emphasizes seeking and identifying new opportunities, continual learning to anticipate market, industry, and competitor changes and trends, investing in new markets, technologies, and strategies, along with a willingness to experiment, in addition to reconfiguring assets, relationships, the organizational structure and even the market itself (Randhawa et al., 2020). Constructs of exploration include “introduce [a] new generation of products”, “extend product range”, “open up new markets” and “enter new technology fields” (Pertusa-Ortega & Molina-Azorin, 2018, p. 84).

While the duality of the ambidextrous business model supports the existing business while pursuing new opportunities, in a VUCA environment the ability to emphasize and adjust the existing business to continually create value for customers while adjusting to volatile, uncertain, complex, or ambiguous changes internal or external to the organization is pivotal. Confirming a greater significance of the exploitative compared to the explorative strategies of an ambidextrous business model in a VUCA environment is another aim of this developmental paper. The constructs of exploration and exploitation provided by Pertusa-Ortega and Molina-Azorin (2018) along with the frameworks provided by O’Reilly and Tushman (2004), Birkinshaw and Gupta (2013), and Kauppila (2018) will be adapted to measure the ambidextrous business model and attributes of explorative and exploitative strategies. Adapting an ambidextrous business model alone could be of little significance if small businesses lack sufficient access to optimal financial resources to weather a VUCA event.
Financial
Small businesses considered to be “median” in size are particularly fragile “[having] expenses [of] over $10,000 per month” and average cash on hand only lasting approximately two weeks (Bartik et al., 2020, p. 3). Other small businesses have less than three months of expenses available via their financial resources (Bartik et al., 2020). In April of 2020 study participants anticipated the VUCA event, COVID-19, would resolve by mid-June, (Bartik et al., 2020). When asked about the ability to reopen their businesses in mid-June, 72% of small businesses surveyed responded positively, with the number dropping to 47% if reopening stalled until December (Bartik et al., 2020). Bartik and colleagues’ data underpins the inability of small businesses to have the financial resources available to survive a VUCA environment. Not only will small businesses require financial resources to improve their rate of business survival, but the type of financial resource will moderate the relationship between the financial resource and the business survival rate.

A study by McDonald and colleagues (2014) identified types of financial resources to include informal insurance described as household savings, family assets or family borrowing, insurance money as received from insurance indemnity policies, and SBA Loans administered by the Small Business Administration (McDonald et al., 2014). During COVID-19 governments worldwide created short-term financial aid measures which include reductions of loan interest rates and improved loan availability in addition to other policy measures (Kuckertz et al., 2020). The SBA provided over $150 billion in relief as part of the Economic Injury Disaster Loan Program, while other organizations and foundations like Magic Johnson Enterprises committed $100 million in aid to those excluded from the CARES Act Paycheck Protection Program (PPP), with still others such as Google providing relief specifically to black-owned businesses (Fairlie, 2020). Declines in alternative financial resources – Venture Capital deals, angel investors, incubators, crowdfunding, and other platforms – seen during COVID-19 limit another avenue of potential financing for a small business owner to increase their rate of survival in a VUCA environment (Brown & Rocha, 2020). For this developmental paper, types of financial resources are identified as optimal are low interest, no interest, or flexible repayment financial instruments, and suboptimal are high interest, inflexible repayment financial instruments, or financial terms which create inequities in their repayment by small business owners (ex. usury).

Proposed Methods: Resources & Frameworks
A quantitative approach using archival data and questionnaires is planned for this study. Chetty and colleagues’ (2020) study describes a free platform that tracks macroeconomic information from numerous small businesses broken out by industry and region which could provide archival data to be evaluated (Chetty et al., 2020). Balla-Elliott et al. (2020) used the Alignable Survey of Small Business Owners which “provides a snapshot of small business behavior and expectations during the unprecedented COVID-19 crisis”, another source of archival data as well as a tool by which a questionnaire could be deployed to a segment of small business owners (p. 31). Aspects of the small business disaster recovery framework (SBDRF) will be adapted to create survey items after sufficient reliability and validity testing are performed. It will be important to ensure items closely correlate to financial resource availability, both optimal and suboptimal financial resources, to measure the effect on the business survival rate. While the SBDRF framework acknowledges many factors on the “recovery continuum”, this developmental paper will specifically look at the access to financial resources, both optimal and suboptimal, for businesses classified as recovered, resilient, or survived in addition to any businesses that face mortality during this developmental paper to evaluate the relationship to the business survival rate (Marshall & Schrank, 2014, p. 613).

HYPOTHESES
This developmental study builds on the existing literature examining the relationship between an ambidextrous business model, financial resources, and aspects of business survival with additional measures being taken into consideration. The hypotheses put forth in this developmental study are as follows:

**Hypothesis 1:** In a VUCA environment, the use of an ambidextrous business model positively influences the rate of business survival for small business owners.

**Hypothesis 2:** In a VUCA environment, emphasis on the exploitative strategies of an ambidextrous business model positively influences the rate of business survival for small businesses to a greater extent than an emphasis on explorative strategies.

**Hypothesis 3:** In a VUCA environment, the type of financial resources available to small business owners moderates the relationship such that the availability of optimal financial resources positively influences the rate of business survival to a greater extent than suboptimal resources.

**Hypothesis 4:** In a VUCA environment, the availability of financial resources combined with the use of an ambidextrous business model positively influences the rate of business survival for small business owners.

**CONCLUSION**

Despite the number of small businesses, the size of their workforce, and their impact on the US economy, small businesses experience failure at a higher rate than other types of businesses. The same VUCA conditions and events affect both small businesses and larger enterprises, yet, small businesses have substantially fewer financial resources at their disposal and often a smaller team, if not just an individual, to explore the strategies most beneficial for their business model. COVID-19 is just the most recent example of how volatility, uncertainty, complexity, and ambiguity can change the world and all of its occupants and their businesses. The inability to exploit existing knowledge and resources, and react to a changing environment, while still meeting customer needs, places small businesses at risk of becoming a casualty during and after a VUCA event or in a VUCA environment. Small business owners who can enact strategies of an ambidextrous business model while still delivering value to their customers will increase their rate of survival. Employing strategies of an ambidextrous business model in addition to access to optimal financial resources, as identified in this developmental paper, is crucial for small business owners facing a VUCA environment.

**REFERENCES AVAILABLE FROM FIRST AUTHOR**